

BEFORE THE
NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD

In the Matter of:

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY,

Employer,

And

GRADUATE WORKERS OF COLUMBIA
GWC, UAW,

Petitioner.

Case No. 02-RC-143012

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing pursuant to Notice, before AUDREY EVEILLARD, Hearing Officer, at The National Labor Relations Board, Region Two, 26 Federal Plaza, Suite 3614, New York, New York, on Wednesday, April 22, 2015, at 9:30 a.m.

BURKE COURT REPORTING, LLC
1044 Route 23 North, Suite 206
Wayne, New Jersey 07470
(973) 692-0660

A P P E A R A N C E S

1 On behalf of the Employer:

2

3 EDWARD A BRILL, ESQ.
4 MATTHEW D. BATASTINI, ESQ.
5 BERNARD M. PLUM, ESQ.
6 Proskauer Rose LLP
7 11 Times Square, 20th Fl.
8 New York, NY 10036-8299
9 212-969-3015

10

11 PATRICIA S. CATAPANO, ESQ.
12 Associate General Counsel
13 Office of The General Counsel
14 Columbia University
15 650 West 168th Street, Suite 239
16 New York, NY 10032

17

18 On Behalf of the Petitioner:

19

20 THOMAS W. MEIKLEJOHN, ESQ.
21 NICOLE M. ROTHGEB, ESQ.
22 Livingston, Adler, Pulda, Meiklejohn & Kelley, P.C.
23 537 Prospect Ave.
24 Hartford, CT 06105-2922
25 860-570-4639

26

1
2I N D E X

	<u>WITNESS</u>	<u>DIRECT</u>	<u>CROSS</u>	<u>REDIRECT</u>	<u>RECROSS</u>	<u>VOIR DIRE</u>
3						
4	Carlos Alonso	255	--	--	--	260
5						

1		<u>E X H I B I T S</u>	
	<u>EXHIBIT NUMBER</u>	<u>IDENTIFIED</u>	<u>RECEIVED</u>
2	Employer's		
3	E-27	258	259
4	E-28	260	261
5	E-29	262	262
6	E-30	263	264
7	E-31	266	266
8	E-32	273	274
9	E-33	286	287
10	E-34 & 35	288	289
11	E-36 & 37	294	295
12	E-38	294	296
13	E-39	305	305
14	E-40	310	311
15	E-41	322	322
16	E-42 through 45	324	324
17			
18			

1 an interim dean and for the four subsequent years as the
2 official dean.

3 Q Can you tell us briefly your educational history and
4 employment history?

5 A Yes. I received a B.A. in Romance studies from Cornell
6 University and a PhD in Spanish and Portuguese from Yale
7 University. I was appointed assistant professor in the
8 department of Romance Languages at Wesleyan University as my
9 first job. After that I went for eight years to Emory
10 University in Atlanta, subsequently to University of
11 Pennsylvania for five years. And in 2005 I joined the faculty
12 at Columbia.

13 Q And what department are you --

14 A Department of Latin American and Iberian Cultures.

15 Q Do you still hold an appointment in that --

16 A Yes.

17 Q -- department? And do you still teach?

18 A Yes.

19 Q You mentioned that you're the dean of the Graduate School
20 of Arts and Sciences. Is that also known as GSAS?

21 A Yes, it is.

22 Q And can you tell us briefly what is GSAS?

23 A Graduate School of Arts and Sciences is the body that
24 administers -- determines and administers policy for the
25 faculty of the Arts and Sciences -- at Columbia and that awards

1 the doctoral degree in all of the other schools at Columbia
2 that offer the doctoral degree.

3 Q Are there different departments -- educational departments
4 within GSAS?

5 A Yes, there are. There are departments and then there are
6 degrees. The number of degrees is larger than the number of
7 departments, because there are graduate subcommittees that
8 award the doctoral degree. There are 30 doctoral programs in
9 the Arts and Sciences and 28 departments.

10 Q Okay. Now, you said that you award PhD degrees for
11 programs outside of the Arts and Sciences?

12 A Yes.

13 Q And can you explain how that works?

14 A There are professional schools and there are also schools
15 and departments in uptown Biomedical Campus that offer the
16 doctoral degree. And for instance Engineering, Journalism,
17 Nursing, Public health offer the doctoral degree and we are the
18 official awarders for that degree.

19 Q Where is GSAS administratively within the University
20 structure?

21 A GSAS is one of the constitutive parts of the Arts and
22 Sciences -- the faculty of Arts and Sciences, therefore I
23 report to the Executive Vice President of Arts and Sciences.
24 The Arts and Sciences is a composite of the Graduate School of
25 Arts and Sciences, Columbia College School of Continuing

1 Education, School of General Studies and the School of the
2 Arts.

3 Q Are there separate -- is there a separate faculty in the
4 Graduate School of Arts and Sciences?

5 A No. When you're appointed to the faculty of Arts and
6 Sciences you teach both at the college for let's say 200
7 graduate students as well as graduate students.

8 Q And how many faculty members are there then in the Arts
9 and Sciences?

10 A Around 575 or so.

11 Q That would include tenure and tenure track --

12 A Yes.

13 Q -- faculty?

14 MR. BRILL: I'm going to mark as exhibit 27 -- I'm showing
15 you a document that appears to be a print out from the GSAS
16 website headed academic programs.

17 THE WITNESS: Uh-huh.

18 BY MR. BRILL:

19 Q Can you take a look at this and identify it for the
20 record?

21 A This is indeed a list of programs in the Graduate School
22 of Arts and Sciences.

23 (Employer's E-27 identified)

24 MR. BRILL: I offer exhibit 27.

25 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

1 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

2 (Employer's E-27 received in evidence)

3 BY MR. BRILL:

4 Q Looking at exhibit 27, Dean Alonso, there's both M.A.
5 programs and PhD programs. So does that represent the two
6 types of graduate degrees that the GSAS confers?

7 A Yes. The Graduate School supervises and administers the
8 research doctorate and M.A. programs in the University.

9 Q And what are the -- there's a list at the bottom of page
10 three of non-degree programs. Can you tell us what those are?

11 A Those are programs in which students can take course.
12 Typically they will get a certificate of some sort, but they
13 are not programs that receive either the M.A. or the doctoral
14 degree.

15 Q And lastly there's a short list of dual degree programs.

16 A These are programs that combine the curricula of at least
17 two other schools or programs. They're fairly small in number.

18 Q Okay.

19 A The enrollment --

20 MR. BRILL: I'm going to mark as exhibit 28 another print
21 out from the GSAS website headed requirements for the PhD and
22 D.M.A. degrees.

23 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Off the record for one moment.

24 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken)

25 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: On the record.

1 BY MR. BRILL:

2 Q Do you have exhibit 28 in front of you?

3 A Yes, I do.

4 Q And can you identify that?

5 A These -- this is one -- a print out of the website of the
6 Graduate School of Arts and Sciences that describes
7 requirements for the PhD and the Doctorate of Musical Arts
8 degree.

9 (Employer's E-28 identified)

10 Q You didn't mention the Doctorate of Musical Arts before.
11 What is that degree?

12 A The Doctorate of Musical Arts is the equivalent of the PhD
13 that is given to students in the music department, who in lieu
14 of a doctoral thesis produce a composition -- a musical
15 composition. And that amounts to their last exercise -- their
16 last research exercise for the receipt of their degree.

17 Q That's a degree that's offered by GSAS?

18 A Yes.

19 MR. BRILL: I'd offer exhibit 28.

20 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Could I have one voir dire question?

21 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION

22 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

23 Q Does this document contain all of the requirements for
24 obtaining these doctoral degrees?

25 MR. BRILL: I don't think that's really a voir dire

1 question.

2 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: I was actually thinking the
3 same thing too.

4 MR. BRILL: It's cross examination.

5 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: But if you don't know, you
6 don't know or if you know, you know.

7 MR. BRILL: I think the answer is going to be clear when I
8 go on to my next question.

9 THE WITNESS: I believe that this a listing of
10 requirements writ large for the Doctor of Philosophy and Doctor
11 of Musical Arts degree -- degrees, but of course the specific
12 requirements are ones that are determined by the various
13 departments and schools.

14 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Mr. Brill?

15 MR. BRILL: Is the document admitted into evidence?

16 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Oh, I'm sorry. No objection.

17 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

18 (Employer's E-28 received in evidence)

19 MR. BRILL: Let me mark as exhibit 29 another document
20 from the website entitled requirements for the M.Phil degree.

21 CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION

22 BY MR. BRILL:

23 Q Can you identify exhibit 29?

24 A This is a copy of the webpage from the Graduate School of
25 Arts and Sciences website that describes the requirements for

1 the M.Phil degree.

2 (Employer's E-29 identified)

3 Q And what is the M.Phil degree?

4 A Master of Philosophy degree. This is the degree that is
5 received by students when they are admitted to candidacy for
6 the doctoral degree, without which they cannot proceed to the
7 doctoral degree.

8 MR. BRILL: I offer exhibit 29.

9 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

10 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

11 (Employer's E-29 received in evidence)

12 BY MR. BRILL:

13 Q Now, if you go back to exhibit 28, do you have that in
14 front of you?

15 A No.

16 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Exhibit 28?

17 BY MR. BRILL:

18 Q The second sentence under Doctor of Philosophy PhD and
19 Doctor of Musical Arts D.M.A. states "students who wish to earn
20 the PhD degree must have earned the M.Phil degree at Columbia
21 and must prepare, defend and deposit a dissertation in
22 accordance with the regulations of the Graduate School of Arts
23 and Sciences." Do you see that?

24 A Yes.

25 Q So am I correct then that a student who -- that in order

1 to earn a PhD degree you must satisfy the requirements for an
2 M.Phil degree first?

3 A Yes, you're correct.

4 Q And the same paragraph goes on to state "students must
5 also fulfill satisfactorily the requirements of their
6 department or PhD program." Do you see that sentence at the
7 end of the first paragraph?

8 A Yes.

9 Q So are there specific requirements for the PhD degree that
10 may be imposed by individual departments or programs over and
11 above the Graduate School requirements?

12 A Yes. The Graduate School is the essential framework in
13 which students satisfy the requirements of their individual
14 programs set for them, but we also have requirements that serve
15 as milestones in their career.

16 MR. BRILL: Okay. I'm going to mark as exhibit 30 a
17 document also from the GSAS website entitled requirements for
18 the M.A. degree.

19 BY MR. BRILL:

20 Q Can you identify exhibit 30?

21 A This is a photocopy of the webpage from the Graduate
22 School of Arts and Sciences website that speaks about the
23 requirements for the M.A. degree.

24 (Employer's E-30 identified)

25 MR. BRILL: I offer exhibit 30.

1 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

2 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

3 (Employer's GC-30 received in evidence)

4 BY MR. BRILL:

5 Q Dean Alonso, how many PhD students are there in GSAS
6 currently?

7 A There are 1,800 students in GSAS -- doctoral students in
8 GSAS. There are also, in the Morningside Campus, close to
9 1,000 students in the other professional schools such as
10 Engineering, or Journalism or Social Work. And then there are
11 around 580 or so doctoral students in the Biomedical Campus.

12 Q So the total would be about 33, almost 3,400 total
13 doctoral students?

14 A I would -- yes, it's 33 --

15 Q 33 hundred --

16 A -- hundred doctoral students. M.A. students, there are
17 around 1,400 or so.

18 Q Now when you talk about M.A. students you're talking about
19 -- does that include students who earn a doctorate -- who go on
20 to earn a doctoral degree after earning the M.A.?

21 A No. I'm referring to the Masters only degree. In other
22 words, it's a terminal degree for which students are admitted
23 specifically and not the en route M.A., which is a degree that
24 students who are admitted to the doctoral program receive upon
25 completion of the requirements of the M.A. en route to the PhD.

1 Q Turning to your own role as dean, can you tell us briefly
2 what are your responsibilities as Dean of GSAS?

3 A I am the person who executes the policies and procedures
4 of the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences. Those are
5 policies that are set by the Executive Committee of the
6 Graduate School of Arts and Sciences.

7 Q And what is the Executive Committee of the Graduate School
8 of Arts and Sciences?

9 A The Executive Committee of the Graduate School of Arts and
10 Sciences is the body that sets graduate policy for the Graduate
11 School of Arts and Sciences. However, it is constituted by
12 representatives of the three divisions, the Humanities, the
13 Social Sciences and the Natural Sciences within the Arts and
14 Sciences plus at least one representative for each of the
15 schools that have the doctoral degree.

16 MR. BRILL: I'm going to mark as exhibit 31 another page
17 from the GSAS website, this one headed Executive Committee.

18 THE WITNESS: May I add something to what I said?

19 MR. BRILL: Yes, of course.

20 THE WITNESS: The composition of the Committee also
21 includes the President and the Vice President of the Graduate
22 Student Advisory Council.

23 BY MR. BRILL:

24 Q Can you identify 31?

25 A This is a photocopy of the page of the GSAS website that

1 details the function and the composition of the Executive
2 Committee of the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences.

3 (Employer's E-31 identified)

4 MR. BRILL: I offer it into evidence.

5 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

6 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

7 (Employer's E-31 received in evidence)

8 BY MR. BRILL:

9 Q You mentioned the -- was it Graduate School Advisory
10 Council (*sic*)?

11 A Toward the bottom of --

12 Q Graduate Student --

13 A -- the listing, student representatives, GSAC President
14 and GSAC Vice President.

15 Q What is --

16 A Graduate Student Advisory Council.

17 Q Okay. What is the Graduate School Advisory Council (*sic*)?

18 A The Graduate Student Advisory Council is the
19 representative body of graduate students at Dean Alonso.

20 Q Is that just for graduate students within GSAS?

21 A No. It is for graduate students in both the Morningside
22 and the Biomedical Campus.

23 Q Who are in either M.A. or PhD programs?

24 A I am not sure that the bylaws of GSAC --

25 Q Oh.

1 A -- include Masters students in it's purview. My personal
2 experience -- in my personal experience GSAC looks after the
3 interests of doctoral students, but my sense is that they have
4 been trying to expand their purview to include the interests
5 and needs of Masters students as well.

6 Q It doesn't include professional students from students
7 schools?

8 A Yes, it does.

9 Q It includes professional schools also?

10 A Yes.

11 Q So can you tell us how GSAC is organized and how the
12 members are selected?

13 A I know that they're selected via election, but I would not
14 want to describe that process thoroughly, because I don't know
15 it.

16 Q And -- but does it contain representatives from the
17 various departments or programs --

18 A Yes.

19 Q -- throughout the Graduate School?

20 A It has.

21 Q And what are the types of matters that it deals with?

22 A They are typically concerned with issues of student life,
23 campus climate. They have, for instance, a survey that they
24 sent to all students in order to identify issues of concern.

25 We -- the Graduate School has a meeting with the GSAC Steering

1 Committee on a monthly basis so that they can transmit to us
2 their concerns and their problems. And my sense is that they
3 use their representatives in order to identify precisely what
4 are issues of concern for the various constituencies that are
5 encompassed by GSAC.

6 Q And do you participate in these monthly meetings
7 personally?

8 A Yes.

9 Q So -- and just to close the loop, so the student
10 representatives on the Executive Committee are the President
11 and Vice President of the GSAC?

12 A Yes.

13 Q There's a listing of the Arts and Sciences departments on
14 exhibit 31. And then on the second page there are
15 representatives indicated from the College of Physicians and
16 Surgeons and the Fu Foundation School of Engineering and
17 Applied Sciences (*sic*).

18 A Yes.

19 Q So the College of Physicians and Surgeons, is that the
20 school that you said has the biomedical science program?

21 A That's one of the -- the College of Physicians and
22 Surgeons is the umbrella unit that is typically referred to as
23 the medical center, but that includes the Medical School,
24 School of Nursing, School of Public Health. And there is a
25 representative from that larger unit that sits in the Executive

1 Committee of the Graduate School and who serves a liaison
2 between the Executive Committee of the Graduate School and the
3 uptown campus.

4 Q And then there's another faculty member listed as
5 representing the Fu Foundation School -- excuse me -- of
6 Engineering and Applied Sciences (*sic*). And is that -- as I
7 understand it, that school also offers PhD programs through the
8 GSAS.

9 A Yes, all of the schools that are listed here that are not
10 the Arts and Sciences are in this list because they offer the
11 doctoral degree.

12 Q Okay. And I believe you testified that you personally
13 report to the Vice President for Arts and Sciences?

14 A Yes, I do.

15 Q And who is that currently?

16 A That's David Madigan.

17 Q Let me now turn your attention, Dean Alonso, to the
18 doctoral programs. And if you could just start in general
19 terms explaining for the record what is the goal of doctoral
20 education?

21 A Doctoral education is the means through which the
22 University reproduces itself as an institution. In other words
23 one of the ways in which the University as a research activity,
24 as a research context reproduces itself in time is through the
25 granting of degrees in order for which to obtain them. And in

1 order to obtain them students have to go through a process in
2 which they learn the requirements that would allow them to then
3 in turn become the future teachers of the nation.

4 In the post war -- post second war period, the Federal
5 Government understood very clearly that it needed to become
6 part of the whole process that would guarantee the furtherance
7 of research as a -- as an activity and instituted a pattern of
8 funding of research in the university context, that in fact has
9 become the cornerstone for the research activity in the
10 University and which has then been copied by the humanities and
11 the social sciences, in that it presupposes that you will bring
12 to your graduate programs the very best students, make them
13 work with faculty, make them learn how to teach and thereby
14 form the future faculty that will carry on the work of the
15 University. This is something that the Federal Government had
16 an enormous take in, because of the fact that it is a public
17 and social good. And this is how the development of the
18 research dimension of the University began. And it's also what
19 has allowed the university system to perpetrate itself for the
20 social good.

21 Q So let me just -- so you mentioned that one of the
22 features of doctoral education is preparing the next generation
23 of academics to teach. And what about -- what role does
24 research have in doctoral education?

25 A What --

1 Q In other words to -- you mentioned that one of the
2 purposes of doctoral education is to prepare the next
3 generation of academics who will be teachers. And is there
4 also a role of preparing students to do research? Or what
5 would the -- what -- to what extent does doctoral education
6 focus on research?

7 A To a very large extent. The main difference between
8 undergraduate education and graduate education is that
9 undergraduate education is the transmission of received
10 knowledge to an undergraduate audience, whereas the purpose and
11 the reason for graduate education is the production of new
12 knowledge, the advancement of whatever field we may be speaking
13 about. It is an ongoing enterprise that requires the
14 production of knowledge that is original, which is why the
15 highest degree offered by the Graduate School is the doctoral
16 degree, given the fact that the requirement for a doctoral
17 degree is that the student produce an original piece of
18 research.

19 Q I see. Are you familiar with an organization called AAU?

20 A Yes.

21 Q What is that? American Association of Universities?

22 A Yes.

23 Q What is the AAU?

24 A The AAU is an organization that comprises 60 to 65
25 institutions. I don't know the precise number. They are

1 select institutions that are supposed to be the pinnacle of
2 research in The United States. And it addresses the issues
3 that are of concern to those institutions for the graduate, and
4 undergraduate and administrative levels.

5 Q Is Columbia a member of AAU?

6 A Yes.

7 Q And what are some of your peer institutions that would
8 also be members of the AAU?

9 A All of the Ivy schools, Michigan, Berkeley, Chicago, MIT,
10 Stanford, Duke.

11 Q Has the AAU published any documents regarding doctoral
12 education?

13 A All the time.

14 MR. BRILL: I'm going to identify as -- mark for
15 identification exhibit 32, print out from the AAU website
16 entitled graduate education and the national interest. Just
17 let me note for the record that we attached a blown up version
18 of this behind the website print out, because it was hard to
19 read.

20 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: This is for the benefit of using your
21 eyes for long time?

22 MR. BRILL: For the benefit of the reader of the record.

23 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Oh, it's not for my benefit?

24 MR. BRILL: So I'm only -- I'm going to refer to the blown
25 up version.

1 BY MR. BRILL:

2 Q But can you identify the document, Dean Alonso?

3 A The web providence at the bottom of the photocopy would
4 indicate that it has been copied from the website of the AAU
5 site.

6 (Employer's E-32 identified)

7 Q And have you personally seen this on the AAU --

8 A Yes, I have. The AAU has, I guess you could call it a
9 sub-organization, called the Association of Graduate Schools
10 that again comprises the same 60 something institutions, but
11 that address -- addresses the specific needs and concerns of
12 graduate education.

13 MR. BRILL: I offer exhibit 32.

14 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Objection, relevance.

15 MR. BRILL: Well, the relevance is the document shows,
16 from a leading -- the leading organization in the country,
17 explains the system of doctoral education and how research --
18 training in research and training in teaching fit into doctoral
19 educational programs, not just in Columbia but more broadly. I
20 understand that the Petitioner is seeking to reverse the NLRB
21 decision in *Brown*. However, this document shows, from a
22 national perspective, that what the majority in *Brown* said was
23 completely correct; that the service as teaching assistants and
24 research assistants are very much a part of doctoral
25 educational programs that are directed towards helping train

1 students in becoming teachers and becoming researchers.

2 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Objection overruled. I'll
3 admit it.

4 (Employer's E-32 received in evidence)

5 BY MR. BRILL:

6 Q Dean Alonso, if you could look at exhibit 32? And I
7 direct your attention to the paragraph on the first page of the
8 blown up version. Unless your eyesight is better than mine you
9 could read it on the tiny print. The second paragraph there,
10 I'm going to read it and ask whether the statement in this
11 document is consistent with your understanding of doctoral
12 education as it works at Columbia.

13 "Along with taking courses and seminars, doctoral students
14 work with faculty mentors in teaching and research. The
15 primary purpose of doctoral students teaching and research
16 activities is to enable them to acquire an understanding of
17 teaching and research techniques. At the end of their course
18 of study they are required to demonstrate that they can do
19 independent research that advances the frontiers of knowledge."
20 Would that be an accurate statement with respect to Columbia's
21 programs as well?

22 A Yes, it would be.

23 Q Now, can you take us through the various steps in PhD
24 programs at Columbia beginning with for example if there's
25 coursework or other activities the students would engage in?

1 A Yes.

2 Q And if it's not the same throughout then you can indicate
3 where there may be differences.

4 A Yes. There are significant differences, but I will first
5 address the larger organization of the curriculum and then go
6 on to describe the differences. Typically, a student will
7 spend the first one through two and a half or three years
8 taking courses from doctoral faculty. At some point or
9 another, which will vary by discipline, there will be some kind
10 of comprehensive test that they will have to pass, in order to
11 be able to continue in the pursuant of the degree.

12 Subsequent to that they will have to draft or present, in
13 whatever shape is required by the department, a proposal for
14 their doctoral thesis, whereupon they receive the M.Phil degree
15 that we were speaking about previously, and they're admitted to
16 candidacy. Which means that from that point on the only thing
17 that a student needs to do, in order to receive a degree, is to
18 complete the final exercise for the -- final research exercise
19 for the degree, typically a dissertation.

20 Q Would the student work with one of more faculty members in
21 connection with doing the research and preparing the
22 dissertation?

23 A Yes. The -- well, again that varies by field. Typically,
24 there is one person called a sponsor who serves as the
25 principal supervisor of the research of the student. However,

1 the dissertation has to be defended in front of a committee of
2 five faculty members who have been designated as dissertation
3 sponsors by the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences. And
4 therefore at that point the work that the student has been
5 doing, not necessarily exclusively with the sponsor, but
6 principally with the sponsor, will have to be evaluated and
7 judged by a large panel of scholars who will take him or her to
8 task, regarding the conclusions, and the research and the
9 writing of the dissertation.

10 Q And if the dissertation is approved by the committee then
11 is that when the PhD degree is confirmed -- is conferred?

12 A The student still has to deposit the dissertation with the
13 Graduate School of Arts and Sciences and at that point the
14 student is eligible to receive the degree. However, degrees at
15 Columbia are conferred officially at only three moments during
16 the --

17 Q Oh, I see.

18 A -- year. And therefore you could deposit your
19 dissertation in a given month, but your degree will say three
20 months later, because that's the next available date.

21 Q Just going back, a few additional questions. You
22 mentioned the exam -- the comprehensive exam that's given. Is
23 that an oral exam, or a written exam or --

24 A It varies by discipline. Sometimes it's -- in the Natural
25 Sciences it could be a set of problems to work. In the

1 Humanities and the Social Sciences it's an exam that is
2 comprehensive, in terms of the discipline. And that shows that
3 the student has the capacity to engage the discourse of the
4 field and master the conventions of the discipline.

5 Q Would those exams be focused on the narrow topic that the
6 student is going to be doing research or would they be testing
7 broader knowledge in the field?

8 A Typically not. Typically not. They tend to be broad
9 exercised, because what you're trying to ascertain is that the
10 student is in fact conversant with the larger currents of the
11 field. But it varies. It depends on how early in the
12 student's career that exam occurs.

13 Q Well, could vary by department --

14 A Yes.

15 Q -- and program?

16 A It does.

17 Q And after the student finishes the required coursework are
18 there still activities -- educational activities that the
19 student would participate in for like colloquia, or seminars or
20 things like that that would go on in the department?

21 A Well, the student, upon joining the department, becomes a
22 member of an intellectual community. Right? It isn't just a
23 question of taking your courses, studying for your exams and
24 then doing your dissertation.

25 You are supposed to be a participant of a larger

1 conversation that is taking place in the department that is
2 fueled by the activities of the department internally, the
3 invitations that the department makes to outside speakers to
4 come to campus to engage both the faculty and the students,
5 conferences that the department may sponsor or cosponsor with
6 other departments. There is a -- there's a thing called the
7 intellectual light of the department that graduate students are
8 supposed to be a part of just like faculty.

9 Q In terms of the original research that's necessary to do
10 to write the dissertation, are there any differences between
11 Social Sciences, and the Humanities and the science
12 departments, in terms of how that research is typically done?

13 A Well, the nature of the originality of course is dictated
14 and determined by the specific field. But the main difference
15 I guess would be that the -- in the Natural Sciences this
16 research takes place in the context of a laboratory situation,
17 in which a faculty member is engaged in a very specific project
18 and the student chooses the lab that he or she wants to join on
19 the basis of his or her interests. And then develops this
20 original research project in the broader context of that
21 laboratory situation.

22 In the case of the Humanities and the Social Sciences,
23 there is no context such as that. So that the project for the
24 dissertation is one that is arrived at and supervised in
25 conversation with the particular faculty member whom the

1 student has approached to serve as a sponsor.

2 Q What is the -- if you can give a typical or average
3 timeframe from beginning to end for the PhD degree? And if it
4 varies by area you could break it down.

5 A Yes. Going back to the divisional structure of the Arts
6 and Sciences, Humanities, Social Sciences and Natural Sciences,
7 the -- in the Humanities the time to degree is somewhere
8 between eight and nine years, in the Social Sciences between
9 six and seven years and in the Natural Sciences between five
10 and six years.

11 Q Is there a limit in the -- in GSAS the student can be in
12 the program before a PhD is awarded?

13 A Yes. In 2011, I'm going to say, the Executive Committee
14 of the Graduate School voted to make nine years the outside
15 limit for a student being able to be a candidate for the degree
16 of Doctor of Philosophy. Meaning that a student entering from
17 that moment on would have a maximum of nine years in which to
18 complete the degree.

19 Q Incidentally, can you be a part time PhD student?

20 A You cannot.

21 Q And do you need -- after you finish with your coursework
22 and I guess are awarded the M.Phil degree, does a student still
23 need to be registered as a PhD student?

24 A There is a requirement of continuous registration while
25 you're pursuing the PhD degree.

1 Q And that -- and so from beginning to end nine years is the
2 time?

3 A The maximum.

4 Q The maximum?

5 A Yes.

6 Q What are the typical career paths for someone with the PhD
7 degree? You testified earlier that you're preparing the next
8 generation of --

9 A Yes.

10 Q -- scholars. So am I correct that at least a significant
11 percentage would be going into some academic pursuits?

12 A It varies again of course by division, but perhaps the
13 most accurate reflection I could give you of what goes on is
14 that last year we sent all of our doctoral programs a
15 spreadsheet populated with the list -- with the names, I'm
16 sorry, of all the students that had graduated in the last five
17 years and asked them to identify the whereabouts, the placement
18 of these students. And then we looked at the results that we
19 received from the departments and 67% of the students who had
20 graduated in the last five years were employed in the academic
21 context in one way or another.

22 Q What are some of the other careers that PhD students have
23 gone into?

24 A In the Natural Sciences they can go into industry, they
25 can go into government agencies. In the Humanities and the

1 Social Sciences there are cultural institutions they may work
2 at, foundations, think tanks. But there's also academic
3 administration of course, which has become another place where
4 doctoral students find employment.

5 Q Are you okay to keep going? Do you need a break?

6 A No.

7 MR. BRILL: Could you show the witness exhibit 29?

8 BY MR. BRILL:

9 Q Exhibit 29, Dean Alonso, is the document from the GSAS
10 website setting forth the requirements for the PhD and D.M.A.
11 degrees. And I call your attention to the paragraph --

12 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Exhibit 29?

13 MR. BRILL: 29.

14 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: What number is that?

15 THE WITNESS: Yes, but this the requirements for the
16 M.Phil degree.

17 MR. BRILL: Well, maybe it's 28? Alright. 28, my
18 apologies. Although keep 29 in front of you also. First with
19 28, I call your attention to the paragraph with the heading in
20 bold "instructional requirement for doctoral students". Do you
21 see that?

22 THE WITNESS: Yes. Yes, I do.

23 BY MR. BRILL:

24 Q What is the instructional requirement for doctoral
25 students?

1 A The instructional -- GSAS' instructional requirements for
2 doctoral students is a one year pedagogical experience, which
3 departments can supplement with their own requirements, but
4 this is one that is applied to all students in the Graduate
5 School of Arts and Sciences.

6 Q Now, it says in this paragraph that students are usually
7 appointed as teaching fellows while they fulfill the
8 requirements. Is that accurate?

9 A That's correct.

10 Q And also that they are expected to fulfill the requirement
11 in consecutive semesters of an academic year and during their
12 first four years of residence.

13 A Uh-huh.

14 Q And does that accurately -- does this paragraph accurately
15 state -- or does this section accurately state the
16 instructional requirement for doctoral students?

17 A Yes, it does.

18 Q And now turning your attention to 29, 29 also states that
19 students in the second full -- the second paragraph, 29 states
20 that students must complete the instructional requirements for
21 doctoral students and are responsible for any language or other
22 special requirements in order to get the M.Phil degree.

23 A Yes.

24 Q So does this mean that the instructional requirement that
25 you just described has to be completed before the M.Phil degree

1 is actually awarded?

2 A Yes, it does.

3 Q Incidentally, what are the language requirements that are
4 mentioned here under the M.Phil degree requirements?

5 A The various programs will have requirements for acquiring
6 reading proficiency in a given language or languages. And it's
7 up to the department to decide which are those languages, but
8 irrespective of the languages involved, the student should have
9 fulfilled those language requirements by the time they receive
10 the M.Phil.

11 Q So that's a requirement of the individual departments or
12 the programs, not the Graduate School?

13 A Yes. The specific requirement is up to the department.
14 We require that if the department is requiring any languages
15 that those requirements be satisfied by the time the M.Phil is
16 granted, the assumption being that once a student gets to the
17 point where the dissertation is the work outstanding for the
18 degree that he or she will not have the opportunity of
19 fulfilling those requirements and they're required before
20 granting that degree.

21 Q What is the purpose of the instructional requirement of
22 the PhD degree?

23 A The purpose of the instructional requirement is to provide
24 baseline requirement for the acquisition of teaching skills.
25 The assumption -- as it happens in many other instances, the

1 assumption is that the Graduate School is making a requirement
2 that serves as a minimum for students, but that individual
3 departments can supplement, or can tighten or make more
4 stringent, based on their own disciplinary or field
5 requirements.

6 Q What relationship does the requirement to have this
7 teaching experience have to doctoral education in general?

8 A The requirement is -- the teaching requirement is an
9 affirmation of the importance of acquiring the teaching skills
10 that would be needed for somebody who graduates with a doctoral
11 degree. It's an affirmation of the fact that pedagogical
12 training is an integral component of the graduate career of a
13 student.

14 Q So if a student gets a PhD degree and doesn't go into
15 academia is there still any purpose to the teaching, or
16 learning how to teach or having teaching experience?

17 A Yes, because the fact is that pedagogical requirement is
18 essentially a requirement that you learn how to communicate the
19 content, and the questions and the criteria of your field. And
20 you are going to be considered a representative of your
21 discipline when you go out with a PhD from Columbia. And we
22 want to make sure that you have had the experience of having to
23 synthesize and to present your field to an audience, before you
24 go out into the world.

25 The idea is also that the pedagogical requirement or let's

1 say the pedagogical experience is formative for students as
2 interlocutors in their particular field, in the sense that
3 having to explain your field, the fundamentals of your field to
4 an audience is one of the ways in which not only you prepare
5 yourself to represent your field, but also one of the ways in
6 which you understand your field better. Otherwise you never
7 really know how little you know about something until you have
8 to explain it to somebody else. And the synthesizing
9 experience of teaching is one that accompanies students into
10 their exams for the better part of their doctoral degree and
11 then into their career as professionals or academics afterward.

12 Q How does the -- does the Graduate School require a -- some
13 certification that the instructional requirement has been
14 satisfied before the M.Phil degree is awarded?

15 A Yes.

16 MR. BRILL: I'd like to mark as exhibit 33 a copy of a
17 document headed Graduate School of Arts and Sciences Columbia
18 University application -- excuse me -- for the Master of
19 Philosophy.

20 BY MR. BRILL:

21 Q Do you have exhibit 33 in front of you?

22 A Yes, I do.

23 Q Can you identify exhibit 33?

24 A This is a form that is submitted by a given department or
25 program to award the degree of Master of Philosophy to a

1 student.

2 (Employer's E-33 identified)

3 Q And is there a place on this form to indicate that the
4 instructional requirement that you previously described has
5 been satisfied?

6 A Yes. There is a box labeled instructional requirement and
7 that instructs Arts and Sciences programs to mark whether the
8 student has fulfilled the minimum one year teaching
9 requirement. I should say that this is a teaching requirement
10 that the Graduate School applies to all of the doctoral
11 programs in the Arts and Sciences. We don't have the
12 jurisdiction for requiring it of the other schools -- the other
13 professional schools. However, they may have, and in some
14 instances I know they have, steep pedagogical requirements like
15 this.

16 MR. BRILL: I offer exhibit 33.

17 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Just one voir dire question by way of
18 clarification.

19 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION

20 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

21 Q And maybe there's earlier testimony on this, but the very
22 bottom line calls for the signature of the SEAS office of the
23 dean.

24 A Uh-huh.

25 Q What is the SEAS office?

1 A School of Engineering and Applied Sciences (*sic*).

2 Q I take it that -- oh, so that answers the "if applicable"
3 part of the line as well?

4 A Right, right.

5 Q It's applicable if it's a student in those schools?

6 A Engineering school, yeah.

7 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Yeah. Okay. No objection.

8 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

9 (Employer's E-33 received in evidence)

10 MR. BRILL: This might be a good time to take a short --

11 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Break?

12 MR. BRILL: -- break.

13 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Are you done?

14 MR. BRILL: I'm not close to being done.

15 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Oh, okay. Off the record.

16 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken)

17 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: On the record.

18 BY MR. BRILL:

19 Q Dean Alonso, let me turn your attention now to the
20 admissions process for students who want to apply to Columbia
21 for the graduate program. Just can you describe in general how
22 someone would go about applying to become a doctoral student at
23 Columbia?

24 A Typically a prospective student will either find out
25 information that he or she needs to apply to the program online

1 or will contact the Director of Graduate Studies for his or her
2 intended field and then arrive at a determination about whether
3 they want to apply for the doctoral program.

4 Q Are there instructions online on the Graduate School
5 website about how to apply?

6 A Yes, in fact we host the application portal that's for
7 both M.A. students and PhD students.

8 MR. BRILL: Let me mark as exhibits 34 and 35 two
9 documents. The first is the document from the website of GSAS
10 headed "applying to GSAS" and the second appears to be the
11 actual online application form. This is 34.

12 BY MR. BRILL:

13 Q Dean Alonso, can you identify exhibits 34 and 35?

14 A Exhibit 34 is a set of instructions that an applicant
15 should follow in order to apply. It also gives some general
16 information about the process. And exhibit 35 is a copy of the
17 actual pages -- screens that the applicant will see throughout
18 the process of applying online.

19 (Employer's E-33 & 34 identified)

20 Q There's a name at the top, Test Testerson. Is that a --

21 A Yes.

22 Q -- actual person or --

23 A No, Test Testerson is part of the lore of statistics and
24 the testing of modules by using an individual's name that is
25 concocted and it's not real, but in order to see whether the

1 name gets reflected in the various parts of the application.

2 This is a -- it's a template in other words.

3 MR. BRILL: I offer 34 and 35.

4 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

5 MR. BRILL: Thank you.

6 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay. It's admitted.

7 (Employer's E-34 & 35 received in evidence)

8 BY MR. BRILL:

9 Q Now, how is the actual -- once the application is
10 submitted, how is a decision made as to which students will be
11 offered admission?

12 A Typically, we serve -- the Graduate School serves as the
13 repository of all these pieces of information that each
14 applicant has to submit. And once the collection of those
15 applications has reached a certain level of completion, it's
16 forwarded to the department. In other words the department is
17 then able to then see the applications.

18 And then they have their separate processes for
19 adjudicating on admission, wait list, denial of admission. And
20 then they will let us know, again electronically, which
21 students they -- we should be making offers of admission to,
22 which students should be placed on a waiting list, which
23 students should be sent a little informing them that their
24 application has not been successful.

25 Q Is it the -- would it be the faculty of the various

1 departments and programs that make the recommendation to the
2 Graduate School?

3 A Yes, it would be.

4 Q Is Columbia's Human Resources department involved in
5 evaluating the Graduate School applications at all?

6 A Absolutely not.

7 Q and what are the criteria, if you can talk about them
8 broadly, that the Graduate School or the departments look to,
9 in terms of the offers of admission?

10 A I guess you can derive the criteria from the documents
11 that are being requested in each case by the department and the
12 Graduate School. Transcripts of all previous or secondary
13 education, so you can ascertain their academic performance
14 previous to the moment of application. A statement of academic
15 purpose in which they explain what they think, at that
16 particular moment, their academic interests are and how they
17 could pursue them in the context of the department.

18 A curriculum vitae or resume that gives a snapshot of the
19 student's academic background. Three letters of recommendation
20 from academic sources who can vouch for the student's academic
21 and intellectual superiority. GRE scores. A GRE is a Graduate
22 Record Examination. It's a standardized test that is required
23 by most of the programs in the Graduate School.

24 And if you're an international student you also have to
25 submit the TOEFL, which stands for Test on English as a Foreign

1 Language (*sic*) or the ILTS examination. And achieving a
2 certain score vouches for the fact that your English
3 proficiency is enough for you to be able to undertake graduate
4 studies at Columbia. And most programs require some form of
5 written sample, in order to ascertain the quality of work by
6 the student. So in other words these are all criteria that try
7 to acquire a picture of the academic level and performance of
8 the student.

9 Q Would the process include consideration of a candidate's
10 teaching experience or abilities?

11 A No.

12 Q Or anything else about their work history?

13 A I think this summarizes very well what departments would
14 be looking at in order to make their decision.

15 Q How do departments know how many students they can accept
16 into a program each year?

17 A The Graduate School has a number of graduate student lines
18 we call them. In other words slots that a department can fill
19 in any given year. And they work toward, in the end, being
20 able to offer admission to a number of students, but
21 understanding that they are competing with many other
22 departments and therefore they make a larger number of offers
23 than that particular number of lines that they're working
24 toward. And --

25 Q You mean they're competing with other departments at other

1 institutions?

2 A Yes, the equivalent departments in other institutions. In
3 other words --

4 Q Somebody might get admitted at Harvard, and Yale and
5 Columbia --

6 A Yes.

7 Q -- and they might make the mistake of choosing some other
8 institution?

9 A Of course. It happens all the time we -- but the fact is
10 that we know when we -- not we, the departments, when they make
11 offers they are working in a universe of possibilities for
12 their students that requires that they make a larger number of
13 offers that will yield a given number of acceptances. And
14 that's a number that is -- it's a number that doesn't -- I
15 could not explain to you right now how -- why one department
16 has a certain number of lines and why another department has
17 others, in the sense that when I became dean these numbers were
18 already in place.

19 Q Well, if a department came to you and said, you know, the
20 number of undergraduate majors in our area has really increased
21 in the last three years and we need to cover more teaching, so
22 we need more graduate students, would that be something that
23 the Graduate School would take into account in adjusting the
24 number of admissions for that particular program? In other
25 words the need to teach more undergraduates.

1 A No, because the fact is that these are lines that have
2 been -- the number of lines is frozen. In other words there is
3 no possibility. It's a zero sum game and if you are going to
4 increase the number of lines for one program you will -- you
5 would by necessity be reducing the number of lines for another
6 program. So it doesn't happen, because people understand that
7 we are essentially -- since 2008 we have been in a zero sum
8 game, with respect to those lines.

9 Q Once a student is -- once a department recommends and the
10 Graduate School decides to extend the offer of admission, how
11 is that conveyed to the applicant?

12 A Once a student -- departments make a recommendation to us
13 that an offer be extended to an applicant, we generate a letter
14 that offers admission to the student and that details the terms
15 so to say of the offer.

16 MR. BRILL: I'd like to mark as the next set of exhibits
17 36, 37 and 38, three letters of admission. The first is to the
18 Department of Economics, the second to the Department of Art
19 History and Archeology and the third to Department of Tests,
20 which I guess is another template of the Science Department.
21 Just note for the record that other than Ms. Daisy Testerson,
22 who was the student admitted to the Department of Tests, I
23 guess the same one who submitted the application that we looked
24 at previously --

25 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No, that was a he.

1 THE WITNESS: Yeah.

2 MR. BRILL: What?

3 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: That was her brother.

4 MR. BRILL: Oh. We've redacted the names of the students.

5 BY MR. BRILL:

6 Q Can you identify the exhibits that we marked as 36, 37 and
7 38?

8 A Exhibit 36 is a letter offering admission to the doctoral
9 program in Economics. 37 is the equivalent letter, but for the
10 Department of Art History and Archeology. And 38 is the
11 equivalent letter for the Department of Tests.

12 (Employer's E-36 through 38 identified)

13 Q Is 38 an example, a similar letter that's sent for the
14 Science Department? The reason I ask is the amount of the
15 stipend is 73,617 on the first two for the stipend plus --

16 A Yes.

17 Q -- the fellowship and then it's 81,903 on the third
18 letter.

19 A If what you asking is the reason for the difference in --

20 Q Oh, I see it's a different year also. So I just noticed
21 this myself. I apologize, but the first two -- let's just
22 stick with the first two letters for the moment. These were
23 sent out in February and March of 2014.

24 A Uh-huh.

25 Q So -- and you've identified these two.

1 A Yes.

2 MR. BRILL: I offer the first two, 36 and 37 in evidence.

3 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Any objections?

4 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

5 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay. It's admitted.

6 (Employer's E-36 & 37 received in evidence)

7 BY MR. BRILL:

8 Q Now turning to 38, this is a letter that was sent this
9 current year in March of 2015 offering admission for the fall
10 semester?

11 A Yes.

12 Q And do you know if this was any particular department or
13 division? Can you tell?

14 A This looks like an offer that would have gone to a
15 candidate in the Department of Natural Sciences.

16 Q Is that because the amount of the stipend reflected here?

17 A Yes.

18 MR. BRILL: I offer exhibits 36, 37 and 38.

19 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Well, 36 and 37 is admitted
20 already.

21 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: One question on 38, please.

22 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION

23 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

24 Q Is there anything else about exhibit 38 that indicated to
25 you that it relates to a science department other than dollar

1 figure?

2 A The second page refers to fellowships, research grants.

3 Q I'm sorry, where are we?

4 A The second page of --

5 Q Yeah.

6 A -- 38, the third --

7 MR. BRILL: The second bullet point.

8 THE WITNESS: The second asterisk.

9 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Uh-huh.

10 THE WITNESS: An annual stipend of 35,000 for up to five
11 years provided by the Department of Tests PhD via fellowships,
12 research grants to your dissertation advisor and the graduate
13 school. Research grants are typically one of the ways in which
14 graduate students in the Natural Sciences are funded. This
15 does not happen in the Humanities and in the Social Sciences
16 except in rare occasions.

17 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay?

18 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I have no objection to the document.

19 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

20 (Employer's E-38 received in evidence)

21 CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION

22 BY MR. BRILL:

23 Q Dean Alonso, with respect to exhibits 36 and 37, which are
24 the letters that were sent the winter of 2014 for admission --
25 fall of 2014, would the amount of the fellowship including the

1 stipend have increased for the students admitted for the coming
2 academic year?

3 A Yes, they have.

4 Q Do you know by approximately how much?

5 A I believe it was 3.75 or something like that.

6 Q But in other respects the letter that was sent for the --
7 for admission for the coming year would be similar, if not the
8 same, as the letter for last year?

9 A Yes, it would be similar.

10 Q Now, turning your attention to -- going to stay with
11 exhibit 36. On the second page there's a description of
12 something called fellowship and housing information.

13 A Yes.

14 Q Is the fellowship package that's described in exhibit 36,
15 is the same package offered to all students who are admitted in
16 the PhD programs in the Humanities and Social Sciences?

17 A Yes, it is.

18 Q It's the same?

19 A Yes.

20 Q And would the package that's offered to the science
21 students as described in exhibit 38, do all students in all
22 science -- Natural Science departments get the same fellowship
23 package?

24 A Yes, they do.

25 Q And how long is the package provided for?

1 A Five years.

2 Q So would the amount increase or stay the same over that
3 five years?

4 A The amount increases every year by a certain percentage
5 that we arrive at -- that the Arts and Sciences arrives at, on
6 the basis of its understanding of its overall budget. What we
7 are always trying to do, when deciding the level of stipend
8 increase for any given year -- or I should say stipend and
9 summer increase, is to maintain competitiveness with our peers,
10 in terms of their offer of packages to their prospective
11 students.

12 Q Who would you consider to the peer institutions that
13 you're trying to compete with, if you will, for attracting
14 doctoral students?

15 A It varies of course from field to field, but in terms of
16 the overall setting of the stipend and its attractiveness with
17 respect to other institutions, we're thinking typically about
18 Harvard, Yale, Stanford, Princeton. Those are the schools that
19 have stipends that are above ours. But we are always trying to
20 look at what the situation is, in terms of our competitiveness,
21 because this is the moment when students are choosing among the
22 possibilities that they have in front of them.

23 Q Now, at any one time you would have students in a
24 department who were admitted at obviously different years, but
25 is everyone in the department at any one time getting the same

1 fellowship support package?

2 A Yes.

3 Q Regardless of what year they were admitted?

4 A Yes. When we decree a stipend increase or a stipend and
5 summer increase, all students -- in other words prospective
6 students or students who have accepted our offer for the coming
7 year and current students see their stipends and packages
8 increased simultaneously.

9 Q Now, can you just take us through the different elements
10 of the fellowship support that the PhD students receive?

11 A Tuition is, I guess, self-explanatory.

12 Q What is -- do you know what --

13 A Tuition -- what the tuition is? 50 something thousand
14 dollars. I don't know exactly.

15 Q And health services and university facilities fee?

16 A Health services and university facilities fees are fees
17 that are assessed so that students can have access to the
18 health services office on campus. And university facilities
19 fees are fees that students would need to pay out of pocket in
20 order to use the library, the gym, etc. Undergraduates
21 routinely pay these things out of pocket.

22 Q And Masters students would be required to pay these
23 tuition --

24 A Yes.

25 Q -- fees also?

1 A Yes, they would.

2 Q Then the stipend which you mentioned?

3 A The stipend is the amount that students will receive
4 during the academic year and the summer stipend is
5 disbursements that are typically mid-May or so, in order to
6 supplement the stipend during the summer for students in the
7 Humanities and the Social Sciences.

8 Q And the last element here is basic student health
9 insurance premium.

10 A Yes.

11 Q That's different from the health services fee?

12 A Yes. The health services fee is simply a fee that would
13 be paid by the student so that they could go visit, for routine
14 matters, the health services office at Columbia. The basic
15 student health insurance premium is an actual medical plan that
16 the students join and which the Graduate School pays the
17 premiums for.

18 Q And the total indicated for a student being here admitted
19 here to the Department of Economics is \$73,617 ---

20 A But that includes all the items including the asterisks;
21 tuition, the fees, stipend, summer stipend.

22 Q And then for the student admitted to the Science
23 Department in exhibit 38, the components appear to be the same
24 except for the summer support. Why don't the science --

25 A Because in the sciences, students are on a different

1 schedule in the sense that they are on appointment for the
2 entire year, as opposed to the nine months that are typical for
3 the Humanities and Social Sciences. So what you do is you take
4 the stipend, and you annualize it and then you end up with the
5 figure of 81,903. But everybody is taking, at this point of
6 departure, the same stipend.

7 Q But the total for the science student is 81,903?

8 A Yes.

9 Q Does -- just to be clear, so as indicated in the letter
10 the fellowship includes some -- to some degree participation in
11 teaching and research activities, is that correct?

12 A Yes.

13 Q So that would vary by department and program what the
14 students are required to do?

15 A Absolutely.

16 Q And are there semesters when the students would be --
17 would not be required to be doing any teaching -- have a
18 teaching appointment for example?

19 A Yes. For the Humanities and Social Sciences the first
20 year is a year on fellowship, meaning that there are no
21 responsibilities by the research or pedagogical nature for
22 them. What would happen after that year is that they would be
23 appointed teaching fellows. And in the case of the Natural
24 Sciences they would be appointed graduate research assistants.
25 But they would move, in the Humanities and Social Sciences,

1 from a position of full fellowship with no responsibilities to
2 a teaching fellowship appointment. And they would have, in
3 their fifth year, yet another year with no responsibilities
4 with the understanding or hope that that would be the year in
5 which they would be spending their full effort on the writing
6 of their dissertation.

7 Q And is there any difference in the fellowship support
8 that's provided to the doctoral students in the years when they
9 have teaching responsibilities and in the years when they're on
10 a dean's fellowship or a dissertation fellowship?

11 A None. None whatsoever. It's exactly the same amount.

12 Q Is the amount -- just to be clear, so the amount of the
13 stipend or total fellowship package that the student receives,
14 does that vary at all depending on the type of work that's
15 required? Does it -- when they're teaching for example does
16 the amount vary depending on the type of work that's required,
17 or the number of hours that they put in or the particular skill
18 that's involved?

19 A No. Because of the fact that the teaching
20 responsibilities for a student are determined by the
21 pedagogical and academic needs of the training that the
22 department is trying to give the student. When you look at the
23 responsibilities that various graduate students have throughout
24 departments they vary immensely.

25 Some just have office hours. In other words they're

1 available once or twice a week to help students. Some lead
2 discussion sections typically called recitations. And yet
3 others teach essentially a class in which they're responsible
4 for meeting a class, for grading the work produced by the
5 students and giving a grade at the end.

6 And then you also have of course the situation of the
7 students in the Natural Sciences who are -- when they're
8 teaching are either running a lab section or serving to
9 supplement the availability of the faculty member in charge of
10 the course. But it's a huge diversity of duties, all of which
11 are not reflected in the stipend that students receive.
12 Meaning that all students receive the same stipend irrespective
13 of the amount of activity and responsibility that is required
14 of them, as part of that teaching appointment.

15 Q When the Graduate School sets the stipend each year do
16 you take into account what the market value of the teaching
17 services would be? In other words what's the labor market for
18 -- if you had to go out and hire someone to do the equivalent
19 teaching function?

20 A No, the stipend, as I said previously, is -- it's set
21 based on the overall budget of the Arts and Sciences and our
22 desire to remain competitive, with respect to our peers.

23 Q Remain competitive in terms of the fellowship package that
24 you're providing?

25 A Exactly.

1 Q So do you know for example what it would cost to hire an
2 adjunct with a PhD degree and teaching experience to do the
3 teaching that the graduate students do as teaching assistant?

4 A Yes, I do know that.

5 Q What is the comparison?

6 A The comparison yields the figure of \$8,000, meaning that
7 if we were to hire an adjunct to teach a class that is being
8 taught by a graduate student, we could do it for \$8,000 less
9 than what we are paying, in order to have a graduate student be
10 the instructor for that class.

11 Q And that would be about --

12 A \$8,000, yeah.

13 Q So that would be \$8,000 less. Do you know what the bottom
14 line number would be or -- so if a graduate student is
15 receiving a total package of 70 -- are you comparing just the
16 stipend or the total cost?

17 A Just the stipend.

18 Q Just the stipend? So you're --

19 A Yes.

20 Q -- not even taking into account the --

21 A No.

22 Q -- tuition remission? And a graduate student would --
23 that's comparing a graduate student teaching one course --

24 A Yes, per course.

25 Q Per course?

1 A It's per course.

2 Q Okay. Do the graduate students receive benefits as
3 Columbia employees such as vacation, sick pay, retirement
4 contributions, flexible spending accounts?

5 A No, they don't.

6 Q They don't get any of those benefits?

7 A No.

8 MR. BRILL: I want to mark as exhibit 39 another print out
9 from the GSAS website, this one entitled fellowship categories.

10 BY MR. BRILL:

11 Q Dean Alonso, can you identify exhibit 39?

12 A These are the -- this is a printout from a page in the
13 graduate student (*sic*) of Arts and Sciences website that
14 describes the various fellowship categories in the Graduate
15 School of Arts and Sciences.

16 (Employer's E-39 identified)

17 Q These are the fellowship categories for the doctoral
18 students?

19 A Yes.

20 MR. BRILL: Excuse me. I offer 39.

21 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

22 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

23 (Employer's E-39 received in evidence)

24 BY MR. BRILL:

25 Q Now, you foreshadowed some of this information already,

1 but it would be useful for the record to just go through them,
2 briefly describe the categories that are listed here beginning
3 with the dean's fellow and the dissertation fellow. If you
4 could just explain what these various categories are?

5 A The dean's fellow is the category for which -- that is
6 used to refer to all students upon admission to the Graduate
7 School. The dissertation fellow -- fellowship is a category
8 that is used to designate those students who are given a
9 stipend and have no appointment responsibilities. In other
10 words these are people who are given a stipend and not required
11 in any way to do any service. And this is what normally a
12 student would receive in the fifth year of --

13 Q That would be for the Humanities and Social Sciences?

14 A For the Humanities and Social Sciences, yes.

15 Q And just going back to the dean's fellow for a minute, the
16 document states that in the Humanities and Social Sciences this
17 award entails no service obligations in the first year beyond
18 satisfactory progress, study and research. And students are
19 not permitted to hold student officer appointments or any other
20 appointment.

21 A Right.

22 Q Is that -- that's accurate?

23 A That's accurate.

24 Q And then there are four categories of student officer
25 appointments that are show. Could you, again, briefly go

1 through those and tell us what those appointments are?

2 A Yes. The teaching fellow is someone who's appointed as a
3 TF. This is an appointment that includes teaching
4 responsibilities as part of its description. A preceptor is a
5 term that is used to designate students who are appointed to
6 have pedagogical responsibilities in the Columbia core
7 curriculum.

8 A research fellow and a graduate research assistant are
9 typically appointments in the Natural Sciences. And the
10 distinction between them is that the graduate research
11 assistant is a student who is appointed to a position in which
12 he or she will be paid from sponsored research funds coming
13 from outside the university, as opposed to the research fellow,
14 who again will have research responsibilities, but who is paid
15 from internal sources within the university.

16 Q Pardon me. Going back to the teaching fellow position for
17 a moment, can you tell us generally what are the types of
18 activities the teaching fellows can be engaged in?

19 A As I said before the -- it runs the gamut, because of the
20 fact that the particular responsibilities for a student in a
21 given department will be determined by the ways in which the
22 faculty thinks would be best to train this student to learn to
23 teach. So that you will have some students who are running
24 discussion sections, you will have students who are helping
25 students in a lab in the Natural Sciences, you will have some

1 students that are teaching a section of a language class. And
2 the variety is really quite significant.

3 But also you can have the same student in one semester
4 doing one type of -- engaged in that one type of responsibility
5 and then in the next semester have it be very different. The
6 assumption always being that the department has determined the
7 -- a progression, in terms of the kinds of experiences that
8 students should have, in order to train themselves as
9 pedagogues.

10 Q Would the responsibility sometimes include grading of
11 exams or other work?

12 A Yes, they would at times.

13 Q Would the students serving as teaching fellows ever be
14 required to hold office hours for example?

15 A Yes.

16 Q And what would happen in the office hours?

17 A In the office hours graduate students who are in charge of
18 either a recitation section or serving as TAs for a class make
19 themselves available to undergraduates who may need to come in
20 for help, for questions, for orientation of any sort.

21 Q How are the teaching fellows paid? In other words is
22 there any difference in the way they receive their payment when
23 they're a dean's fellow first year versus the teaching fellow
24 in the second --

25 A Yes.

1 Q -- year?

2 A When somebody is appointed a dean's fellow or a
3 dissertation fellow their stipend is disbursed as stipend in
4 two moments during the year, in August and in early January, as
5 stipend. When somebody is appointed a teaching fellow a
6 certain amount of their stipend is paid as stipend and a
7 certain amount of their stipend is paid as salary.

8 Q And do you know what the division between the two amounts
9 is?

10 A Yeah, it's 1/3 to 2/3. 1/3 salary, 2/3 stipend.

11 Q Is that because of tax rules or do you know the reason for
12 that division?

13 A Yeah, I inquired some time ago about why there was that
14 distinction and we were told that these were IRS requirements
15 and that they needed to be followed. And --

16 Q So it's been the same way since you've been the dean?

17 A Before.

18 Q Before? When -- what is the time expectation? The
19 expectation of how much time a student will devote to teaching
20 fellow activities, while they're appointed as a teaching
21 fellow?

22 A We have a maximum of 20 hours per week as the expectation
23 of time that a student should devote to teaching or preparation
24 for teaching.

25 Q And while a student is serving as a teaching fellow are

1 there other academic pursuits that they're also engaged in, in
2 connection with their doctoral program?

3 A Yes. In other words the teaching is assumed to be part of
4 that larger process of forming themselves as scholars, and
5 teachers and professionals. And just because they are teaching
6 it doesn't mean that they don't have the other components of
7 their graduate career disappear.

8 In other words they still have to attend classes if they
9 are taking classes. They still need to participate in
10 departmental activities. They are still expected to keep up
11 with their -- with the bibliography in their field. This is
12 one component of their life, as graduate students, and it's
13 supposed to march along with all the other aspects of their
14 training as doctoral students.

15 MR. BRILL: I want to mark as exhibit 40 a document again
16 from the GSAS website entitled graduate student teaching
17 guidelines.

18 BY MR. BRILL:

19 Q Can you identify exhibit 40, Dean Alonso?

20 A This is a photocopy of a page in the website for the
21 Graduate School of Arts and Sciences that describes teaching
22 guidelines for graduate students.

23 (Employer's E-40 identified)

24 Q Does this document accurately describe the guidelines for
25 both the graduate students and the faculty members who are

1 responsible for training and supervising the graduate student
2 teachers?

3 A Yes. That's why it's a mixture of items that are
4 addressed in a sense to graduate students and items that are
5 addressed to faculty or departmental representatives.

6 MR. BRILL: I offer exhibit 40.

7 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

8 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay. It's admitted.

9 (Employer's E-40 received in evidence)

10 BY MR. BRILL:

11 Q I'd just like to take a few minutes now, Dean Alonso, to
12 ask you about some very specific provisions of this document,
13 because obviously the hearing itself is focused on, at least in
14 part, the teaching fellow appointment. The first paragraph
15 under the heading one, guidelines for teaching fellowships,
16 states "the experience of teaching is an integral part of
17 graduate student training for the M.Phil or PhD degrees in the
18 Arts and Sciences. Therefore, all graduate students are
19 expected to gain appropriate teaching experience as part of
20 your scholarly apprenticeship. Teaching fellows receive the
21 same financial aid and support as faculty and dissertation
22 fellows." Does that paragraph -- in your view does that
23 accurately reflect the role of the teaching fellow in terms of
24 the graduate student training?

25 A Yes, it does.

1 Q The next section talks about the guideline for selection
2 and assignment. There's a mention that each department has to
3 designate a responsible faculty member to oversee teaching
4 fellowships and pedagogical training in each department.

5 A Uh-huh.

6 Q Can you explain that -- what that responsibility is and
7 what the purpose of it is?

8 A Yes, the Graduate School works under the assumption that
9 while it sets a minimum requirement for pedagogical training or
10 pedagogical experience for graduate students, departments are
11 the context in which graduate students will be acquiring the
12 majority of the pedagogical experience that they will accrue.
13 And it is incumbent on departments to designate somebody who
14 will keep track of the overall pedagogical training of the
15 graduate students. That is typically the Director of Graduate
16 Studies, but it can also vary from year to year, depending on
17 what type of course a graduate student is being asked to teach.

18 Q Let me -- I'm not going to go through each one of these
19 paragraphs, but there's a few that I do have some questions
20 about, beginning with number one, teaching fellows much be in
21 good academic standing.

22 A Uh-huh.

23 Q First of all what does it mean to be in good academic
24 standing? And I guess I'll ask a two part question and why is
25 that a requirement to be a teaching fellow?

1 A Well, good academic standing is a category that we use
2 that reflects the fact that the student has attained a certain
3 milestone, but it also reflects departmental judgment of the
4 academic and intellectual performance of the student. The
5 reason why teaching fellows must be in good academic standing
6 is that you want the people that you appoint to teach
7 undergraduates have mastery of the -- appropriate mastery of
8 their field, and of their discipline and to be advancing, as
9 expected, toward completion of their degree.

10 Q Number 10 provides that departments and programs may not
11 hire GSAS students on the Arts and Sciences adjunct budget.
12 What is the budget for payment of the teaching fellows? Is
13 that a --

14 A The budget for the payment of stipends to teaching fellows
15 is part of the financial aid budget of the Graduate School of
16 Arts and Sciences. Essentially what this is prohibiting is
17 that departments should hire graduate students on the adjunct
18 budget.

19 Q So is there a separate budget for --

20 A Yes.

21 Q -- personnel salary costs?

22 A For adjuncts, yes.

23 Q And for salary costs generally?

24 A Yes.

25 Q And the financial aid -- or I'm sorry, the stipends

1 provided to the graduate students who are teaching fellows you
2 said comes out of the financial aid budget, not from the
3 personnel cost budget?

4 A Yes.

5 Q Or the adjunct budget?

6 A The budget for financial aid is given to the Graduate
7 School of Arts and Sciences. The budget for adjunct
8 appointments remains in the faculty of Arts and Sciences, which
9 is the one that hired instructional personnel. We don't hire
10 instructional personnel.

11 Q The next page, paragraph 17 says "the expected time
12 commitment for teaching fellow duties is roughly 15 to 20 hours
13 per week on average". Would that be consistent with your
14 understanding?

15 A Yes, it would be.

16 Q And the next paragraph talks about the need for training
17 and supervision. Particularly wanted to ask you about the
18 second part of that which says "if the department or program is
19 dissatisfied with a teaching fellow's work a review of his or
20 her performance is undertaken in a timely fashion. The GDS or
21 faculty member in charge must inform the student in writing of
22 his or her concern, offer specific recommendations for
23 improving performance and give the student time to respond. If
24 the student fails to meet these requirements he or she may be
25 considered no longer in good administrative standing." So can

1 you explain a little bit more what this process is, if there's
2 dissatisfaction with the work of a teaching fellow?

3 A Yeah.

4 Q And also could you compare that to what the process would
5 be if there was dissatisfaction, for example, with a adjunct
6 faculty member or instructor?

7 A Yes. The training of graduate students as future faculty
8 is something that is taken very seriously by departments and by
9 the Graduate School, which is the reason why both the
10 departments and the Graduate School have created this rather
11 involved set of practices exclusively for the training of
12 graduate students. What I mean by that is that every
13 department has a series of workshops, a series of talks,
14 sometimes even courses that they give credit to students for.
15 And also a program of observation of graduate student
16 performance, in order to make sure that graduate students are
17 acquiring the skills and are able to use, in the classroom,
18 those skills.

19 When a student encounters difficulty in the classroom,
20 meaning that student evaluations are not what they should be or
21 there are some difficulties with grading and a complaint is
22 received let's say by the Chair about the fact that there's
23 inconsistency in the grading, that student is referred to
24 either the departmental resources, typically as the first step
25 -- departmental resources for pedagogy, for pedagogical

1 training or to the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences
2 Teaching Center, which is this center that the faculty of Arts
3 and Sciences created in order to insure the pedagogical
4 training of graduate students.

5 That student will be helped. That student will be
6 observed. They will be given advice. They will be helped to
7 the extent possible, both by their department and by the
8 Teaching Center.

9 I have never, in 25 years of supervising graduate students
10 and in five years of being dean, seen a graduate student --
11 seen -- I've never seen a graduate student be terminated, be
12 dismissed from our graduate program on account of difficulties
13 with teaching. You have to contrast that to what happens with
14 adjuncts, lecturers or even faculty. Anyone of those three
15 categories, if a person has difficulties with teaching and they
16 can't, through their own devices or through their own
17 resources, manage to take care of them, those are, and are on a
18 regular basis, grounds for non-renewal of a contract. Somebody
19 doesn't get promoted to tenure, somebody is not rehired as an
20 adjunct, somebody is not reappointed as a lecturer.

21 One of the ways again, in which you can see the fact that
22 students are regarded as pedagogues in training and are
23 regarded as people who are learning the craft of teaching is
24 that three years ago there was a discussion in the University
25 Senate about the proposal to make all student evaluations --

1 undergraduate student evaluations of courses taught by Columbia
2 faculty be available to all. In other words to make them
3 public. At that time the Graduate Student Advisory Council,
4 the organization that I described previously, lobbied
5 successfully the Senate so that the graduate student
6 evaluations, in other words the evaluations of courses that
7 were being taught by graduate students, would not be made
8 public precisely because of the fact that they were students in
9 training. That they were liable to have difficulties. That
10 they were learning the skills needed to engage in successful
11 training and that they should not be penalized by having
12 evaluations that resulted from that context be made public.

13 This year there was a further movement to make -- now to
14 really put in place the system of public availability of
15 evaluations and again graduate students have been exempted from
16 having their evaluations become part of the public record. But
17 the leniency component that I was referring to is one that also
18 implies a great deal of work on the part of departments and on
19 the Graduate Center, which gives you a sense of the kind of
20 investments that departments have on the pedagogical training
21 of their students.

22 Q In an extreme case if a graduate student failed to fulfill
23 his or her obligations as a teaching fellow, not showing up for
24 class or not grading the papers, something along those lines,
25 would that be a situation where the graduate student could be

1 deemed to be not in good standing?

2 A Yes, but let me make the distinction that I think you may
3 have collapsed. A student can be having difficulties in the
4 classroom as a pedagogue, while trying and while giving his or
5 her all. You can also have -- and we have seen cases like
6 these -- students that have engaged in gross dereliction of
7 duty where they stop meeting their classes, they are meeting
8 their classes in a bar. It happened. And that is behavioral
9 in nature, and it's unprofessional and that doesn't have to do
10 with the problems that a student may be having in the
11 classroom, as a result of the fact that he or she is learning
12 the management of a class and so forth.

13 Q But in the example that I gave, and you said there were
14 some experiences of students who stopped meeting the class or
15 decided to meet the class in a bar, would those be grounds for
16 holding the student not in good standing and therefore
17 dismissing the student from the academic program?

18 A What would happen is that in a case like that the
19 department would bring the student up to dean's discipline,
20 which is a process that we have to address all kinds of
21 behavioral issues. And the result of dean's discipline can be
22 anything from warnings, to suspensions to separation from the
23 program.

24 MR. BRILL: Let me -- it's 12:30, but let me just -- I'm
25 not going to -- I don't think I'm going to finish my direct

1 this morning unfortunately, but I'll try and get to the end of
2 a natural breaking point at least. And maybe -- I'd like to at
3 least get through this -- the document and see where we are.

4 BY MR. BRILL:

5 Q The next paragraph, Dean Alonso, talks about certain
6 grievance procedures that may result from students thinking
7 that their teaching assignments aren't fair or some other
8 problem that they may have with respect to the -- or perceived
9 problem with respect to their teaching fellow appointment.
10 What would be -- what avenue would be available, if any, for
11 students who have that type of complaint?

12 A What would be the nature of the --

13 Q Well, I mean it talks about --

14 A Yeah.

15 Q -- the GSAS grievance procedure. What would the -- what
16 would that grievance procedure be?

17 A The grievance procedure is a procedure that is typically
18 used by a student to grieve some perceived harm. And in this
19 case what the item is proposing is that if a student is
20 complaining about some aspect of the distribution of courses or
21 the way in which the assignments are made, they should first
22 work it out internally. And if they cannot resolve the issue
23 they can elevate it to the appropriate dean in GSAS. It
24 doesn't -- I have never seen any such thing. So I cannot --

25 Q Okay.

1 A -- tell you why this would -- what this would look like.

2 Q I actually skipped -- I know everybody thought we were
3 coming to the end of this section, but I skipped over one
4 paragraph that I wanted to ask you about. If you can go back
5 to the prior page to paragraph seven, which states "insofar as
6 it is possible, teaching fellows should be offered a range of
7 teaching responsibilities with increasing independence and
8 student contact to gradually prepare them for independent
9 teaching." Can you describe what that paragraph is --

10 A Yeah.

11 Q -- asking for and the purpose of that?

12 A Yes. As I said earlier, the assumption that we in the
13 Graduate School have and that we communicate to departments on
14 a regular basis is that when they sit down to try to figure out
15 teaching fellow assignments they give a great deal of thought
16 to how those assignments will allow a student to develop the
17 whole panoply of skills that they will need in order to be
18 effective teachers in the future. This is why you would have a
19 student for instance do first office hours, then lead a
20 recitation section, then take over a lecture -- a large lecture
21 class during one semester. And give the student therefore the
22 kinds of experiences that in the aggregate would allow a
23 student to develop the various skills needed. This is also for
24 instance why we in the Graduate School developed the Teaching
25 Scholars Program.

1 Q I'll come to that later.

2 A Okay.

3 Q So let me go on now to point two, which is guidelines for
4 training and supervision of graduate student teachers. The
5 first paragraph indicates that departments can train -- can set
6 up a course that precedes or accompanies teaching as part of
7 training.

8 A Uh-huh.

9 Q Is that something that happens --

10 A Yes.

11 Q -- in the departments?

12 A There are some departments that have courses. Some give
13 students credit for those courses, some do not. But when they
14 have such a course it is typically a requirement, even if it's
15 not credit bearing.

16 Q Have you actually prepared a list of some of the
17 departments that give a credit for either teaching experience
18 or the training for teaching?

19 A Yes, I have.

20 MR. BRILL: Let me mark as exhibit 41 a document that's
21 headed Arts and Sciences programs that give course credit for
22 pedagogical training.

23 BY MR. BRILL:

24 Q Here's 41. Can you identify the document we've marked as
25 exhibit 41?

1 A This is a list of programs in the Arts and Sciences that
2 give course credit for pedagogical training.

3 (Employer's E-41 identified)

4 Q And did your office prepare this document for you?

5 A Yes, it did.

6 MR. BRILL: I offer it in evidence.

7 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: A couple questions.

8 THE WITNESS: Yeah.

9 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION

10 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

11 Q How was the data for this -- or the information for this
12 list gathered?

13 A By looking at the websites of the various programs.

14 Q Is this intended to be a complete listing of departments
15 that give credit for teaching -- for --

16 MR. BRILL: Pedagogical.

17 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: -- pedagogical training?

18 THE WITNESS: Pedagogical, yes. Yes, it is.

19 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

20 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

21 (Employer's E-41 received in evidence)

22 CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION

23 BY MR. BRILL:

24 Q Now, just in general the training section is divided into
25 three areas; before the appointment begins, during the term of

1 the teaching and evaluation. And without taking you though
2 this in detail, could you just generally describe what the
3 expectation is of the departments to train and supervise
4 graduate students during each of those --

5 A Yes.

6 Q -- phases beginning with A, which is before the
7 appointment begins?

8 A I believe that the A, B, C sequence essentially summarizes
9 what the into was in Roman number two, which was to make
10 departments and programs aware of the fact that they have
11 certain responsibilities toward the students that they are
12 about to place in the classroom, in order to make sure that
13 this person has the best possible context in which to learn and
14 in which to perform his or her duties beginning with a very
15 general orientation and instructions on how to conduct a class,
16 and how to prepare a syllabus and how to lead discussion. And
17 continuing on to describe the supervision that a student should
18 receive at various stages of the appointment and of the
19 student's teaching career at Columbia.

20 Q Do the departments, at least in some cases, Dean Alonso,
21 send formal letters or communications appointing students as
22 teaching fellows?

23 A Yes, they do.

24 MR. BRILL: I'd like to mark as exhibits 42, 43, 44 and 45
25 some sample letters of appointment that we have pulled out and

1 produced to the Petitioner. Just -- okay. For the record
2 we're marking 42 is a letter of appointment in the Department
3 of Art History and Archeology, 43 is an appointment letter in
4 the Department of English and Comparative Literature, 44 is I
5 believe, oh yes, in the History Department and 45 is an
6 appointment in the Department of Italian.

7 BY MR. BRILL:

8 Q Can you identify exhibits 42 through 45?

9 A Alright. 42 is a notification of appointment to a
10 graduate student as a teaching fellow in the Department of Art
11 History for 2014-15. 43 is the equivalent letter for the
12 Department of English and Comparative Literature. 44 the
13 equivalent letter for the Department of History and 45 for the
14 Department of Italian.

15 (Employer's E-42 through 45 identified)

16 Q And obviously the names have been redacted on these
17 letters.

18 A Yes.

19 MR. BRILL: I offer exhibits 42 through 45.

20 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Could I just have a minute? For some
21 reason 42, I -- no objection.

22 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted, 42 to 45.

23 (Employer's E-42 through 45 received in evidence)

24 BY MR. BRILL:

25 Q Calling your attention to 44 for a minute, Dean Alonso,

1 there is a -- this is the History Department letter, which is
2 rather terse I guess in comparison to some of the other
3 letters.

4 A Yes.

5 Q Each department, I take it, can tailor their own letter?

6 A And they do.

7 Q But there's a reference in the History Department letter
8 to students registering for a colloquia seminar in teaching,
9 G9990. Is that the type of -- well, actually the History
10 Department is not included on your list of --

11 A Yes. That was --

12 Q -- courses on exhibit 41, but there is -- so this is an
13 example of a seminar in teaching that does not provide credit
14 apparently.

15 A Yes, the fact is that this list is -- the exhibit 41 is
16 strictly a list of courses that are offered in departments that
17 entail credit, but there are several other ways in which
18 departments train their students and -- through workshops, and
19 colloquia, and practical means and so forth. So this is an
20 example of one such department where there is, concurrent with
21 the teaching fellow assignment, some kind of requirement to
22 participate in discussion -- pedagogical discussion having to
23 do with the course in question or the level of course in
24 question.

25 MR. BRILL: Can we go off the record?

1 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Sure. Off the record.

2 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken)

3 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: On the record.

4 Until Friday, 9:30. And Dean Alonso I will see you back
5 here at about 1:00 O'clock on Friday. Please do not discuss
6 your testimony with anybody during that time. Thank you.
7 We're off the record.

8 (Whereupon, at 12:57 p.m. the hearing in the above-entitled
9 matter was adjourned, to reconvene on Friday, April 24, 2015 at
10 9:30 a.m.)

C E R T I F I C A T E

This is to certify that the attached proceedings done before
the NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD REGION TWO

In the Matter of:

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY,

Employer,

And

GRADUATE WORKERS OF COLUMBIA GWC, UAW,

Petitioner.

Case No.: 02-RC-143012

Date: April 22, 2015

Place: New York, NY

Were held as therein appears, and that this is the original
transcript thereof for the files of the Board

Official Reporter

BURKE COURT REPORTING, LLC
1044 Route 23 North, Suite 206
Wayne, New Jersey 07470
(973) 692-0660