

BEFORE THE
NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD

In the Matter of:

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY,

Employer,

And

GRADUATE WORKERS OF COLUMBIA
GWC, UAW,

Petitioner.

Case No. 02-RC-143012

The above-entitled matter came on for hearing pursuant to Notice, before AUDREY EVEILLARD, Hearing Officer, at The National Labor Relations Board, Region Two, 26 Federal Plaza, Suite 3614, New York, New York, on Friday April 24, 2015, at 9:30 a.m.

BURKE COURT REPORTING, LLC
1044 Route 23 North, Suite 206
Wayne, New Jersey 07470
(973) 692-0660

A P P E A R A N C E S

1 On behalf of the Employer:

2

3 EDWARD A BRILL, ESQ.
4 MATTHEW D. BATASTINI, ESQ.
5 BERNARD M. PLUM, ESQ.
6 Proskauer Rose LLP
7 11 Times Square, 20th Fl.
8 New York, NY 10036-8299
9 212-969-3015

10

11 PATRICIA S. CATAPANO, ESQ.
12 Associate General Counsel
13 Office of The General Counsel
14 Columbia University
15 650 West 168th Street, Suite 239
16 New York, NY 10032

17

18 On Behalf of the Petitioner:

19

20 THOMAS W. MEIKLEJOHN, ESQ.
21 NICOLE M. ROTHGEB, ESQ.
22 Livingston, Adler, Pulda, Meiklejohn & Kelley, P.C.
23 537 Prospect Ave.
24 Hartford, CT 06105-2922
25 860-570-4639

26

1
2I N D E X

	<u>WITNESS</u>	<u>DIRECT</u>	<u>CROSS</u>	<u>REDIRECT</u>	<u>RECROSS</u>	<u>VOIR DIRE</u>
3						
4	Jana Wright	333	383	--	--	382
5	Carlos Alonso	408	444	--	--	420
6						

1		<u>E X H I B I T S</u>	
	<u>EXHIBIT NUMBER</u>	<u>IDENTIFIED</u>	<u>RECEIVED</u>
2	Employer's		
3	E-46	377	377
4	E-47	378	378
5	E-48	379	379
6	E-49	380	380
7	E-50	381	381
8	E-51	382	383
9	E-52	412	413
10	E-53 through 55	418	422
11	E-56	419	422
12	E-57	420	422
13	E-58	427	428
14	E-59 & 60	428	428
15	E-61 through 63	432	433
16	E-64	433	433
17	E-65	436	438
18	E-66 & 67	441	442
19			

1 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: So you just have to talk loud.

2 THE WITNESS: Okay.

3 MR. PLUM: Okay.

4 DIRECT EXAMINATION

5 BY MR. PLUM:

6 Q Could you -- good morning.

7 A Good morning.

8 Q Could you first give us a description of your educational
9 background and work history?

10 A Sure. I was a undergraduate and graduate student at the
11 University of Michigan in literature, art history and dance. I
12 began my professional career in Chicago at the Art Institute of
13 Chicago --

14 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Sorry. I'm trying to turn it
15 off.

16 THE WITNESS: -- shortly after graduate school and had a
17 variety of roles and served in both student affairs and
18 academic administration at the Art Institute. When I left in
19 2007 to come to Columbia I was the Vice President of Academic
20 Administration for the School of the Arts at the Art Institute.

21 BY MR. PLUM:

22 Q And what position did you come to at Columbia?

23 A I'm now the dean of Academic Administration for Columbia
24 University School of the Arts.

25 Q And you've been in that position since you came to

1 Columbia?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And could you give us a general description of the School
4 of the Arts?

5 A Certainly. The School of the Arts is both a graduate
6 professional School of the Arts that offers the Master of Fine
7 Arts in four disciplines, Film, Theater, Writing and Visual
8 Arts, and also offers undergraduate majors in three of those
9 disciplines, in Film Studies, Creative Writing and Visual Arts.
10 We also have a Master of Arts in film studies.

11 Q Okay. We're going to a little more about those different
12 programs, but could you first, if you would, describe the
13 mission of the School of the Arts?

14 A Sure. You know, the mission of the School of the Arts is
15 to create an environment that encourages the individual
16 development of each student, each artist in their field. The
17 goal is certainly to provide the experience and environment for
18 those students to develop a mastery of the concepts, and skills
19 and knowledge related to their discipline. It's important and
20 we strive to create an environment where the students also have
21 the opportunity to develop a fundamental skill that's required
22 of all artists, which is the ability to assess the success of
23 their own work. So the development of those critical
24 faculties; the ability to elicit not only the responses to
25 their own work, in a community of artists, but also to critique

1 the work of others is a very important part of the education.

2 Q So self-criticism and the ability to critique the work of
3 others?

4 A Yes, yes. I mean it's -- as you can imagine in the arts,
5 as one is making work it becomes very important at each stage
6 of the process to be able to assess the success of one's own
7 work as it evolves. So sort of a fundamental core principle of
8 pedagogy in the arts is developing students' ability to
9 critique their own work and to respond effectively and
10 meaningfully to the work of others.

11 Q About how many full time faculty are there at the School
12 of the Arts?

13 A We have about 70 full time faculty.

14 Q And I didn't ask you, so let's go back to this, to
15 describe your current job duties and responsibilities. What
16 does it mean to be in your role?

17 A To be a dean of academic -- I came with Dean Becker. We
18 had worked together for several years at the Art Institute of
19 Chicago. She is the dean of the school, the chief fundraiser,
20 the public figure.

21 I'm her deputy. So I'm the second in command. I oversee
22 all of the internal functions on the administrative and student
23 service side.

24 So admissions, financial aid, HR, budget and finance,
25 facilities. And I also oversee the review of faculty for

1 contract renewal and promotion. So it's a broad mandate.

2 Q And do your responsibilities include oversight of the
3 appointment of graduate teaching fellows and assistants?

4 A Yes.

5 Q And who -- and you report to the dean of the school?

6 A Yes. The -- I -- there are -- all of the staff in the
7 school report up to me eventually and I have direct reports are
8 the associate deans and the directors. Each of the four
9 divisions is overseen by a Director of Academic Administration,
10 each of whom reports to me. So they oversee, in each division,
11 the review and appointment process of student applications for
12 these appointments.

13 Q Now, you mentioned before some of the programs that are
14 offered at the School of the Arts, but could you just list for
15 us simply the different degrees that are offered and then we'll
16 talk a little bit about each one?

17 A Sure. So again there's four divisions; Film, Writing,
18 Theater and Visual arts. Each of the four divisions offers the
19 Master of Fine Arts, which is the terminal degree in the Fine
20 Arts. So as the PhD is the terminal degree in the scholarly
21 disciplines in the arts, the Master of Fine Arts is the
22 terminal degree and leads to teaching and other professional
23 opportunities across the industry. Each of the four divisions
24 offers several concentrations.

25 Q Okay. Before we get to that, the -- so you said one of

1 the degrees that's offered at the School of the Arts is the
2 Master of Fine Arts?

3 A It is the Master of Fine Arts in all four disciplines.

4 Q In all four disciplines.

5 A But then within each of those disciplines it breaks down
6 into subdisciplines.

7 Q Okay. Before we get to the subdisciplines, what are the
8 other degrees that are offered by the school?

9 A The Master of Arts in film studies.

10 Q Okay.

11 A And then we oversee the majors, the B.A. in Visual Arts,
12 Creative Writing and Film Studies.

13 Q And --

14 A Film Studies, Creative Writing and Visual Arts.

15 Q And are there any PhD students in the School of the Arts?

16 A Yes, we have our faculty participate in a small PhD
17 program in theater, but it is administered through the Graduate
18 School of Arts and Sciences. So we are -- I don't take -- I
19 have no responsibility to administer that program nor does the
20 School of the Arts offer that degree, but we have theater
21 faculty who participate in the teaching of PhD students.

22 Q So let's circle back to the Master of Fine Arts and --

23 A Okay.

24 Q -- let's talk about that a little bit in detail. First of
25 all, how many students are enrolled at any given time in the

1 MFA program?

2 A We have about between 750 and 800 MFA students. About
3 just under 550 of those, between 525 and 550 in a given year,
4 will be course taking students and the remaining students will
5 be what we call research arts students. So those are students
6 who have completed their coursework and will be working on
7 their thesis.

8 Q And you said there are four --

9 A That translates also, in terms of full time equivalent,
10 which many institutes talk about the full time equivalent or
11 FTE, there's about, you know, 550 FTEs about.

12 Q Okay. And you said there were four disciplines; Film,
13 Theater, Visual Arts and Writing?

14 A Uh-huh.

15 Q Okay. And who -- what type of person or student is a
16 typical candidate for the MFA?

17 A Master of Fine Arts students, I mean the most successful
18 applicants are those who come to us with an undergraduate
19 degree and who have had some experience. We -- very few of our
20 students come directly from the undergraduate program.
21 Typically they will have been making work, engaged in the field
22 in some way.

23 The average age of our students is around 26, 25-26. A
24 little bit older than the typical graduate population I think.
25 They are students who have developed a body of work typically

1 that can be assessed for its potential to be creative and
2 innovative.

3 So that a student in -- you know, who's applying for
4 instance for the writing program will have -- as part of their
5 application they will be submitting poems or narratives, works
6 of non-fiction and a committee of faculty will evaluate that
7 work. Some students come to us with books that have already
8 been published, collections of poems that have already been
9 published. You may have read in *The New York Times* about
10 Gregory Pardlo who just won the Pulitzer in poetry, although
11 he's a non-fiction student in the writing program. So some of
12 the students are quite accomplished, others are -- there's a --
13 it's a broad range.

14 Q So these are all practicing artists rather than scholars?

15 A Yes. To your point, yes.

16 Q No, that's fine.

17 A They are -- they're -- you know, they are passionate about
18 the making of work versus only studying the history and theory
19 of a discipline. However, it is very important for artists
20 also to be well-versed in the history and theory of their
21 discipline and to understand and be articulate about the work
22 that precedes their own. So there is an emphasis, you know,
23 not only in the making and the mastering the concepts, and
24 skills and techniques of their discipline, but also
25 understanding the history of their discipline and the cultural

1 context of the schools of thought related to their discipline
2 in the contemporary culture.

3 Q So before we delve into the different -- you know, the
4 four different disciplines separately, how would you describe
5 the typical progression of an MFA student? How long does it
6 take, and how much of it is class work and --

7 A It varies by division --

8 Q Okay.

9 A -- the four divisions. In the Visual Arts program it is
10 simply two years of course work and tutorial, and at the end of
11 the second year the student presents their thesis in a
12 professional exhibition, typically a museum-like setting for
13 the public, and they graduate that May. In the other -- in
14 Theater the students have two years of coursework and spend a
15 third year developing their thesis performance or production.
16 So if you're a director in Theater and graduating as an MFA
17 from the directing concentration, you will actually direct a
18 performance. We just finished the directing thesis
19 performances at the theater -- downtown theater, the Connelly
20 Theater, if you've been there.

21 The -- if you're a playwright you will have -- your new
22 play will be performed. This weekend they are going to be held
23 at the Signature Theatre, if you'd like to come to see some
24 great new plays. If you -- so in the third year, whether
25 you're a director, or playwright, producer, you are engaged in

1 the development of that thesis work. It takes an entire year
2 typically for work to be realized and presented to the public.

3 In the Writing program it is again two years of
4 coursework. Most students take a third year. Well, actually I
5 would say about half of the students in the MFA Writing program
6 do take a third year to complete their thesis.

7 Some take less time. So it's possible for them to
8 graduate say in October, the fall of their -- the fall of the
9 beginning of the third year. And a few graduate also at the
10 end of their second year. Just depends how long it takes them
11 to complete their thesis, which is a substantial collection of
12 either poems or a narrative. Many of them are working on a
13 manuscript for publication, in which case it typically takes
14 three years.

15 Then in Film it's the longest. The screenwriters -- we --
16 in Film you come in either to be a screenwriter, a director or
17 a creative producer or a writer/director. So you can be both.

18 Students typically take two years of coursework, minimally
19 a third year and most often a fourth year to actually produce a
20 film. And again, the thesis film is presented to the public in
21 the Columbia University Film Festival in New York and Los
22 Angeles. Oh, and -- yes. The Master of Fine Arts thesis
23 exhibition will be opening this Sunday in Long Island City.
24 It's really a fabulous exhibition held at the Fisher Landau
25 Center for the Arts (*sic*).

1 Q And typically what do the MFA students do after
2 graduation?

3 A Oh, a variety of things. Students, many of them begin
4 careers in teaching. But typically the first step might be an
5 adjunct teaching position. Many of them find other ways to
6 support themselves while they continue to try to write a
7 screenplay that someone decides they want to produce.

8 Many of them work in the industry in film, in a related
9 capacity. So they may be aspiring directors, but they're being
10 hired to work in a production company as an editor, as a
11 producer, as a location assistant. You know, there's -- it
12 takes a small village to make a film. So there are many rolls
13 in the industry that students are prepared for.

14 And the focus in the education of our students -- we have
15 many students who learn these roles as part of the production
16 life of the school. So we have many service positions that
17 students have an opportunity to learn how to run a film
18 festival, to produce a play, to be a stage manager for a play.
19 So there's -- you know, to make a work, to install an
20 exhibition, to actually make a film and even to publish, in the
21 publishing world there are many, many roles. And so students
22 often enter the industry related to their discipline in a role
23 other than the one they eventually aspire to. That make sense?

24 Q So let's turn, if we can now, to the appointments and
25 funding that are available for students -- MFA students in the

1 School of the Arts. And let's talk -- let's focus first on
2 Film or -- yeah, let's focus on Film and Visual Arts.

3 A Okay. In --

4 Q What --

5 A Yeah.

6 Q Go ahead.

7 A So --

8 Q What type of appointments and funding are available --

9 A Yeah.

10 Q -- in Film or Visual Arts?

11 A You know, we view teaching appointments in the School of
12 the Arts as the kind of capstone experience to their education.
13 So in Visual Arts every student is given the opportunity for an
14 academic appointment of one semester or two semesters to be a
15 teaching assistant. So in Visual Arts the role of a teaching
16 assistant is to be in the studio, in your discipline.

17 So if you are a photographer, or if you're a sculptor, or
18 if you're a painter, if you're a print maker, you're serving as
19 a teaching assistant for a studio class in your discipline.
20 You have the opportunity to help students in the development of
21 their own skills in the context of that studio class. But more
22 importantly you also have the opportunity to perfect your own
23 skills in that critique process that I described earlier, which
24 is so essential to the development of one's own work and in
25 your ability to mentor and help recognize the strengths and

1 weaknesses in someone else's work, which then helps you return
2 to the studio and look at your own work with that critical
3 ability.

4 So it's -- we have -- since Carol and I arrived in 2007
5 we've worked very hard to increase the number of opportunities
6 for students to have these, you know, very valuable learning
7 experiences. And so in -- as I said, in Visual Arts all the
8 students have that opportunity. They all --

9 Q And how many students are there in Visual Arts?

10 A 54.

11 Q 54. And all of them work as a teaching assistant?

12 A For one semester.

13 Q For one --

14 A And most of them have the opportunity to be a teaching
15 assistant in the second semester of their first year and the
16 first semester of their second year. So they actually have an
17 appointment for two semesters, but they'll be different
18 appointments. They'll have an opportunity to work in two
19 different studios, typically within the same discipline, unless
20 they're cross-disciplinary artists. There are some who are
21 both print makers and photographers. So our goal there would
22 be to give them an opportunity to teach -- serve as a teaching
23 assistant in the photography program and also in the print
24 making program.

25 Q So they're a teaching assistant in their own discipline?

1 A In their own discipline always.

2 Q And about how many students in Visual Arts are appointed
3 as a teaching assistant each semester?

4 A Each semester 54, because -- wait, now 20 is half that, I
5 guess. 27. No, it's 54.

6 Q 54?

7 A Yeah. Seems astonishing to me to be -- we're able to do
8 that, but we are, yeah. I wish we could do that in the other
9 disciplines. We don't have the same level of resources to be
10 able to do that for the others. So in --

11 Q Well, before we move on to the others, can you give us a
12 description? I mean you've talked about it a little, but if
13 you -- could you give us a more detailed description of what
14 the students actually do in these -- as teaching assistants in
15 the studio?

16 A In the studio?

17 Q In the studio.

18 A Certainly. A studio class will typically last for six
19 hours. There's one faculty member. Typically 15 to 20
20 students depending on the medium.

21 And the student who's selected to be a TA will have a, you
22 know, advanced competency if not mastery of the skills and use
23 of materials involved in that studio. So if it's lithography,
24 etching, photography, painting, the student will have worked
25 with those materials and understand the processes and the

1 methods used in the studio. And so, you know, in the arts the
2 instruction, unless it's a seminar -- and there are very few
3 seminars. Most of them are in the making.

4 You are -- there's a tutorial relationship going on, in
5 the context of a studio. So it's a lot of one on one dialogue
6 that precedes then the group critique. So as the faculty
7 member is rotating among the individuals in the studio, working
8 with each painter, working with each photographer, talking,
9 having in depth conversations about one's work, there is the
10 opportunity then for the teaching assistant to also circulate
11 and talk with the students about their work and to help them
12 through a problem, through a creative problem, through a
13 technical problem, to discuss the conceptual framework of their
14 work, to engage in a profound exchange of ideas about what the
15 artist is attempting to achieve. So it's -- and then to
16 participate, which is the -- I think the highest value for the
17 students in that group critique session.

18 So the -- you know, if you think about it, the evolution
19 of an artist in a Master of Fine Arts curriculum, they will
20 have been in the studio themselves as students or they will
21 have been in a writing workshop, which is a similar, you know,
22 a parallel situation for writers is the writing workshop, the
23 studio for the visual artist. So that the teaching is going on
24 both individually as you workshop a poem or you help an artist
25 with their painting there's a lot of one on one and then

1 there's the group critique.

2 So the TA has done that as a student and this is the
3 opportunity for them to begin to learn how to facilitate the
4 critique and to elicit the kind of response that is most
5 meaningful and helpful to the others in the studio. So that's
6 why we think of it as a capstone experience to their learning,
7 because it, you know --

8 Q And when you say capstone, so tell us how you think the TA
9 benefits from this experience.

10 A Well, it's what they have to learn to do themselves with
11 their own work back in their own studio and then again in many
12 cases for the public. I mean artists are expected to be able
13 to contextualize their work in the culture, to talk about the
14 ideas underlying their work, to be in a situation where they --
15 you know, they can talk effectively and meaningfully about
16 their work and their process. But even more importantly is
17 that internal ability to recognize, as the work evolves, where
18 it's most effective, when to stop when it's finished, what
19 needs work. And so, you know, they learn that. They develop
20 those skills as they're teaching. So --

21 Q And --

22 A I mean the fundamental idea of a school of art is it's a
23 community of artists engaged in this profound exchange and peer
24 engagement with each other's work. It's why the arts moved, I
25 think, from the studio into higher education. It's an

1 incredible experience to be able to be a part of a community of
2 artists and engage in that process collectively.

3 Q So in doing that they're working directly with the
4 faculty, the TAs?

5 A Oh, yeah. I mean if you think, the faculty member is
6 mentoring that student's ability. So the TA is watching the
7 faculty member, listening to the faculty member, in a sense
8 following the faculty member as they -- you know, you overhear,
9 you see what that faculty member -- how they elicit a response,
10 how they work with a student, the advice they give. So you're
11 able to observe and learn from the faculty member and you're --
12 you know, you're mentored by that faculty member, both in and
13 outside the classroom.

14 I mean the TA relationship with a faculty member is a very
15 special one, because they're talking about their approach to
16 teaching. You know, the pedagogy, the underlying art of
17 teaching, is also an art. So there's a lot of teaching that's
18 going on of the teaching assistant by the faculty member in
19 this setting. It's preparing them to be able to be brilliant
20 teachers hopefully too. Our faculty are brilliant teachers as
21 well as amazing practitioners. So --

22 Q And what kind of aid or support package do the teaching
23 assistants in Visual Arts receive?

24 A They have a tuition scholarship of \$4,300 and they also
25 have a stipend of \$2,616 --

1 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I'm sorry, \$2,616?

2 THE WITNESS: Well, the total -- they -- the total is --

3 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Just -- it's just that your voice tailed
4 off. It wasn't --

5 THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Yes, yes, 2,616. Sorry.

6 BY MR. PLUM:

7 Q So let's talk about the teaching assistants in Film. And
8 can you --

9 A Yeah. So this is a bit different because the teaching
10 assistants in Film are work -- are assisting the faculty who
11 are teaching the larger lectures and larger seminars in the
12 history, and theory and criticism of film. And the reason this
13 is so important for the film maker is that it's very important,
14 particular if a writer, director or producer is going to pitch
15 their film, to know -- to understand the history of what
16 precedes their own work. You have to know the history of film
17 really.

18 And so to work in the industry you have to be familiar
19 with the work that's been produced in film, both in the
20 independent film world as well as in the Hollywood studios and
21 around the globe now. Globally, the -- you know, we spend -- a
22 great deal of our curriculum is focused not only on American
23 cinema, but on cinema around the globe. So students who have
24 the opportunity to serve as TAs, in the lectures that the
25 faculty are giving the history and theory of film, lead

1 discussion sections with the students, typically following a
2 screening and lecture.

3 So again, the teaching assistant has the opportunity to
4 work with the faculty member in the development of the
5 syllabus, the course content. They have an opportunity to
6 learn how to construct a course. And they also learn how to
7 lead discussion sections in small groups.

8 So typically you'll have a large screening, and lecture,
9 and then they'll be break out discussions and the TA will have
10 an opportunity to lead those discussions. And then -- you
11 know, under the supervision obviously of the faculty member.
12 They're learning how to teach.

13 Q And how many film students are given the opportunity to be
14 TAs?

15 A Just under 30 typically. 25 to 30.

16 Q And --

17 A It will vary in part because of the -- you know, the
18 number of classes every semester varies slightly.

19 Q And how long are the appointments?

20 A For a semester.

21 Q One semester?

22 A Only a semester. We do -- I mean it's very rarely a
23 student will have the opportunity to teach for more than one
24 course. Maybe at the most two semesters, but that's very rare.
25 The far majority, I mean probably 90%-95% are one semester

1 only.

2 Q And what's the financial aid or support package that are -
3 - that's given?

4 A It's the same. The TA -- the teaching assistants across
5 all four divisions --

6 Q Are the same?

7 A -- receive the same. Uh-huh.

8 Q And in the Film Department where not everybody gets the
9 opportunity, how are the students selected for TA positions?

10 A They apply. They fill out an application with a cover
11 letter. They -- you know, they describe their own experience
12 and why they think they can be a valuable TA. Faculty then
13 review the applications.

14 They certainly look at where the student is in their own
15 coursework. So the students who are -- have completed two or
16 more courses in the history and theory related to the course
17 the faculty member may be teaching will be, you know, more
18 qualified to be a teaching assistant for that particular
19 course. So, you know, it's --

20 Q Are there TAs in any of the disciplines of than Film and
21 Visual Arts?

22 A No.

23 Q Now, there are also preceptors in Film, correct?

24 A Yes, the preceptors are Master of Fine Arts students in
25 directing and screenwriting who have finished their coursework

1 and are in their research arts year, typically in their third
2 year, fourth year. And they have the opportunity to lead a lab
3 in screenwriting, or a lab in fiction film making or non-
4 fiction film making for undergraduate seniors. So these are --
5 the B.A. in Film Studies is offered -- is the major at the
6 undergraduate level. And it is primarily, almost exclusively
7 in the history, theory and criticism of film. But in the
8 senior year they have the opportunity to make a film or to
9 write a screenplay.

10 Q This is the undergraduates --

11 A The undergraduates.

12 Q Right.

13 A And so our Master of Fine Arts students who are
14 screenwriters or directors have the opportunity to teach that
15 lab. And, you know, they're highly sought after obviously,
16 because it's a wonderful opportunity for them to, you know,
17 perfect their own abilities to -- you know, to write, and to
18 direct and to critique the work of young undergraduates who are
19 --

20 Q And so these preceptors are all film students?

21 A They're all Master of Fine Arts students. They will have
22 been selected by the Director of Undergraduate Studies, a
23 member of our full time faculty, who will select the best
24 applicants from their perspective and supervise them quite
25 intensely. So the -- you know, they prepare a syllabus for the

1 Director of Undergraduate Studies' review. They have frequent
2 meetings with the Director of Undergraduate Studies to talk
3 about how the class is going.

4 And, you know, they're mentored, because it's their own
5 class. They're in the class without a master teacher. They're
6 in -- they're teaching the lab. It's their -- it's --

7 Q Now, you've characterized this as a wonderful opportunity
8 for the film students.

9 A Oh, yeah.

10 Q Why is that?

11 A They seek -- well, because, you know, again, the
12 screenwriting curriculum is based around the workshop
13 experience. You're writing a screenplay, you're bringing that
14 screenplay to the workshop as a Master of Fine Arts student
15 with other Master of Fine Arts students, all of whom are
16 helping you perfect that screenplay, helping you realize and
17 make the most compelling narrative that it can be. And you've
18 been doing that as a student among your peers.

19 This is an opportunity for you then to lead and facilitate
20 a workshop session. So it's again, you know, that notion of
21 the capstone experience. You're leading rather than just
22 participating in something that is fundamental to your own
23 process.

24 Q So is this another example of criticizing others helps
25 facilitate your self-critical ability?

- 1 A Oh yeah, yeah.
- 2 Q And how many students -- how many film students are
3 appointed as preceptors each semester about?
- 4 A Think it's 11. A small number.
- 5 Q Out of how many film students? I'm not sure I asked you,
6 how many film students are there?
- 7 A Let's see. In Film there's around 250.
- 8 Q And of those 10 are selected as preceptors?
- 9 A Something like that, yeah.
- 10 Q Or 11, I think you said?
- 11 A Yeah. But, you know, again it will vary. In other words
12 if -- depending on the undergraduate number of majors, the
13 number of seniors we create these labs. You know, it's all
14 based on. So it changes, it fluctuates, but --
- 15 Q And how long is the typical appointment?
- 16 A A semester.
- 17 Q A semester?
- 18 A Yeah.
- 19 Q Do any of them get the opportunity --
- 20 A It's a short, you know, 15 weeks.
- 21 Q Any of them get the opportunity to do it more than once?
- 22 A I don't believe so. It may have happened, but again it
23 would be very rare. I really don't think so. If someone got
24 sick or, you know, I mean it would be an unusual situation.
- 25 Q And what kind of financial aid package or support --

1 A It's the same as the TA.

2 Q Same as the TAs.

3 A Because it's a lab. You know, the lab has a little bit
4 less status than -- you know, so a TA in a three credit hour
5 course -- core course, you know, and what a preceptor does in
6 the lab, they're viewed in a similar way. Even though the
7 preceptor is in there alone, they're both heavily supervised.

8 Q Now, in addition to TAs and preceptors are there also
9 teaching fellows? Not -- in the school?

10 A I'm sorry?

11 Q Are there also teaching fellows? Teaching fellowships
12 that are awarded to MFA students?

13 A Yes.

14 Q Okay.

15 A Wait. I'm sorry. Say that again.

16 Q I said in addition to the TAs and preceptors --

17 A Yes.

18 Q -- are there also teaching fellows?

19 A Oh, yes, teaching fellows in Writing.

20 Q Reaching fellows --

21 A In the Writing Division.

22 Q Okay. So let's talk about those.

23 A Yeah. These did not exist prior to 2008 I believe. So
24 Dean Becker and I worked with the college to establish these
25 teaching fellow positions in Writing. These are opportunities

1 for writing students to teach beginning fiction, beginning
2 poetry and beginning non-fiction workshops to the undergraduate
3 freshmen and sophomores.

4 Q Okay. Now is this -- are you talking about the
5 undergraduate Writing program or the undergraduate Creative
6 Writing Class?

7 A Undergraduate Creative Writing.

8 Q Okay.

9 A Yes.

10 Q So --

11 A The undergraduate Creative Writing is our program in the
12 School of the Arts that is for undergraduates in Creative
13 Writing. The other -- what's called the Undergraduate Writing
14 Program for Expository Writing is overseen by the Graduate
15 School of Arts and Sciences and is part of the core curriculum.

16 Q Okay. So let's talk first about the undergraduate
17 Creative Writing Program. You said that was created around
18 2000 --

19 A 2008-2009, yeah.

20 Q The teaching fellowship?

21 A Teaching fellows, yes.

22 Q And about how many students are selected to work in the
23 Creative Writing teaching fellowship every semester?

24 A Every semester, I believe it's seven and seven is around
25 14 for the year. Believe that's right.

1 Q 14 for the year?

2 A Yeah, think that's right.

3 Q And what type of MFA students are selected for this
4 opportunity?

5 A They will be students who are in their research arts,
6 their third year. They will have completed their coursework.

7 Q So these --

8 A They apply for it in the spring of their second year.

9 Q So these are writing students who are in the Writing
10 Division of the MFA?

11 A Yes, they are MFA students in the Writing Division in
12 their third year of student, when -- in the fall when they
13 begin teaching.

14 Q And what do they do? What does their appointment entail?

15 A They are teaching their own undergraduate class. It's a
16 beginning workshop. So again, it's -- you know the Master of
17 Fine Arts program is built around this fundamental idea I've
18 discussed now, which is the writing workshop.

19 And the undergraduate major has a similar structure. The
20 writing workshop is a fundamental part of the curriculum. So
21 you have beginning workshops in fiction, non-fiction or poetry
22 and then as your -- as you move from freshman, to sophomore, to
23 junior to senior, if you're an undergraduate Creative Writing
24 major you'll have then intermediate and advanced workshops in
25 your genre and in possibly cross genre work.

1 So the MFA student teaches only the beginning workshop.
2 And they are selected by the Director of Undergraduate Studies
3 and the concentration heads in each of those three disciplines.
4 And they develop a syllabus, and select reading texts and work
5 out the lesson plan for the year. That's reviewed by the head
6 of the concentration and Director of Undergraduate Studies.
7 One or both.

8 Q And this may be obviously, but what actually happens in
9 the workshop? What does the teaching fellow do with the
10 undergraduates?

11 A They are -- each student who participates in a writing
12 workshop brings their work to the workshop. So if it's a
13 poetry workshop they're bringing their poems to the workshop.
14 Each student -- the -- everyone in the workshop reads each
15 other's work.

16 Typically, they are -- you know, they're discussing the
17 work, they're critiquing the work. Some of them are asked to
18 write notes. You know, to actually take that critique into a
19 written form, of each other's work.

20 And they're also reading extensively outside texts as well
21 that set the context. I mean typically in a writing workshop
22 you're also reading as you would in a literature class, but the
23 analysis of the text is about the craft of writing, about the
24 process, about the choices that poet, or novelist or essayist
25 has made. So you're getting into the craft of the writing.

1 It's a different kind of analysis and a different kind of
2 approach to the text than a literature professor would
3 typically -- because you're teaching writers how to write.

4 Q And is this -- would you also describe this experience as
5 the capstone of a Writing MFA?

6 A Oh, sure. Yeah, because again you're -- you know, you're
7 having the opportunity to -- now you've been doing it for two
8 years yourself, in the context of peer interaction. And so now
9 you have the opportunity to -- you know, to exercise that
10 critical faculty.

11 And, you know, I oversee the review process of faculty for
12 promotion and renewed contract and they write about their
13 approach to teaching, their pedagogy and their professional
14 practice. And most of them choose to write about -- rather
15 than writing their pedagogical statement and then their
16 statement about their professional activities, most of them
17 write a statement that is combined, because the practice for
18 those who are artist teachers, their own practice is informed
19 deeply by their teaching. It's an iterative process for many
20 of them, for most of them.

21 Q You mentioned that this program for having teaching
22 fellows in the undergraduate Creative Writing program didn't
23 exist before 2008.

24 A Right.

25 Q And that you were involved in its creation. Could you

1 describe that?

2 A Well, it was a matter of meeting with the Associate Dean
3 of the college and the head of our Writing program. And Carol
4 and I -- Dean Becker and I, you know, were concerned that
5 students would be graduating without this capstone experience
6 as we see it. And that we wanted to create both the
7 opportunity to help them financially, but also to provide them
8 with this really important experience.

9 And the -- you know, the college, you know, had to be
10 convinced that there would be the same rigor and the same
11 excellence as if a full time member of our faculty were
12 teaching it. There was concern would the students be ready to
13 do that? And so we developed this -- you know, this way of
14 selection, and supervision and mentoring and it's turned out to
15 be quite successful for everybody. It's worked well.

16 Q And is the financial aid package the same here too or is
17 it --

18 A It's a little bit -- you know, it's a little bit better
19 than the TA. So rather than the total compensation being just
20 over 6,000, it's 10,000. So it's 5,000 in stipend and 5,000 in
21 scholarship. So we were able to make it a little bit better
22 than the TA, because it's a higher -- you know, more is
23 expected. They're teaching solo under supervision, but still
24 it's their own workshop.

25 Q And long are these appointments as Creative Writing --

1 A Just a semester.

2 Q Just one semester. Had any of them gotten the opportunity
3 to work at this for a second semester?

4 A No. I know of one who substituted when an illness -- so
5 that was her second opportunity, but it wasn't for a full
6 semester and it was because someone else became ill.

7 Q So sticking with the MFA appointments, can you describe
8 for us the MFA teaching fellows, the MFA students who work as
9 teaching fellows in the undergraduate Writing program?

10 A Okay. It's so confusing. The terminology is very
11 confusing.

12 Q Right. Just so we're clear one is --

13 A Yes. The understand Writing program as it's called is not
14 --

15 Q Could you -- because you go forward, because I want to
16 make sure the record is clear on this, could you distinguish
17 between the undergraduate Creative Writing program you just
18 described --

19 A Yes.

20 Q -- and the undergraduate Writing program --

21 A Right.

22 Q -- that you're about to describe?

23 A Yes. The undergraduate Writing program is simply the
24 designation of the fact that every freshman at Columbia College
25 (*sic*) is required to take one course in expository writing

1 where they learn how to write an excellent paper -- research
2 paper. For expository writing the form is very different.

3 Q That's part of the core curriculum?

4 A And it's part the core curriculum of the college. And
5 everyone -- every student is required to take it. The
6 undergraduate Creative Writing curriculum is a major and it's
7 creative writing. It's poetry, fiction and non-fiction. It's
8 not expository writing. And it's a major.

9 So you take a sequence of courses over four years that
10 lead to a mastery or an advanced competency at the
11 undergraduate level in writing a poem or writing an essay -- a
12 non-fiction essay. Creative non-fiction versus expository
13 writing. This is just one course. So it's called the
14 undergraduate Writing program, but it's just one course.

15 Q Okay. So the TA -- the TFs or the teaching fellows that
16 you described a little while ago --

17 A They're teaching Creative Writing --

18 Q They're teaching --

19 A -- workshops.

20 Q -- Creative Writing workshops. The first level of
21 Creative --

22 A Yes.

23 Q -- Writing?

24 A Beginning workshops.

25 Q And now we're going to talk about the teaching fellows who

1 teach in the core curriculum --

2 A Yes, yes.

3 Q -- course called --

4 A Yes. Those are -- we do not have all that much to do with
5 the undergraduate Writing program. It's simply that our MFA
6 students are given the opportunity to apply to teach expository
7 writing. They're selected by faculty in the Graduate School of
8 Arts and Sciences. They're trained and supervised to teach
9 those classes by the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences.

10 So it's an opportunity that's open to our students to
11 apply for those positions. And over 30 of our students are
12 selected typically every year to teach in that program. And
13 the compensation is -- you know, they are provided a
14 scholarship as well as a stipend.

15 And the amount of the scholarship varies because their
16 tuition varies, but it provides tuition remission up to a
17 certain amount. The reason it's confusing is if you are still
18 a course taking student your tuition is higher than if you're a
19 research arts tuition. If you're chosen to teach in the
20 undergraduate Writing program, the Graduate School of Arts and
21 Sciences will cover that tuition charge plus provide you with
22 the stipend and scholarship.

23 Q So are all of the 30 students -- MFA students who are
24 selected for this, are they all in the Writing division of the
25 School of the Arts?

1 A Actually, no. Most of them, but occasionally a student in
2 Film or Theater has been selected, because they are excellent
3 writers.

4 Q Okay.

5 A Keep in mind that in Film and in Theater there are
6 playwrights, screenwriters, you know? They're writing all the
7 time. So they're very familiar with the form.

8 Q And do you --

9 A And some of them are also -- you know, have had extensive
10 undergraduate experience or even undergraduate and graduate
11 experience writing in the expository form as well.

12 Q Do you have a general understanding of the role played by
13 the teaching fellows in the undergraduate program, what they
14 do?

15 A Certainly. I mean in the sense that I understand the
16 expectations that the college has that every college --
17 Columbia College (*sic*) undergraduate will be able to write a
18 well-formed and carefully constructed research and analytical
19 paper. So I understand in principle what the goal is, and I've
20 talked to a few of the students who have been teaching the
21 class and my daughter also took the class.

22 Q So --

23 A I know it from her perspective.

24 Q So would it be fair to say that these teaching fellows in
25 the undergraduate Writing program are critiquing the work of

1 the students?

2 A Oh --

3 Q The writing of the students?

4 A -- absolutely. I mean the -- you know, the writers, you
5 know, if you think of the MFA students in fiction, non-fiction
6 and poetry plus the playwrights and the screenwriters, this
7 huge number of writers in the School of the Arts in one form or
8 the other and most writers make their living working in many
9 forms of writing. Many do. And some of them are -- become
10 known.

11 I mean for instance Gregory, you know, Pardlo is, you
12 know, a non-fiction poet, Pulitzer prize winning poet. Gregory
13 -- Gary Shteyngart on our faculty, Christopher Nefecty (ph),
14 they're writing teleplays, novels, memoir, travel writing and
15 successful novelists. Christopher is a novelist and a poet.

16 So -- and the non-fiction form is increasingly -- whether
17 in, you know, memoir, essay, you know, more in the creative
18 non-fiction or straight non-fiction biography for example. You
19 know, writers have -- you know, language is the tool. And so
20 the ability to help an undergraduate freshman write a good
21 expository paper is still helping that writer get inside the
22 process and be a better writer themselves.

23 Q How long are appointments as undergraduate writing
24 teaching fellows? How long are those appointments?

25 A They are for two years actually. And so typically our

1 students, if they are selected, change from -- they reduce
2 their course load, because of the intensive nature of the
3 expectations and training.

4 Q So in addition to the MFA students, you also, in the
5 School of the Arts, have the Masters students -- the terminal
6 Masters degree students?

7 A Yes.

8 Q And can you describe that degree program, please?

9 A Yes. The MA in Film Studies is what is called -- you
10 know, known as a Master of Arts only. In other words, it is
11 not a Master of Arts that is part of a PhD program. But it
12 prepares students to go on to a PhD program and many of them
13 do. Many of our Master of Arts students have been accepted to
14 the best PhD programs around the country. So it can make you a
15 more competitive PhD applicant.

16 But also they go on, you know, to have aspirations to be
17 curators of film festivals, or to write criticism -- film
18 criticism. So this variety of reasons why students would come
19 for a year and a semester only to study with our Film faculty
20 in the history and theory and criticism of film.

21 Q So this is a three semester program --

22 A Uh-huh.

23 Q -- the Master of Film Studies? And is it all course work?

24 A It's course work for the first two semesters and the final
25 semester they're in a pro seminar and working on their thesis.

1 Q And do any of these Master of Film Studies have any kind
2 of appointment -- teaching appointment?

3 A A couple of them typically are selected to be TAs or a
4 research fellow.

5 Q When you say a couple, is it --

6 A Like two or three out of -- there's only -- you know,
7 typically around 15 to 17 students are admitted each year. And
8 just, you know, two or three maximum would be offered the
9 opportunity to be a TA.

10 Q And what kind of function do they serve as a TA? What do
11 they --

12 A The same I -- as I described earlier; they would be a TA
13 in a lecture course that typically had the opportunity to lead
14 their own discussion sections and working with the faculty
15 member in the execution of the course.

16 Q And would it be a -- would they -- excuse me. Would the
17 course be in their discipline, in the Masters student's
18 discipline?

19 A Yes. I mean the history, and theory and criticism
20 faculty, you know, the film scholars all teach the -- in the MA
21 program, as well as teaching the MFA students and the
22 undergraduates in the history, theory and criticism of film.
23 So they're teaching -- one faculty body teaching all three
24 levels. And so the TAs are -- you know, typically have
25 experience in -- you know, in -- related to the focus of that

1 course. So if it's about Asian cinema, they probably -- they
2 may have some experience and some knowledge of Asian cinema.

3 Q And how long are these appointments?

4 A Not always, but -- a semester.

5 Q Just one semester?

6 A Typically.

7 Q And there's also, in addition to the MFA and the --

8 A Occasionally -- actually, occasionally the student -- the
9 incoming MA student might be given the opportunity to do it
10 twice, actually. There have been a couple who have been told
11 they will have that opportunity each semester.

12 Q Each of the first two semesters?

13 A Yeah.

14 Q And when you say occasionally, is that --

15 A It -- yeah, it will depend on their -- you know, their
16 profile and also in some cases the level of financial support
17 we're trying to provide. This is all part of our financial aid
18 program. Right? You understand that? This is a major means
19 of support that we provide our students.

20 Q And you said -- I think you testified as to how many of
21 these MA Film students get teaching assistant appointments. It
22 was just a few I think --

23 A In the MA, yes.

24 Q In the MA in Film Studies?

25 A Just -- yeah, just a few students who are admitted would

1 be told they will also have the opportunity to TA. It's such a
2 short program that they're selected as part of that admission
3 process. So when they're offered admission, they're told.
4 Typically one or two. You know, two, maybe three, but mostly
5 two, that they'll have the opportunity to teach or be a
6 research fellow -- and/or be a research fellow.

7 Q So in addition to the MFA and the MA in Film Studies
8 there's -- there is also a PhD in Theater that's part of the
9 School of the Arts or it's --

10 A We offer it. I mean our faculty are engaged in the PhD --
11 in teaching the PhD program, but the PA -- we -- the school
12 does not confer the PhD degree. The PhD is conferred by the
13 school -- by the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences. And the
14 program is administered by the English department -- English
15 and Comparative Literature, because that's where the dramatic
16 literature faculty at Columbia are based.

17 We have really just two theater historians on our faculty.
18 One is a Joint appointment with Barnard and the other one. So
19 we just have -- where we have a critical number of historians,
20 and theorists and critics in Film, those related to the
21 discipline of Theater are in the department of English and
22 Comparative Literature.

23 Q How many --

24 A So they're not in the School of the Arts.

25 Q They're not in the school? The faculty are not in the

1 School of the Arts?

2 A Correct.

3 Q And how many students are there in the PhD program in this

4 --

5 A Typically it's a seven year trajectory. You're admitting

6 maybe three a year. So total would be around 20-21.

7 Q And how long does it typically take to get a degree?

8 A A PhD?

9 Q Uh-huh.

10 A Seven years.

11 Q Seven years. And whatever appointments these PhD students

12 receive are administered by the Graduate School?

13 A Yeah. Dean Alonso. They would fall under the

14 administration and supervision of the Graduate School of Arts

15 and Sciences. I will mention we also have a joint degree with

16 the Law School and our Theater program for creative producing

17 and theater management, but it's, you know, maybe only one

18 student every third year, because you're admitted to the Law

19 School separately and the School of the Arts separately and

20 then you'll -- you know, you'll follow a -- you know, a

21 curriculum that's coordinated and offered by the Law School and

22 the Theater program. But it's very small. Very few students

23 choose the dual degree program.

24 Q So it's just one student ever few years?

25 A (No audible answer)

1 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Yes?

2 THE WITNESS: Yes.

3 MR. PLUM: Okay. Yeah. Can we take a five minute break?

4 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Sure.

5 THE WITNESS: That'd be great.

6 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Off the record.

7 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken)

8 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: On the record.

9 BY MR. PLUM:

10 Q So you made a reference earlier to what I think you
11 referred to service positions that are offered or applied for
12 by MFA students. Could you talk about those a little bit,
13 please?

14 A Sure. As you can imagine, it takes, as I -- I think I
15 mentioned this earlier, many people to produce a film festival,
16 mount an exhibition, produce a play. So there are positions
17 that we think of as co-curricular positions, which is why we
18 call them service positions. In a community of artists
19 everybody has to pitch in at some level to sustain such an
20 active agenda of exhibitions, and festivals, and screenings and
21 readings for the public. So that's one aspect.

22 The other aspect of service positions are students who
23 serve as monitors in our technical facilities. So, you know,
24 the lab monitors. So they're typically students who have
25 skills in editing, photo processing, print making, wood and

1 metal shop.

2 If you're a sculptor, you know, you're using machinery to
3 make your sculpture. You become adept and you can serve as a
4 monitor in the sculpture shop, and the metal shop and the
5 ceramics facility. And, you know, so many of the service
6 positions are in those more general capacities.

7 And so those are the vast majority. Then there are also
8 service positions that relate to the helping a concentration
9 director, a faculty member who's overseeing the Directing
10 program, the Playwriting program, the Theater Management
11 program. Each of the concentration directors have, you know,
12 typically a student who helps them with whatever is going on
13 that day in that concentration. So it could be a variety of
14 duties that are quasi-administrative in nature or activities-
15 based.

16 The Writing program has many, many service positions that
17 are events-based, because of the number of events that they
18 have. These typically take the form of craft talks, and
19 readings and gatherings.

20 There are students involved in a few other areas of the
21 school such as doing alumni networking, helping our
22 communications office that promotes the public programs of the
23 school. Again, one of the functions that has to go on
24 consistently, and as strategically and brilliantly as possible
25 is to build audience, which artists have to do. You have to

1 learn how to build audience for their own work.

2 So we have students who are also working in social media
3 networking, building audience for the theater performances. I
4 mentioned earlier for the exhibitions. You know, they may be
5 working for the communications office. They -- we have a
6 fellow from each office -- from each division who works with
7 our Director of Communications. So those kinds of service
8 positions --

9 Q How many students -- how many MFA students work -- serve
10 in these positions?

11 A There are over 300 service positions in the School of the
12 Arts.

13 Q And how long do the students perform those functions?

14 A You know, they range from five hours to 15 hours a week.
15 They are typically for a semester. But the work isn't
16 consistent each week in many of these roles, because the nature
17 of our activity.

18 So, you know, to launch a film festival takes a certain
19 amount of planning. But when the festival is going on -- so
20 rather than working, you know, five to eight hours or 15 hours
21 a week, you know, when the film festival is on you will devote
22 a lot of time during that festival period. So for instance the
23 film festival will open at the Walter Reade Theater at Lincoln
24 Center -- so -- in May and then it goes to LA. So these
25 students have been heavily involved, but will become even more

1 heavily involved that first week of May when the festival is up
2 and running.

3 Q So the students who work for the film festival are Film
4 students?

5 A Oh, yes.

6 Q And the students who --

7 A Oh, yes. And there's a learning curve there too. So if
8 you volunteer -- because not even with over 300 service
9 positions in the school, it's not enough to actually do the
10 work involved in making all this happen. So you also
11 volunteer.

12 So when you're a first year student you volunteer as a
13 film festival volunteer so that you'll be selected for a
14 service position the following year. You know, so there's a
15 whole sort of -- if you become active and volunteer for these
16 roles to help out in making these things happen, you're more
17 likely then to be selected to be a -- for a service position,
18 as one example.

19 Q Uh-huh.

20 A The -- in Theater they could be -- it could be helping
21 with the prop shop, the costume shop, stage managing other
22 people's productions, helping marketing, you know? So it's
23 again they're helping each other really --

24 Q And you said that these appointments for these positions
25 are typically a semester?

1 A Yes, but I mean what happens -- there's -- we try to scale
2 -- we try to have -- we try to scale these opportunities in
3 relation to their time, and understanding and challenge of
4 making their own work. So for instance in the first year in
5 the Film program, students do not have service positions,
6 because frankly that first year they don't have time to eat,
7 you know? It's -- they wouldn't have time to fit a service
8 position into the curriculum.

9 And so they only have the opportunity to have a service
10 position in the second year, when they're acclimated, when
11 they've made their first three to five minute film, they've
12 finished their eight to 12 minute film over the summer and, you
13 know, they begin to focus on their thesis work, which is a
14 longer trajectory so that there's time to fit in a service
15 position. So -- and that's different for each division. When
16 those service positions become available, how many hours a week
17 we allow the students to assume those positions varies
18 depending on the trajectory of their studies in each division.

19 Q But for most students it's a one semester appointment?

20 A It's always a one semester appointment, but you can -- you
21 might have a different service -- I mean a service position and
22 some hold two service positions in their third year and fourth
23 year. They have more time. So they can be a film festival
24 fellow and they could also be working as a DMC monitor --
25 sorry, Digital Media Center monitor, which is our production

1 lab in film making, post-production lab.

2 Q And how -- what kind of support or financial aid goes out
3 of these service --

4 A The service positions, you know, are typically -- you
5 know, we -- the students record their hours and it's about \$20
6 an hour.

7 Q Uh-huh. So they're paid on an hourly basis?

8 A Yeah.

9 Q And are these instructional appointments?

10 A No.

11 Q The service positions?

12 A Well, instructional appointments, we think of them as co-
13 curricular. They're not on academic appointment. No, they are
14 not. They're not in the classroom, they're not teaching.

15 It's different. That's why we distinguish, keep them
16 quite separate. We talk about them separately. Students
17 understand the difference.

18 Q And are they on the casual payroll? Is that how they're
19 treated?

20 A Yeah.

21 Q I wonder if you could take a look at some documents for
22 me? I think we're up to exhibit --

23 MS. ROTHGEB: 46.

24 MR. PLUM: 46.

25 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: I left the exhibits in the

1 other room.

2 MR. PLUM: What's that?

3 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: I left the exhibits in the
4 other room, so I wouldn't know.

5 MS. ROTHGEB: 46.

6 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Bless you. You can have this
7 one. Go ahead.

8 THE WITNESS: Oh, you want this one?

9 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Uh-huh --

10 MR. PLUM: Okay. The court reporter has handed you a
11 document that we've marked as exhibit 46, right?

12 THE WITNESS: Yes.

13 BY MR. PLUM:

14 Q Could you just tell us what the document is?

15 A Yes. This is from our website and it describes to
16 prospective students the financial aid opportunities,
17 scholarships and fellowships.

18 (Employer's E-46 identified)

19 MR. PLUM: I'd like to have this admitted into evidence.

20 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Any objections?

21 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

22 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

23 (Employer's E-46 received in evidence)

24 MR. PLUM: Okay. Let's see if you can mark this exhibit
25 47.

1 BY MR. PLUM:

2 Q So the court reporter has just given you the document
3 marked as exhibit 47.

4 A Uh-huh.

5 Q If you could tell us what that is?

6 A Yeah. This is describing the teaching assistant positions
7 in the Film division. And I'm sure it's probably taken from
8 our -- from the film wiki website.

9 (Employer's E-47 identified)

10 MR. BRILL: I'd like to move exhibit 47 into evidence.

11 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: No objection?

12 THE WITNESS: Also describes the preceptor positions.

13 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It does.

14 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

15 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

16 (Employer's E-47 received in evidence)

17 MR. PLUM: Okay. And now we're going to mark this
18 document as exhibit 48. Respondent's (*sic*) exhibit 48. Hold
19 on. Do you need a minute?

20 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I just mixed it up with --

21 MS. ROTHGEB: Yes.

22 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: -- another document. Yes, I need one
23 minute.

24 THE WITNESS: This is also from the same --

25 MR. PLUM: Just one second.

1 THE WITNESS: Oh.

2 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: That's okay. I can --

3 BY MR. PLUM:

4 Q Okay. So the court reporter has given you a document
5 that's marked as Respondent's (*sic*) exhibit 48. Can you tell
6 us do you know what this is?

7 A Yes. This is the teaching assistant application in Film
8 and given to students, available to them typically on the film
9 wiki.

10 (Employer's E-48 identified)

11 MR. PLUM: I'd like to have exhibit 48 into evidence.

12 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: There's no objection?

13 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Just a moment, please.

14 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Oh.

15 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

16 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

17 (Employer's E-48 received in evidence)

18 MR. PLUM: This is a document that says Visual Arts MFA
19 handbook, which we're going to mark as exhibit 49.

20 BY MR. PLUM:

21 Q So the court reporter is giving you exhibit --
22 Respondent's (*sic*) exhibit 49. Do you know what that is?

23 A It's from the MFA Visual Arts handbook. I'm only laughing
24 because it's clearly -- so clearly marked. So this is given to
25 all MA students --

1 (Employer's E-49 identified)

2 Q It's given to all --

3 A -- in Visual Arts.

4 Q -- entering students --

5 A In Visual Arts.

6 MR. PLUM: I'd like to have exhibit 49 in evidence.

7 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I have no objection. Could we get the --

8 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: I'm sorry?

9 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I said -- is the whole thing available
10 online?

11 BY MR. PLUM:

12 Q Is the whole thing available online?

13 A Not online I don't believe.

14 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Can we at some point be supplied with the
15 complete document?

16 MR. PLUM: I'm sorry?

17 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: At some point could we be provided with
18 the complete document?

19 MR. PLUM: Sure.

20 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Okay. With --

21 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: So it's admitted, right? No
22 objections?

23 (Employer's E-49 received in evidence)

24 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: There's no objection with the
25 understanding that we will receive the complete document at

1 some point.

2 BY MR. PLUM:

3 Q Okay. And now we're going to give you or hand out the
4 document that's going to be marked as Respondent's (*sic*)
5 exhibit 50. This one has the title preceptor application.

6 A It would be again from the Film division on the wiki.
7 Yes, it's the application.

8 (Employer's E-50 identified)

9 Q This is the application for preceptor --

10 A In Film.

11 Q -- in Film?

12 MR. PLUM: I'd like to move exhibit 50 into evidence.

13 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

14 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

15 (Employer's E-50 received in evidence)

16

17 MR. PLUM: And lastly Respondent's (*sic*) exhibit 51.

18 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Or Employer's 51.

19 MR. PLUM: Well, not everybody is an employer here.

20 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Are you a Respondent? You haven't broken
21 the law yet, have you?

22 MR. PLUM: Well, we're responding to the petition. That
23 is our title.

24 THE WITNESS: This is the student handbook for the Writing
25 division.

1 (Employer's E-51 identified)

2 BY MR. PLUM:

3 Q So exhibit 51 is exhibit -- is the student handbook for
4 the Writing program?

5 A And it's given out to all entering students.

6 Q Entering Writing students?

7 A (No audible answer)

8 MR. PLUM: We move --

9 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Yes?

10 THE WITNESS: Yes.

11 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay.

12 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: One question on voir dire.

13 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Uh-huh.

14 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION

15 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

16 Q Actually, this is -- these are excerpts of the handbook?

17 A Yes.

18 Q It's not the complete document?

19 A Correct.

20 Q And is the complete document available online, do you
21 know, to the public?

22 A No, I don't believe it is.

23 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I have no objection provided we're
24 provided the whole thing.

25 MR. PLUM: That's not a problem.

1 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay. It's admitted.

2 (Employer's E-51 received in evidence)

3 MR. PLUM: Alright. Nothing further.

4 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Thank you.

5 MR. PLUM: Thank you.

6 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Mr. Meiklejohn?

7 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Thank you.

8 CROSS EXAMINATION

9 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

10 Q Good morning, Ms. Wright.

11 A Good morning.

12 Q You were asked some questions early in your testimony
13 about what type of employment your graduates move onto
14 following their employment (*sic*). You said that some of them
15 become adjuncts, is that right?

16 A Some of them go into -- some of them go onto teach in a
17 variety of teaching roles and positions. Some of them -- many
18 of them do not, but some of them do.

19 Q Is it -- do you have an idea of what proportion go on to
20 teach?

21 A No, we will -- we are in the process of collecting data on
22 what we call student outcome, so that we know -- we have a
23 better of idea of how many are going onto to teaching, how many
24 of them -- and what other roles they're playing in the culture.
25 So I don't have -- I can't tell you a percentage.

1 Q Is it your sense -- so how do you know that some do go on
2 to teaching?

3 A Well, we know because they tell us. And we -- you know,
4 we have -- many of the faculty follow the -- and stay in
5 contact with their alumns. So, you know, the concentration
6 head of the Directing program and Theater will be able to tell
7 you pretty much what her graduates are doing. So we have a lot
8 of anecdotal.

9 We just don't have statistical data that is collect
10 through a regular survey methodology. We're just beginning
11 that so that every year we will begin to collect data that is
12 more than anecdotal.

13 Q And when do you think that data will be available?

14 A Probably not until the spring of next year.

15 Q Spring of 2016?

16 A (No audible answer)

17 Q You have to answer for --

18 A Oh, I'm sorry. It's spring of -- probably the spring of
19 2016.

20 Q And -- but for -- I mean if you have a sense, the --

21 A But there are many other -- you understand there's many,
22 many other roles. They will go on to be -- if you're a
23 dramaturge you will probably begin to work, you know, in the
24 theater industry as an assistant artistic director, or as a
25 dramaturge or -- you know, there's different roles depending on

1 the concentration and whether or not there's been a -- you
2 know, a focus in teaching, in producing, in stage management.
3 You know, there's so many different roles that students play
4 after graduation in their field or related to their field. And
5 many of them also are working in jobs that are unrelated to
6 their field while they continue to work in their practice.

7 Q In other words they -- while they try to establish a
8 career in a creative --

9 A In the arts. Yeah.

10 Q If you -- while they try to establish a career in their
11 creative field they have to do something else to make some
12 money?

13 A (No audible answer)

14 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: That's right?

15 THE WITNESS: Correct, correct.

16 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

17 Q And do you know, with respect to the ones who become
18 adjuncts, whether that work teaching falls into the category of
19 something to do while they try to get established in their
20 creative field?

21 A Almost always.

22 Q Okay.

23 A I mean in other words -- but many of them are aspiring to
24 be both artists and teachers, just as their faculty are. So
25 it's not --

1 Q You're --

2 MR. PLUM: Wait. She didn't finish.

3 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I thought you were done --

4 THE WITNESS: Well, I just want to make sure that I'm
5 being clear.

6 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

7 Q Yeah. So what were -- if you were going to say something
8 more, go ahead.

9 A That's all. Simply --

10 Q Oh.

11 A -- that it's not just that they're teaching, you know, as
12 aside to their creative practice. Many of them aspire to be
13 both. That's all.

14 Q But in some cases it is also as aside to their creative
15 life?

16 A Yes.

17 Q And what are the academic background of your full time
18 faculty?

19 A Oh, it varies. If they're a scholar they typically have a
20 PhD in the field. So the faculty in the History, Theory and
21 Criticism of Film all hold the PhD. Well, not all, but most of
22 them do. Some of them -- I believe one of them has a Masters
23 degree, but, you know, served as curator of the New York Film
24 Festival for 25 years.

25 So they've -- they have typically the terminal degree

1 related to their field as well as a very high visibility in
2 their field. So they are directing their own company, they are
3 the artistic director of a company like Classic Stage, the
4 Atlantic Theater Company in New York. They are Broadway
5 directors, they are Broadway producers, they are Broadway stage
6 managers.

7 Michael Passaro, who oversees our stage management
8 concentration, is currently, you know, the stage manager at
9 Wolf Hall on Broadway. Anne Bogart has her company, is the
10 head of the directing program. Brian Kulick is the artistic
11 director of the Classic Stage Repertory Company downtown. And
12 they're teaching. So they have, in Film, the same thing. You
13 know, they're practicing film makers and they are teachers.

14 Q Okay. I don't mean to -- I don't want to cut you off, but
15 --

16 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: I think she was finished.

17 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Okay.

18 THE WITNESS: I was just trying to give you some examples.

19 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I understand. And you have. I think it
20 is probably clear from the record, but I don't think it was
21 explicitly stated. With respect to the Visual Arts students
22 who get appointments as TAs and who work in the studio classes,
23 those studio classes are classes for undergraduate students in
24 --

25 THE WITNESS: Correct.

1 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

2 Q And do some of the --

3 A Although a Master of Fine Arts student can also enroll.
4 So if you're -- for an example, if you're primarily a
5 photographer, but -- and you came into the Master of Fine Arts
6 program through photography, but you're also interested in
7 learning something about the process of print making, you could
8 take an advanced undergraduate class in print making. So the
9 MFA students are teaching classes that are typically comprised
10 of undergraduates and MFA students, but the MFA student won't,
11 you know, be advanced in that particular discipline.

12 Q Are most of the students in these classes undergraduates?

13 A Sometimes it can be half and half or a third, two-thirds.
14 You know, it -- some can be mostly undergraduates. It depends.
15 If it's a -- what level the class is too.

16 If it's 3000 or above -- do you understand what that
17 means? Courses are labeled 1000, 2000 depending on whether
18 it's primarily for freshmen, sophomores, juniors, seniors. So
19 classes that are pitched at the more advanced level could have
20 as many as half the students in would be MFA students.

21 Q So 1000 level classes are the introductory classes?

22 A Yes.

23 Q And so 3000 --

24 A Is more advanced, yeah.

25 Q Do -- are there people who get appointments as teaching

1 assistants who also get these other -- in either the same or a
2 different semester get appointments as -- in these service
3 positions?

4 A Yes. It's possible. But you -- there's a limit on the
5 number of hours that you can -- you can't -- the TA is weighted
6 as a five hour a week commitment. So you couldn't accept a
7 service position that would create a situation where you were
8 working more than 20 hours a week.

9 Q That's the maximum for the all your appointments in one
10 given semester?

11 A Correct.

12 Q Okay. But a TA could be -- he could -- he or she could be
13 a TA in one semester and have a service position in another
14 semester?

15 A Yes.

16 Q Now, in these studio classes, can you describe the -- I
17 think you talked about -- withdraw that. Let me start here.
18 The studio classes are classes where there -- were the students
19 are working on some creative -- exercising some creative skill,
20 is that correct?

21 A Yeah, they're involved in making a work of art.

22 Q And each student -- each of the students in the class is
23 making their own work of art or is it a collaborative project?

24 A They're making their own.

25 Q Each student is making his or her own work?

1 A Typically.

2 Q Typically. And both the faculty member and the TA would
3 work individually with the students on their product?

4 A Typically.

5 Q And what --

6 A At various levels and around different concepts,
7 techniques, problems. The faculty member engaged in a probably
8 deeper conversation about the intent and success of the work in
9 certain ways and a TA listening to that and talking maybe. So
10 it's a layered -- I mean it varies dramatically, depending on
11 the -- obviously, the instructor and the opportunity that
12 instructor is giving the TA to participate at various levels in
13 the teaching. And as the semester proceeds, as the TA develops
14 more skill in teaching, obviously what happens -- what that TA
15 is doing in week one will vary from what that TA is doing in
16 week 14.

17 Q And are there benefits to the student in the class from
18 having the TA participate?

19 A Oh, sure.

20 Q What benefits does -- do the students the class --

21 A It's a more advanced student who has a deeper mastery in
22 the techniques and methods help you in thinking about and --
23 your work and helping you solve creative problems and technical
24 issues.

25 Q Now, all of these positions -- teaching positions you've

1 described, you said that the students who are holding those
2 positions receive a stipend?

3 A Yes.

4 Q And those stipends are paid as a salary for payroll
5 purposes, correct?

6 A Yes.

7 Q And they're only paid those stipends in the semesters when
8 they're serving as a TA or --

9 A Correct.

10 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I'm sorry, I just want to make sure that
11 you got the answer.

12 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: She said correct.

13 MR. PLUM: Yeah --

14 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I heard it --

15 MR. PLUM: Just wait until he finishes the question.

16 You're sort of answering -- so there could be a jumble on the
17 record. I think that's what --

18 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's being tape recorded. So
19 we have to make sure that everybody finishes whatever they're
20 saying before the other person responds.

21 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I guess I also have some concern that I
22 might drown you out, which I'm trying not to do.

23 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

24 Q In the Film TAs, you said that the Film TAs conduct
25 recitation sections, is that correct?

1 A Yes.

2 Q And what are the benefits to the undergraduate or the
3 students in the class of having those recitation sections?

4 A Well, it's an opportunity for them to join in discussion
5 in a small group around the ideas, and concepts and work that
6 was presented during the lecture and screening. So it's an
7 opportunity -- and also for them to ask questions about it.
8 Things they might not have understood. An opportunity to
9 reflect, and analyze and talk more deeply with their peers in a
10 discussion section that's facilitated. So --

11 Q So the idea is that it would deepen their understanding of
12 the material?

13 A Correct.

14 Q With the respect -- actually, with respect to both the TAs
15 and the preceptor positions, and I -- you testified that the --
16 well, let me back up. A TA position is offered to every
17 student in Visual Arts, is that correct?

18 A Yes.

19 Q And why is it that you're able to do that in Visual Arts
20 and not in the other divisions?

21 A I wish I knew the answer to that. It's a matter of
22 historic -- I believe that it's a matter of the resources that
23 that -- each division has a different set of resources. So the
24 Film division has more endowments to support it. And so it
25 allows for more -- the students to have more opportunities for

1 these positions, these opportunities. So I mean that's part of
2 it.

3 And I think there's also in the -- in a studio classroom
4 it's understood that the nature of the instruction going on, as
5 I had mentioned before, is largely tutorial. I mean there's
6 group discussion, there's group critique. The faculty member
7 will be doing lecture demonstrations about how a certain
8 process works, a lecture on color, a lecture on how the
9 printing process unfolds, but there's a lot of one on one,
10 because each student is developing individually their own body
11 of work. So it's -- I think it's understood that there's more
12 opportunity to mentor an artist who also aspires to teach in
13 that setting, because there's more opportunity for that TA.

14 Now, I'll talk about the Writing program. In the Writing
15 program the history of the pedagogy in the Writing division and
16 in MFA programs across the country is that there's a small
17 workshop led by one person who orchestrates the critique
18 process. And there's not as much room in that setting for a
19 TA, for a second leader. So part of it is just how -- what
20 actually happens in that pedagogical setting and how much room
21 there is for another voice.

22 Q So --

23 A For another teacher to participate. Is that clear?

24 Q I think so. Just I mean you used the word more
25 opportunity in -- that there's more opportunity for these TAs

1 in the studio class.

2 A There's --

3 Q Is it fair to say that what you're saying is that really
4 there's more need for the TAs in the studio class?

5 A I think -- maybe, but I think it's much more about there's
6 more room for a second voice, because there's so much one on
7 one in a studio. There's an opportunity for another person to
8 be in that setting. And in a Writing workshop that doesn't --
9 there's not the room for another voice. There isn't the time
10 either.

11 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay.

12 THE WITNESS: When you have three hours and you're trying
13 to workshop everyone's work, there isn't an opportunity for
14 there to be, in that timeframe, two critiques of one person's
15 work. It's lucky that every person will get the attention they
16 need in that timeframe. So it's about time and opportunity
17 more than need, but need is also -- you know, the need is
18 certainly -- I mean the faculty members really, really love
19 having a TA. It's very helpful to them. So the need is there,
20 but it's just not the rationale for it.

21 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay.

22 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

23 Q You said that the -- in the position -- in the areas where
24 there are TA positions for everybody or where we're talking
25 about the selection of preceptors, that the individuals

1 involved in selecting the applicants to fill those positions
2 would select those who are more qualified.

3 Q Can you --

4 A And my question was --

5 A Can you repeat that?

6 Q Well, my question is what qualifications do the selecting
7 faculty look for when selecting TAs or preceptors?

8 A Well, first some ability to speak meaningfully and
9 articulately about their own work and the work of others, since
10 the critique is so -- such an essential factor in the learning
11 experience. If they're -- and some understanding the history
12 of that discipline and the tools and concepts that underlie
13 that field. So --

14 Q It was in Film I think that you said that there are 11
15 preceptors per --

16 A I believe that's correct.

17 Q And you said that was out of a total of 250 students?

18 A Yes, but --

19 Q Approximately.

20 A -- not eligible students. The number is smaller, because
21 we only let -- you can only be a preceptor if you're in your
22 third year or beyond. You have to finish your coursework. So
23 the number of eligible students to be preceptors is smaller
24 than the total number I quoted.

25 Q That total number includes all three years or --

1 A Or four --

2 Q I'm sorry, four --

3 A -- or five.

4 Q Right, that's --

5 A Yeah. The statute of limitations is five years and
6 students do take five years.

7 Q Right. And do you use that phrase statute of limitations?

8 A I don't know why, but we do, yeah.

9 Q Okay. So the -- are the cohorts -- do you use that term
10 cohorts?

11 A Yes, I do.

12 Q Okay. And just for the clarity of the record that refers
13 to the number of students admitted to the program each year, is
14 that correct?

15 A Well, yes. And I -- yes, I typically break it down even
16 further by concentration.

17 Q Right. So within the division?

18 A Yes. So there'll be a cohort of six in the Directing
19 program in Theater, a cohort of 10 in Theater Management in
20 Theater. So I typically break it down.

21 Q What -- alright. So you wouldn't refer to a cohort of
22 Film students that would include --

23 A No, I would, because there are separate cohorts in the
24 Writing, Directing and Creative Producing.

25 Q So what is the size of the cohort -- the typical cohort

1 in film?

2 A There are typically 25 Creative Producers and 48
3 Writer/Directors who are admitted each year.

4 Q And you said that there are typically 11 preceptors per
5 semester, but sometimes you can't fill all of them?

6 A No, we're always able to fill them. I don't know --

7 Q I'm sorry. Is there -- do you always have 11 or are there
8 years when you don't have 11?

9 A I believe we always have 11. I -- the only reason it can
10 vary is if we add another section, because there's more majors
11 in film studies at the undergraduate level in their senior year
12 and there's higher demand for the lab. So it can vary.

13 It's not so fixed. Nothing is so fixed. So these numbers
14 are always varying semester by semester, year to year. Not
15 extensively, but there's always some variation.

16 Q It varies by demand from the --

17 A Well, by the number of majors. You develop an
18 instructional plan based on the number of students who are
19 moving along at what rate.

20 Q The teaching fellows in Creative Writing --

21 A Yes.

22 Q -- are there other people who teach the beginning writing
23 workshops to first and second year students other than teaching
24 fellows?

25 A Can you repeat that?

1 Q Yeah. Who else teaches these classes? The classes --

2 A Oh, oh.

3 Q -- that the teaching fellows teach.

4 A Full time faculty and adjunct faculty also teach these
5 classes, but -- teach writing workshops, yes.

6 Q Writing -- it is right there in my notes. I don't know
7 why -- some of the Creative Writing MFA students also teach in
8 the university Writing class --

9 A Yes.

10 Q And the amount of the stipend that they receive is that
11 the same as the amount of the stipend that GSAS students
12 receive for teaching in the university Writing program?

13 A The formula is the same, but it's different, because the
14 tuition that an MFA student may be assessed will be different
15 from what the PhD student's tuition will be. And there is a
16 different agreement. It's different. By the -- it's not the
17 same. It's not the same --

18 Q Is the -- my question was about the stipend and you talked
19 about the tuition. Is the stipend the same?

20 A Oh, the stipend. I am not sure.

21 Q The various teaching assistants that you've described in
22 the different departments and maybe the answer is different for
23 different divisions, do they also assist in grading of the
24 students in the classes?

25 A So we're talking about teaching assistants?

1 Q Teaching assistants.

2 A And they are only teaching assistants in Visual Arts and
3 in --

4 Q Film?

5 A -- Film. The answer to that is no.

6 Q The --

7 A They might be recording -- reporting attendance or
8 participation in a discussion section that a faculty member
9 might take into consideration. If a student has not attended
10 the discussion section, that would be reported and the faculty
11 member who was grading that student may take that into
12 consideration, but the TA is not involved in the grading. Not
13 grading the student. Not determining the grade.

14 Q What other functions, besides running the -- okay. In the
15 Film first of all, other than assist -- or conducting the
16 recitation sections, and attending lectures and possibly
17 recording attendance, are there other functions that TAs are
18 typically called upon to perform?

19 A It will vary by instruction. So I hesitate to try to say
20 something uniform about that. It may be that they're helping
21 prepare film clips for a lecture for example. It might be that
22 they're, you know, helping in some way to support the
23 preparation for the lecture.

24 Q Getting materials ready that are going to be used by the
25 faculty member in the lecture? Is that --

1 A Possibly. It'd be typically more about -- I mean the
2 thing I hear a lot about is, you know, faculty use film clips
3 when lecturing a lot. They're not showing the whole film.
4 They're showing bits and samples, you know? So yes, helping
5 the faculty member prepare materials for the lecture --

6 Q So the prep -- I understand what a film clip is. The
7 preparation basically means editing the film, or cutting up
8 pieces of film or --

9 A Well, there's --

10 Q -- getting the projector at the right place so that it'll
11 start showing the right part.

12 A No, they're not doing -- I mean the -- we have a screening
13 room, there's projection. It's all -- it works pretty smoothly
14 for the most part. But, you know, it will vary by instructor
15 what they're -- what the TA is asked to do.

16 Q I'm sorry, just what do you mean when you say preparing
17 the film clips? What's the preparation part?

18 A Well, it depends. There's so many film clips available on
19 the Butler Library web. So I was just trying to come up with
20 an example of what else they might be asked to do.

21 Q Okay.

22 A Getting films from the Butler Library could be a
23 possibility, preparing film clips. I'm just saying something
24 that might have to do with the preparation of the lecture, I'm
25 guessing. And it could be that a TA is also given the

1 opportunity, you know, to present a lecture at some point.

2 That varies with instructor. It's possible.

3 Q Now --

4 A I'm just saying these are so -- these are -- each faculty
5 member has a relationship with the TA where they take seriously
6 that they're mentoring that TA. They're helping that TA learn
7 to teach. So it's -- you know, it's -- each approach to that
8 exercise will be different, based on the faculty member.

9 Q Other duties as assigned?

10 A Sure.

11 Q Who -- you testified about the individuals who have
12 service assignments. Are they called research fellows?

13 A Some of them are research related service positions, some
14 of them are not. But some of them are, yes.

15 Q How are they -- is there a -- an overall job
16 classification for these individuals?

17 A They are service positions. So there's a job description
18 so a student will know I'm applying to be a research assistant
19 or research fellow for -- you know, to a faculty member. So,
20 you know, Professor Gaines is working on the development of the
21 symposium and is at -- you know, is going to have a research
22 assistant that semester working on, you know, helping do the
23 research that underlies that exercise. So that's just an
24 example, but --

25 Q But you --

1 A But they're considered -- they're still service positions.

2 They're not --

3 Q Right.

4 A -- teaching appointments I guess is my point.

5 Q I understand they're not. I just was asking whether
6 they're called research fellow I think was just the question.

7 And I think the answer to that was --

8 A The language is -- you know, not everybody uses exactly
9 the same terminology unfortunately.

10 Q That's right. I mean that's not just in your experience.
11 You testified that one of the duties that might be performed by
12 these service people is to monitor different types of technical
13 laboratories, technical shops?

14 A (No audible answer)

15 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Yes?

16 THE WITNESS: Yes.

17 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

18 Q Okay. And just again, I don't think it was clear on the
19 record, the people who are using the laboratories and those
20 shops are students who are taking a class, correct?

21 A Yes, it could be a graduate class or undergraduate class.

22 Q And they are selected because they have a -- the service
23 people are selected for those positions because they have a
24 skill in whatever the activity is that goes on in that lab or
25 shop, correct?

1 A Correct. Although sometimes we have more monitors. We
2 have the need for more monitors than -- and so sometimes we
3 train.

4 Q Okay --

5 A We provide the training.

6 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Understood.

7 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

8 Q You look for people who have the skills, but if they don't
9 have the skills you'll train them so they can do the job,
10 correct?

11 A Correct.

12 Q Okay. One of the examples you gave was the prop shop,
13 which I take it is where you have supplies that can be used.
14 Is that for both Film and Theater?

15 A They both have prop -- the Theater prop shop is far more
16 extensive than the Film prop --

17 Q They're not allowed to share? Don't answer that. I'm
18 sorry, I didn't mean to ask that. Can you give an example of
19 the kind of duties that these individuals would perform in the
20 prop shop?

21 A They would staff the shop. So as director, and actors and
22 stage managers come to check out props they would be there and
23 check the props out. They would see the props back, they would
24 maintain inventory. And, you know, they're running that.
25 They're overseeing the distribution of the -- the circulation

1 of those assets.

2 Q And also documenting where they are so that --

3 A Hopefully.

4 Q In theory that's what -- I'm not saying nobody ever --

5 everybody's perfect at their job. Okay. And you testified

6 that these appointments are one semester appointments, correct?

7 A Typically.

8 Q Sometimes they're more than that?

9 A Well, you're appointed each semester. You might be
10 appointed for both semesters. They're separate appointments.

11 Q You could be appointed more than once?

12 A Yes.

13 Q Okay.

14 A But the appointment is for the semester only.

15 Q Right. And some of those positions -- you said that most
16 of them pay about \$20 an hour, but is it true that some of them
17 pay \$25 --

18 A Yes.

19 Q -- an hour? And why is it that some of them pay more, if
20 you know?

21 A Because there's the expectation that there's a higher
22 level of responsibility or knowledge required or they're more -
23 - it's --

24 Q I'm listening.

25 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: They have more --

1 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I don't mean --

2 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: -- knowledge she said.

3 THE WITNESS: They might have more knowledge or they -- or
4 the position requires a little bit more responsibility. More,
5 you know --

6 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

7 Q You're finished?

8 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: She was done.

9 THE WITNESS: Yeah, I'm finished.

10 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Okay. Could we go off the record for a
11 moment?

12 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Yes.

13 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I --

14 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Off the record.

15 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken)

16 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Back on the record.

17 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

18 Q Of the --

19 MR. PLUM: If you --

20 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Wait until I ask the question. I haven't
21 asked the -- the question has been heard off the record, but I
22 have to put it on the record before there's an objection.
23 There -- of these people in the service classifications that
24 you testified about, are some of them referred to or have the
25 word research in their title?

1 THE WITNESS: You know, I'd have to go back and check.
2 They may be, but my guess is they are not conducted research in
3 the way in which a PhD student would be conducting research.
4 Is that the issue? In other words, we may be using it, but
5 we're using it in a different way probably. So I don't know
6 what distinction you're trying to make, but --

7 MR. PLUM: Yeah. No, just answer the question. It's not
8 -- don't speculate about what he's --

9 THE WITNESS: Yeah.

10 MR. PLUM: If you don't know, you don't.

11 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

12 Q The question is do you know of any who have research --
13 the word research in the titles or the names by which they're
14 known?

15 A I know it has been used very occasionally --

16 Q And --

17 A -- for a small percentage, but I can't testify as to the
18 actual nature of what that student may be doing.

19 Q Okay. Thank you.

20 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Anything else, Mr. Meiklejohn?

21 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Are there other position -- other
22 individuals within the school who are referred to as research
23 assistants or research associates, other than the -- other than
24 these service positions that we've talked about?

25 THE WITNESS: No. Not to my knowledge.

1 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay. Any other questions?

2 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No, that's it.

3 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Mr. Plum, any further
4 questions?

5 MR. PLUM: I'm done. Nothing further.

6 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay.

7 THE WITNESS: Again, in a research university that word is
8 used a lot to describe very different activities.

9 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Thank you. You are now
10 excused. We're off the record.

11 (Whereupon, at 12:26 p.m. a luncheon recess was taken)

A F T E R N O O N S E S S I O N

(1:51 P.M.)

HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Back on the record.

Dr. Alonso, you're still under oath.

Whereupon,

CARLOS ALONSO

Having been previously duly sworn, was recalled as a witness and testified herein as follows:

CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. BRILL:

Q Good afternoon, Dean Alonso. I believe when we left off earlier this week we had just put into evidence some sample appointment letters for teaching fellows if you recall. And I want to move on now to -- if you --

MR. BRILL: Let me have the exhibit, the description of the -- all the different fellowship categories. Exhibit 39, if you could show the witness? Oh, this was -- I think we had some question about whether it was 38. No, I think exhibit 39.

HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Employer?

MR. BRILL: Employer's 39. I think this is a document headed fellowship categories. So Dean Alonso, moving on to the next category of student officer appointments shown on exhibit 39, there's a preceptor category. Can you tell us briefly what preceptors -- what the preceptor appointment entails?

THE WITNESS: I believe that preceptor is a term used to

1 describe the appointment of graduate students to teach in the
2 core curriculum of Columbia College (*sic*).

3 BY MR. BRILL:

4 Q And we've had testimony about the core curriculum. So I
5 won't ask you further questions about that now. But moving on
6 to the next two categories, which are research fellow and
7 graduate research assistant, can you describe those categories?

8 A Yes. The graduate research assistant is a category that
9 is used to appoint students who are assisting the research of
10 faculty and who are paid from sponsored project grants.

11 Typically federal government grants. As opposed to research
12 fellows, who are paid from internal university sources.

13 Q Are there any particular divisions of the Graduate School
14 where you would typically find the research fellows or the
15 research assistants?

16 A Yes, graduate research assistants are almost exclusively
17 appointed in the Natural Sciences. Research fellows can be
18 found in the Natural Sciences and in -- typically the Social
19 Sciences, although there are some cases of students appointed
20 as research fellows in the Humanities as well, but very few.

21 Q What is the relationship of a student who's appointed as
22 either a research fellow or a graduate research assistant to
23 the student's educational program?

24 A It depends of course, but in most instances the student is
25 undertaking work -- particularly in the sciences, undertaking

1 work that is related to his or her own research, but in the
2 context of a laboratory situation where the overarching work or
3 the larger work that is being undertaken is determined by the
4 terms of the grant that the primary investigator, the PI,
5 received in order to undertake that research.

6 Q Are there certain Natural Science departments that are
7 commonly referred to as laboratory --

8 A Yes.

9 Q -- sciences? What would those --

10 A Laboratory or bench sciences. That would be Chemistry,
11 Biology, sometimes Physics, depending on the kind of work being
12 performed. I can't think of any other right now, but those are
13 the majors ones --

14 Q Those are the three --

15 A -- Chemistry, Physics and Biology.

16 Q Now, in the bench sciences what's the -- what is the
17 typical arrangement by which a graduate research assistant or
18 research fellow would conduct the research in connection with
19 his or her thesis?

20 A Could you repeat the question?

21 Q Maybe I'll ask a more clear -- I'll try to ask a clearer
22 question. So in the sciences, I think you testified earlier
23 that a graduate student would typically have an advisor or
24 sponsor for his or her research?

25 A Yes.

1 Q That would be true in the sciences also?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And focusing on the laboratory science departments, where
4 would the graduate student do his or her thesis research?

5 A In the context of the lab of his or her primary
6 investigator.

7 Q You may have testified about this the last time to some
8 extent. So I just want to be sure it's in the record. With
9 respect to the appointments of students as either GRA research
10 assistants or teaching fellows, how -- what is the process that
11 is followed in making those appointments either at the
12 departmental level or the Graduate School level?

13 A Typically, the department will determine the nature of the
14 appointment and will inform the Graduate School of the various
15 appointments that students will be holding. But essentially
16 after that the appointment is handled by the department in
17 conjunction with the various other offices that will have to do
18 with the disbursement of the funds to the students.

19 MR. BRILL: I believe we're up to exhibit 52 I'm told. So
20 this is 52. This is a print out from the GSAS website headed
21 good standing.

22 BY MR. BRILL:

23 Q Can you identify exhibit 21 (*sic*)?

24 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Exhibit what?

25 THE WITNESS: 52.

1 MR. BRILL: I'm sorry, 52. That's my own current number.

2 THE WITNESS: This is a print out from the website of the
3 Graduate School of Arts and Sciences that describes the two
4 kinds of good standing that a student is supposed to be always
5 in; good academic standing in a degree program and good
6 administrative standing in the Graduate School.

7 (Employer's E-52 identified)

8 BY MR. BRILL:

9 Q Now, under good academic standing the paragraph says "to
10 be considered in good academic standing students must make
11 satisfactory academic progress as determined by their
12 department." Do you see that sentence?

13 A Yes.

14 Q And then it says "satisfactory progress for MA and PhD
15 candidates include, but is not limited to the following seven
16 items".

17 A Yes.

18 Q And one of those seven items, paragraph six, is fulfilling
19 GSAS pedagogical requirements and responsibilities.

20 A Correct.

21 Q So if a student did not fulfill the GSAS requirement of
22 teaching am I correct then that they would not be considered to
23 be making satisfactory academic progress?

24 A Absolutely.

25 Q And what's the consequence of not making satisfactory

1 academic progress?

2 A You can be prevented from graduating, you can be put on
3 probation. I believe that there's only been once case of a
4 student who has been allowed to graduate without fulfilling the
5 requirement technically. And that was a case of a student who
6 arrived as a trailing student, meaning that is a student who
7 came to one of the Natural Sciences departments who had arrived
8 with three years of experience in the previous institution and
9 upon being challenged about the fact that student had not
10 fulfilled the requirement, he was able to show that in his
11 previous institution where he had come with his mentor, he had
12 in fact undergone a whole pedagogical training and had taught
13 for two years. And this was right before graduation and out of
14 a sense of leniency, we -- the Graduate School determined that
15 it would consider that having satisfied the requirement. But
16 it is an absolute requirement of the Graduate School and it's
17 upheld in all cases.

18 MR. BRILL: Okay. I offer exhibit 52.

19 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

20 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

21 (Employer's E-52 received in evidence)

22 BY MR. BRILL:

23 Q I now want to ask you a few questions about the Masters
24 Degree programs, Dean Alonso. How long is the course of study
25 typically for your MA programs?

1 A It's a minimum of one year, but there are a few programs
2 that require two years of instruction or research. Very few.

3 Q So what would the most common --

4 A The most common would be one year or one year spilling
5 into the summer. But it's -- in the aggregate I would say that
6 the average is close to a year or a year and a summer.

7 Q And what financial aid if any does Columbia provide for
8 the Masters Degree students?

9 A Very little.

10 Q I'm taking about terminal Masters Degree students.

11 A Yes. It's very little. Some students are appointed as
12 readers. I believe that is the category, although they are
13 currently referred to as graders.

14 And in such cases they receive a combination of tuition
15 remission and a stipend, typically totaling \$3,000 or so. But
16 that's out of a tuition rate that is close to \$50,000. So it's
17 negligible in any event.

18 Q Are there other appointments other than the reader that
19 the Masters Degree students may be eligible for?

20 A I believe that in the Math department Masters students are
21 sometimes referred to as TAs.

22 Q I see.

23 A But again, that seems to be an idiosyncrasy of the
24 Mathematics department.

25 MR. BRILL: Could you show the witness exhibit 40?

1 THE WITNESS: Yes.

2 BY MR. BRILL:

3 Q You testified previously about the -- these are the GSAS
4 student guide -- graduate student teaching guidelines. And
5 there's reference in paragraph 15 on page two to department
6 providing students with written guidelines and procedures for
7 assigning and selecting teaching fellows. Do you see that?

8 A Yes.

9 Q And I'm going to mark some sample departmental guidelines
10 that I'd like to have you identify, beginning with 53, which is
11 Art History and Archeology, 54, which is the Department of
12 History, 55, which is Physics and 56, which is English I
13 believe.

14 MS. ROTHGEB: I'm sorry, English?

15 MR. BRILL: What?

16 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: He believes.

17 MR. BRILL: 56 is English and 57 is Religion.

18 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I don't think we've gotten all these,
19 have we?

20 MR. BRILL: Say that again.

21 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I don't think we've seen all these, have
22 we?

23 MR. BRILL: Yes.

24 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Okay.

25 MR. BRILL: I think the English one was accidentally left

1 out of the first production, but it was sent whenever Matt sent
2 you the additional documents for Dean Alonso.

3 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No, there was a supplement.

4 MR. BATASTINI: It would have been on Tuesday.

5 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay.

6 MR. BRILL: Want to go --

7 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Whatever. Just -- we're not going to
8 object just because we didn't have them. Are you going to give
9 us copies now or not?

10 MR. BRILL: Yes.

11 MR. BATASTINI: And they're all marked. They were all in
12 the production, expect for English like he said.

13 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay.

14 MR. BRILL: So -- okay. So first is 55? 53?

15 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Do you want to give us all of
16 them and we can just mark them?

17 MR. BRILL: I'm just trying to -- I wanted to do it this
18 way to keep it straight, but --

19 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: But we can just mark them.

20 MR. BRILL: Okay.

21 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Have them marked. This is 53.

22 MR. BRILL: Yeah, I was going to have them all marked.

23 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Actually, if you've already given them to
24 us --

25 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: I didn't get one. 54.

1 MR. BRILL: You did not get History?

2 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: That's 54, right? 55.

3 MR. BRILL: Yeah. I've lost track.

4 MS. ROTHGEB: 55 is Physics.

5 MR. BRILL: Right. 56 is English.

6 THE WITNESS: Well, these are the same by the way, History
7 and History.

8 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay. You gave him a
9 duplicate.

10 THE WITNESS: I think Physics should be 55.

11 MS. ROTHGEB: Yeah.

12 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: So take --

13 THE WITNESS: This is 54.

14 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: You need the manual for
15 physics, which is 55.

16 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: 55 is Physics.

17 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: So he'll mark that as 55.

18 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: And that one is 18 pages?

19 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Do you have the manual for
20 Physics? 55 you have?

21 MR. BRILL: He has it.

22 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay. I got it.

23 MR. BRILL: You have it. Let's mark them all and then
24 I'll review them.

25 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: So now we're on to 56.

1 MR. BRILL: 56 is English.

2 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Yeah, this -- seven 90. Okay. I guess I
3 didn't know what it was.

4 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Are we done? Or 57?

5 MR. BRILL: One more. This is Religion.

6 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Three pages?

7 MS. ROTHGEB: Seven 80 --

8 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: You can put them all in
9 numerical order I guess.

10 THE WITNESS: Uh-huh. 56 is which department?

11 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Religion.

12 THE WITNESS: English, English --

13 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: English. And 57 is Religion.

14 THE WITNESS: Yes. I have them.

15 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: So documents marked from
16 Employer's 53 to 57 have all been marked and they're in front
17 of Dr. Alonso.

18 MR. BRILL: Alright. So why don't we now have Dean Alonso
19 just identify them for the record? Make sure we're on the same
20 page. 53 should be headed Art History and Archeology.

21 THE WITNESS: Yes.

22 CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION

23 BY MR. BRILL:

24 Q Do you recognize this document?

25 A Yes. It's an excerpt from the student handbook for the

1 Art History and Archeology Department.

2 (Employer's E-53 identified)

3 Q And 54 is headed "Teaching in the Columbia University
4 Department of History."

5 A Yes.

6 Q Is that -- do you recognize this document?

7 A Yes, it seems to be the equivalent document for the
8 History Department.

9 (Employer's E-54 identified)

10 Q 55 is called a manual for Physics Department teaching
11 fellows.

12 A Yes, it is.

13 (Employer's E-55 identified)

14 Q 56 does not have a title, but it's headed to faculty with
15 TAs and makes reference to certain courses in the English
16 Department. So would you be able to identify 56?

17 A Yes, it is allusive to the English Department, because I
18 recognize the name of their departmental administrator. And
19 there are references to courses in the English Department.

20 Q And what is 56?

21 A It's a document that describes procedures and expectations
22 for teaching fellows in the English Department.

23 (Employer's E-56 identified)

24 Q And finally 57 is headed manual for teaching fellows and
25 makes reference to the Religion Department.

1 A Yes, it is.

2 (Employer's E-57 identified)

3 MR. BRILL: I'm offering 53 through 57.

4 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION

5 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

6 Q Can I -- just to clarify, 53, which is Art History and
7 Archeology and 54, which is History, these are excerpts from
8 student rulebook?

9 A I'm reading the top of the Art History and Archeology
10 document that says "information provided in the student
11 handbook".

12 Q So your understanding is that these two come from the
13 student handbook?

14 A I would imagine that based on the parenthetical notation
15 at the top of the Art History and Archeology document that such
16 is the case. I do not see the same description in the document
17 for the History Department.

18 MR. BRILL: When you said these two what are you asking --

19 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: 53 and 54.

20 MR. BRILL: Oh.

21 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

22 Q So do you know -- you don't know where 54 -- whether this
23 is an independently standing manual or part of some other
24 document?

25 A I do not know that.

1 Q 55, Physics, that is a separate free-standing manual for
2 Physics?

3 A From the title it would seem so.

4 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Okay. Might have been easier to just
5 offer them as being what they are, but alright.

6 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

7 Q You -- have you ever seen any of these documents before?

8 A I have seen them in the context of a request that was made
9 from departments about two, two and a half years ago, when the
10 GSAS Teaching Center wanted to ascertain broadly what was the -
11 - what were the practices and the documents that were used by
12 departments in order to inform students about their teaching
13 responsibilities, when Mark Phillipson became the head of the
14 Teaching Center. And these were culled together and we looked
15 at them as a collective.

16 Q Okay. So the these that you're now referring to are they
17 all four -- are they all of the five documents that you
18 referred to or --

19 A Yes. I am -- I cannot tell you exactly if what we have
20 here for each department is the extent of what the department
21 has as a manual, but I have a recollection of having seen these
22 documents. Whether they are a full manual or they are simply
23 descriptive of what the department is expecting, I have seen
24 them in the context of a request from departments to provide us
25 with documents about their instructions to the students and the

1 expectations to the students.

2 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Okay. Well, I'm not going to object to
3 53 and 54, 55 or 57.

4 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay. So they're admitted.
5 (Employer's E-53 through 55 & 57 received in evidence)

6 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: As for 56, I'm -- I don't think we have
7 really any identification of what that document is.

8 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Dean Alonso, you said this
9 document E-56, you've seen it before about two years ago and it
10 was produced by your department?

11 THE WITNESS: My department?

12 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: I'm sorry, the graduate
13 students -- they were culled together?

14 THE WITNESS: No, the Teaching Center requested
15 departments to share with them documents that they circulated
16 among the departments that would have either instructions, or
17 practices or expectations having to do with their
18 responsibilities as teachers. The reason why I can recognize
19 exhibit 56 as pertaining to the English Department is that
20 there are courses in the English Department mentioned in the
21 document and I recognize also the name of the contact person
22 that is being given, Ms. Pamela Rodman, who is the academic
23 department administrator of that department.

24 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay. I am going to admit it.
25 (Employer's E-56 received in evidence)

1 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Pardon?

2 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: I'm going to admit that. I
3 think that's sufficient. Go ahead.

4 CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION

5 BY MR. BRILL:

6 Q Turning your attention to exhibit 53, Dean Alonso, I'd
7 actually like to ask you about the paragraph under appendix C,
8 the first paragraph headed introduction. What I'd like to do
9 actually is I'm going to read it just so the record on that.
10 What I want to ask you is whether what's stated in this
11 document with respect to Art History would be true in your
12 experience more generally throughout the Graduate School. So -
13 -

14 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I guess I'm going to object to him
15 reading documents that are in the record.

16 MR. BRILL: I'm not reading the whole document. I want to
17 -- just I want to read a short paragraph into the record so the
18 -- I mean dean -- he could read it silently, but the reader of
19 the record, I think, then wouldn't have to cross reference the
20 document, that's all.

21 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Go ahead. Which paragraph?

22 MR. BRILL: "Teaching experience is an essential component
23 of the doctoral program in Art History and contributes to the
24 intellectual development of graduate students in many ways.
25 Teaching induces graduate students to master art works,

1 interpretations and methodologies more thoroughly and to
2 indentify and confront what they may not fully understand.
3 Helping undergraduates develop discussion and writing skills
4 challenges graduate students to hone their abilities to
5 communicate and answer questions and often improves their own
6 writing and performance in seminars and on the oral exam."

7 Many graduate student -- "many graduate teaching fellows
8 forge rewarding bonds with undergraduates for whom they play a
9 vital role as mentors and role models. And they find that this
10 interaction reinforces their own sense of purpose and reaffirms
11 their scholarly mission. At the same time working closely with
12 a faculty member affords the opportunity to learn about vital
13 aspects of our profession from evaluation to advising.

14 The opportunity to hone these skills offers our students
15 an important advantage in the job market whether they decide to
16 pursue teaching or not. In short, teaching and scholarship
17 enrich each other in crucial ways. This cross fertilization
18 between pedagogy and research is a distinguishing quality of
19 the intellectual life of the faculty in our department and we
20 are committed to provide the same enriching educational
21 opportunities to our doctoral students." So my -- having read
22 that statement in the document concerning Art History and
23 Archeology, my question is whether the -- that same -- those
24 same statements, in your view, would apply more generally to
25 other departments and doctoral education throughout the

1 Graduate School?

2 THE WITNESS: Yes, I would agree with the premise of your
3 question. In other words this is a very good description of
4 precisely why it is that we require teaching from our students.
5 Not only because of the fact that it will allow them to master
6 the pedagogical skills that they will need in the future, but
7 also because for the fact that the teaching assignment will
8 manifest itself into -- in a deeper understanding of their own
9 field and of their own discipline. And it will test the real
10 knowledge and the lacuna that they have of the knowledge of the
11 field.

12 CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION

13 BY MR. BRILL:

14 Q Now, I think the last time you started to talk about some
15 of the programs that the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences
16 has to help prepare the graduate students to teach. And I
17 believe you had mentioned the Teaching Center. But I don't
18 think you had described what the Teaching Center is. So could
19 you just give a brief description for the Teaching Center?

20 A Yes. I should probably begin with a little bit of
21 history. The Teaching Center was created in the mid to late
22 90's, after there was a discussion in the -- among the faculty
23 about whether Columbia should have a university-wide teaching
24 center. The result of that conversation was that there was no
25 university-wide teaching center created, mostly because of

1 budgetary reasons.

2 However, the other result of that conversation was the
3 fact that the faculty was unanimous in determining that it was
4 essential for graduate students to be trained pedagogically in
5 a consistent and thorough fashion. And it decided that a
6 teaching center that would address the pedagogical needs of
7 graduate students should be created. That was the genesis.
8 That was the origin of the GSAS Teaching Center.

9 And to this day its mission is to precisely put in place
10 programming, and activities and initiatives that enhance the
11 pedagogical preparedness of our graduate students. It is
12 absolutely essential to underscore the fact that no equivalent
13 operation exists for any other teaching constituency in the
14 University. In other words, if a faculty member, if a
15 lecturer, if an adjunct has difficulties teaching there is no
16 place on campus where he or she can address those needs.

17 Whereas for graduate students, at least since the 1990's,
18 the Teaching Center has provided that service to our graduate
19 students. And it is in fact indicative of the commitment that
20 the faculty has had for a long time to the pedagogical training
21 of our graduate students and of the importance that it has for
22 them.

23 Q Are you familiar with a program called the Teaching
24 Scholars Program?

25 A Yes.

1 MR. BRILL: Okay. I'm going to mark -- so exhibit --
2 we're up to 58, right?

3 MS. ROTHGEB: We are.

4 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Yep.

5 MR. BRILL: Marking as exhibit 58 a print out from the
6 GSAS website entitled Teaching Scholars Program. Could we go
7 off the record for one second?

8 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Yes, we're off the record.

9 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken)

10 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: On the record.

11 BY MR. BRILL:

12 Q Identify exhibit 58.

13 A This is a photocopy of a page from the website of the
14 Graduate School of Arts and Sciences that describes the
15 Teaching Scholars Program.

16 (Employer's E-58 identified)

17 Q Okay. Can you just describe -- actually, I'm going to
18 offer one more -- a few more documents before I ask you
19 generally about the program.

20 MR. BRILL: Exhibit 59 is a letter "dear colleagues" from
21 Andrea Solomon regarding the Teaching Scholars Program. And
22 let's do 60 while we're at it, which is a document headed
23 Teaching Scholars application. So you should have in front of
24 you exhibit 58, 59 and 60.

25 THE WITNESS: Yes.

1 BY MR. BRILL:

2 Q Can you identify three -- these three documents?

3 A 58 is a description of the Teaching Scholars Program, 59
4 is a message to directors of graduate studies regarding the
5 application process for the Teaching Scholars Program and 60 is
6 the actual online application that a student would use in order
7 to apply for the Teaching Scholars Program.

8 (Employer's E-59 & 60 identified)

9 MR. BRILL: I offer 58, 59 and 60.

10 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Just a quick --

11 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION

12 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

13 Q 58 is taken from the GSAS website?

14 A Yes.

15 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection to 58.

16 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

17 Q Who is or what is the role of the senior associate dean of
18 academic administration Andrea Solomon?

19 A She is the person that supervises the academic affairs of
20 the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences.

21 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection to 59 and no objection to
22 60.

23 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: They're all admitted.

24 (Employer's E-58 through 60 received in evidence)

25 CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION

1 BY MR. BRILL:

2 Q So stepping back for a minute from the documents, Dean
3 Alonso, could you just describe what the Teaching Scholars
4 Program is and perhaps also give us some background on how it
5 came to be?

6 A The Teaching Scholars Program was a program that I
7 devised, in order to allow advanced graduate students to be
8 able to teach a course of their own devising. Up until the
9 moment when the Teaching Scholars Program was initiated in
10 2011, the teaching experience of graduate students was limited
11 to the existing curriculum in the department. What the
12 Teaching Scholars Program allows graduate students to do is to
13 design a course most likely -- and in fact typically based in
14 -- on the student's dissertation topic, and work with faculty
15 to concoct a syllabus, and a set of requirements for the course
16 and have it be taught to undergraduates in exactly the same
17 level.

18 In other words the 3000 level advanced seminar level that
19 an undergraduate would take in the junior or senior year of
20 their career as an undergraduate. The purpose was to precisely
21 allow advanced graduate students the opportunity to have a
22 culminating pedagogical experience before they would go out to
23 the academic job market and would allow them therefore to
24 present, as part of their pedagogical training and experience,
25 a much stronger and much more developed profile as a candidate.

1 Q And what is the process by which a student can apply for
2 and be selected as a Teaching Scholar? I guess we have the
3 application, but --

4 A Yes. You also have the instructions sent by Dean Solomon
5 to departments to begin the process, whereby departments
6 essentially receive applications that their students have
7 filled out and then they choose among the applications they
8 have received a certain number of those applications to forward
9 to the Graduate School, which in turn presents these courses to
10 the Committee on Instruction, which is the committee that
11 approves any new course, be it taught by faculty or by Teaching
12 Scholars, before it can even be included in the curriculum for
13 a given department.

14 Q And who would be eligible? What -- does a student have to
15 be at a certain level to be eligible?

16 A Yes, a student has to have fulfilled all the requirements
17 of the M.Phil degree by the time of appointment as a Teaching
18 Scholar, in order to be able to apply.

19 Q What role if any do the regular faculty have with respect
20 to Teaching Scholar Program, either in developing the course or
21 supervising the course or anything else?

22 A I believe that the memorandum from Dean Solomon is quite
23 specific about the fact that the students should prepare their
24 -- the course syllabus in consultation with faculty. And
25 there's also a requirement that the faculty member visit the

1 class I believe at least once during the semester. But it's
2 very clearly conceived to be an activity that should occur
3 under the supervision of a faculty member, who in most cases
4 will be the dissertation sponsor of the student.

5 Q If I just call your attention to exhibit 59? Do you still
6 have that in front of you?

7 A Yes.

8 Q Under the last paragraph on the first page, continuing on
9 to the next page states that "the supervising faculty core
10 sponsor will commit to visiting the class at least twice during
11 the semester to evaluate and offer guidance on the student's
12 pedagogical performance."

13 A Yes, I --

14 Q Does that refresh your recollection?

15 A I stand corrected. Twice, not once.

16 MR. BRILL: I'm going to mark as exhibits 61 through 64
17 four sample Teaching Scholars applications. They don't --
18 we've redacted the student's name but the first one -- the
19 course title is The Roots of Empires, Plants and European
20 Expansion 1400 to 1850, the second one is Latino New York --
21 I'm sorry, so the second one would be exhibit 62 and the title
22 of the course -- proposed course is Latino New York Cultural
23 Identities and Expressions, 63 is a proposed course summary
24 Epistemology Investigation, Experimentation and Value and 64 is
25 the proposed course on Public Education in The United States

1 Since 1900, Historical Perspectives and Current Challenges. So
2 this is 61. And this is 64, this is the -- so let's go over
3 with the witness now.

4 BY MR. BRILL:

5 Q 61, you have the documents in front of you, Dean Alonso?

6 A Yes, I do.

7 Q And are these all samples of Teaching Scholars
8 applications that the Graduate School has received this current
9 year?

10 A Yes, they are.

11 Q And 61, this is the document for a course in The Roots of
12 Empires, Plants and European Expansion 1400 to 1850 --

13 A Yes.

14 (Employer's E-61 identified)

15 Q -- is that correct? 62 is a proposal for a course on
16 Latino New York Cultural Identities and Expressions?

17 A Yes.

18 (Employer's E-62 identified)

19 Q 63 is Epistemology Investigation, Experimentation and
20 Value?

21 A Yes.

22 (Employer's E-63 identified)

23 Q And 64 is a proposed course on Public Education in The
24 United States Since 1900?

25 A Yes, it is.

1 (Employer's E-64 identified)

2 MR. BRILL: I offer these documents into evidence.

3 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Just one --

4 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION

5 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

6 Q Have these been approved or what is the status of these?

7 A These are courses that have been submitted to the
8 Committee on Instruction of Columbia College (*sic*), which is
9 the committee that approves any new course in the curriculum.
10 So we are expecting to hear any time some about their approval
11 for inclusion in the curriculum for next year, either the fall
12 or the spring.

13 Q So these past the hurdle of the department?

14 A Yes. They have been submitted. They were submitted by
15 the department to the Graduate School who in turn submitted it
16 to the Committee on Instruction.

17 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

18 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay. It's -- they're
19 admitted.

20 (Employer's E-61 through 64 received in evidence)

21 CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION

22 BY MR. BRILL:

23 Q So I'm not going take you through all these proposals,
24 Dean Alonso, but I did want to call your attention in
25 particular to one thing on exhibit 61, if you have that in

1 front of you? On page three, paragraph four under brief
2 indication of the relation of proposed course to research.
3 Again, I think it may be useful just for the record if I just
4 read the few sentences into the record. The student says "my
5 dissertation looks at the intersection of the tobacco trade,
6 and the Spanish Empire and the early forays in the Americas of
7 Dutch, English and French. My research attempts to bridge the
8 imperial divisions that have arisen in scholarship (like the
9 British Atlantic or the Spanish Empire) in order to show the
10 close contact among these diverse groups from indigenous groups
11 to enslaved Africans to European settlers and traders.

12 I do this by looking at a plant, which was produced under
13 unique local circumstances, and yet was traded throughout the
14 world. This course is thus closely connected to my own
15 research and its goal of bringing imperial histories together,
16 while highlighting the actions of some very ordinary men and
17 women. I hope that teaching students about the subject will
18 help me think about my research in a new way."

19 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I would just like to note for the record
20 where his reading diverges from the words on the page, not in
21 any significant way in this case. The document would, I
22 assume, speak for itself.

23 MR. BRILL: I didn't mean to.

24 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I know. That's why I think the reading
25 of the document out loud is a waste and also creates confusion.

1 I didn't object in a timely fashion --

2 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Is there a question?

3 MR. BRILL: Well, my -- I do have a question somewhere.
4 My question is what this particular student says -- this
5 History student says about the relation of his proposed course
6 to his research, how would that compare to other examples of
7 applications for Teaching Scholar positions that you've
8 received?

9 THE WITNESS: I think that if you look at the student
10 answers to that particular question they're almost invariably
11 speak in similar terms about the connection between the
12 teaching of the class and the benefit that they will derive for
13 their research through their preparation of the course to teach
14 the class and in the actual teaching of the class.

15 MR. BRILL: I'm going to move on now. I won't read
16 anything more. They're very interesting proposals, but I'll
17 spare Mr. Meiklejohn and the reader of the record from reading
18 any more of them into the record. But I commend you to read
19 them if you have a chance.

20 CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION

21 BY MR. BRILL:

22 Q So are the graduate students evaluated in the teaching
23 that they do?

24 A The Teaching Scholars you mean?

25 Q Well, I'm sorry, I'm moving on to graduate students who

1 serve more generally as teaching fellows.

2 A Yes.

3 Q Are they evaluated?

4 A The mode of evaluation varies from department to
5 department, meaning that the supervision that they are subject
6 to takes different forms in each department. However, at the
7 end of the course and irrespective of whether a student is TA
8 for a large lecture class or somebody who is teaching fully a
9 section of a class, there is a standard student evaluation that
10 undergraduates are asked to complete, in which they are asked a
11 number of questions about the course.

12 MR. BRILL: I'm going to mark as exhibit 65 a copy of a
13 evaluation -- a course evaluation form.

14 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Off the record for a minute.

15 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken)

16 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Back on the record.

17 MR. BRILL: Maybe less.

18 BY MR. BRILL:

19 Q Is this -- is exhibit 65 the evaluation form that you
20 just described?

21 A Yes, it is.

22 (Employer's E-65 identified)

23 Q And I note that on page three there's a specific page
24 dealing with teaching assistants.

25 A Yes, there is.

1 Q Is that correct?

2 MR. BRILL: I offer exhibit 65.

3 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I'm sorry, where is the --

4 MS. ROTHGEB: Page three.

5 MR. BRILL: Page three of the document.

6 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: What's the --

7 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: We're looking at 65?

8 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Yeah, what's the first --

9 THE WITNESS: I believe the confusion arises from the fact
10 that the section of the TA effectiveness appears at the bottom
11 of the second page and also at the top of the third page.

12 MR. BRILL: Oh, I'm sorry. Right.

13 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: You got it. Okay.

14 THE WITNESS: This is what happens when you print from the
15 web, I guess.

16 MR. BRILL: Oh, okay. This is a print out from a --

17 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Oh, okay.

18 MR. BRILL: -- web document.

19 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: So the -- some portions of this -- a lot
20 of portions of this have been printed twice.

21 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Right.

22 THE WITNESS: That may be the only moment. No, you're
23 right.

24 MR. BRILL: We just wanted to --

25 THE WITNESS: Page one --

1 MR. BRILL: No, I think there's teaching assistant 1 and
2 teaching assistant 2. I think that's why it's --

3 THE WITNESS: But the instructor effectiveness on the
4 first page is repeated at the top of the second page as well.

5 VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION

6 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

7 Q And this form is used for all courses taught at Columbia?

8 A I don't know whether they're used in all of the schools at
9 Columbia. In other words I don't now whether the Law School
10 and the Business School use the same form, but for sure they
11 are used for the evaluation of instruction in all courses in
12 the Arts and Sciences.

13 Q And that's regardless of whether the class is taught by a
14 tenured faculty member, an adjunct or a teaching --

15 A Yes.

16 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: No objections?

17 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Oh, I'm sorry, no objection.

18 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's admitted.

19 (Employer's E-65 received in evidence)

20 CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION

21 BY MR. BRILL:

22 Q Is this the evaluation that you were referring to when you
23 testified previously that evaluations of graduate students
24 would be kept confidential?

25 A The results of the evaluation would be -- would not be

1 made public.

2 Q And -- but this --

3 A This is the form.

4 Q This is the form and --

5 A This is the form, yes.

6 Q -- so -- just so I understand, the results of the
7 evaluation for the instructor faculty member are made public,
8 but not of the teaching --

9 A Not currently. Perhaps I should --

10 Q Okay. Maybe you can explain?

11 A -- backtrack to explain better? This is the current form
12 and there is currently no policy in place to make evaluations
13 public. However, the Educational Planning and Policy Committee
14 has been discussing with the faculty throughout this year
15 moving away from this form to a new form that the faculty and
16 the Committee think will be better at teething out from
17 individuals useful information about what they learn in the
18 class, and what their experience was in the class and so forth.

19 Three years ago there was a discussion in the Senate to --
20 the University Senate to open all student evaluations -- the
21 result of student evaluations and making them public. It was
22 at that time that student representatives lobbied the
23 University Senate to keep those evaluations under cover. In
24 other words that they not be made public, because of the fact
25 that students, being instructors in learn -- in --

1 Q Training.

2 A -- training -- sorry, instructors in training should be
3 protected from the kind of public scrutiny that would result
4 from that. During the discussion to move away from this form
5 to the new form, it was reiterated that evaluations involving
6 graduate students would be kept under cover and would not be
7 made public, just as it had been decided before.

8 Q And what feedback if any is provided to the graduate
9 students, as a result of the evaluations submitted by the
10 students in the class?

11 A All directors of graduate studies or any other officer in
12 the department that supervises the teaching of graduate
13 students has access to the results of these evaluations. And
14 they are discussed with the students, depending on the
15 information that they yield, but they are also used, at the end
16 of every year, when departments evaluate the overall profile
17 and work of students during the year teaching, research, course
18 work and so forth, in order to ascertain whether the student is
19 in fact advancing in terms of his or her acquisition of
20 pedagogical skills.

21 Q Are the -- do faculty also observe typically the graduate
22 students who serve as teaching fellows?

23 A My understanding is that whoever is in charge either of
24 the course -- the particular course of the level, as is the
25 case in the teaching of foreign languages, has scheduled

1 observations that require visits by that particular individual
2 to the various sections in the class. And after which there is
3 a conference with the student and in which the notes and
4 observations that the person has made from that visit are
5 discussed.

6 MR. BRILL: I just have two more documents. Why don't I
7 mark them at the same as 66 and 67? 66 is a document from the
8 GSAS website headed dean's discipline, disciplinary procedures
9 and 67 is a document from the GSAS website entitled grievance
10 procedure.

11 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: So one is 66 and one is 67?

12 MR. BRILL: Yeah. This is 66, this is 67.

13 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Thank you.

14 MR. BRILL: Did I give you 67 yet?

15 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: You didn't give us 67, no.

16 MR. BRILL: Here's 67 --

17 BY MR. BRILL:

18 Q Do you have exhibit 66 and 67 in front of you?

19 A Yes, I do.

20 Q And can you identify them?

21 A The first is a photocopy of a page from the GSAS website
22 on disciplinary procedures and 67 is a page from the same
23 source on grievance policy.

24 (Employer's E-66 & 67 identified)

25 MR. BRILL: So I offer 66 and 67.

1 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: No objection.

2 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: No objections? Or you said
3 objection?

4 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Disappointed? I said no objection.

5 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Oh.

6 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Oh, I thought you looked disappointed.

7 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: They are admitted --

8 (Employer's E-66 & 67 received in evidence)

9 MR. BRILL: Okay.

10 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: -- 66 and 67.

11 BY MR. BRILL:

12 Q So Dean Alonso, looking first at exhibit 66, dean's
13 discipline, this states that it's the process used to
14 investigate and respond to allegations of academic or
15 behavioral misconduct of a graduate student in GSAS. Would
16 this process be used in the event of any allegation of academic
17 or behavioral misconduct by a graduate student serving in the
18 role of a teaching fellow? Would that be something that would
19 be subject to dean's discipline?

20 A Any graduate student is subject to dean's discipline.

21 Q Well, what disciplinary process would apply to, for
22 example, an adjunct faculty member who engaged in some
23 behavioral or academic misconduct in the course of teaching?
24 Would that be dean's discipline?

25 A No, that would be a matter that would be referred to the -

1 - and handled by the office of the Executive Vice President of
2 Arts and Sciences.

3 Q Whereas the same type of conduct by a graduate student
4 would be subject to dean's discipline, is that --

5 A Yes, that is correct. These are parallel processes that -
6 - in the sense that one would apply to graduate students and
7 the other would apply to other types of instructors, such as
8 faculty, lecturers or adjuncts.

9 Q That would be an employee discipline -- an employee
10 disciplinary policy --

11 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Objection.

12 MR. BRILL: What's the objection?

13 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Well --

14 MR. BRILL: I'll withdraw --

15 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Withdraw --

16 MR. BRILL: -- the question.

17 BY MR. BRILL:

18 Q On grievance policy, does -- would this -- how would the
19 grievance policy apply, if at all, to graduate students who
20 serve as teaching fellows or graduate research assistants?

21 A Could you repeat your question, please?

22 Q Yes. The grievance policy, exhibit 67, first of all I
23 want to ask you is this a student grievance policy?

24 A It could be described that way in the sense that it is a
25 policy that can only apply to students.

1 Q If a student had a grievance about something would this be
2 the policy that they would follow?

3 A Yes, it is.

4 Q And would this policy be applicable, for example, if a
5 student had some complaint about anything related to a teaching
6 fellowship or a graduate research assistant appointment?

7 A Yes. If the grievance were against a faculty member, it
8 would automatically be referred to the Executive Vice President
9 of Arts and Sciences. This is mostly an avenue of redress for
10 graduate students, in fact exclusively for graduate students.

11 MR. BRILL: I have no further questions.

12 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Okay. Off the record.

13 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken)

14 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: On the record.

15 CROSS EXAMINATION

16 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

17 Q Dean Alonso, you testified that you hold an appointment in
18 the Department of Latin American and Iberian Culture?

19 A That's correct.

20 Q Can you explain what it means to have an appointment in a
21 department at Columbia?

22 A It means that you have been appointed by the trustees of
23 the University in the ultimate instance to be a member of a
24 unit, in my case the Department of Latin American and Iberian
25 Cultures, to engage in research, and teach and otherwise

1 contribute to knowledge from that particular location, meaning
2 institutional location, Columbia University.

3 Q And those two contributions that you described, teach and
4 contribute to knowledge, those are the ultimate functions of
5 Columbia University?

6 MR. BRILL: I think that's -- objection, misstated his
7 testimony. I think he said to engage --

8 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Teach, I'm sorry, engage in research and
9 contribute to knowledge. Is that the mission of the University?

10 THE WITNESS: Yes.

11 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

12 Q I certainly didn't mean to leave out research. Okay.
13 Now, if you could take a look at exhibit 28?

14 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: 28?

15 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Yes. That was one of his exhibits on the
16 previous --

17 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: No, but it's --

18 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Oh, sorry.

19 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: -- the previous one.

20 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: It wouldn't be there, right.

21 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: He doesn't have --

22 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I don't know, maybe I could do it without
23 the document?

24 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: 28?

25 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Yeah. Alright. I'll wait. I'm sure

1 there will be other documents from previous that I'll need.

2 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: You see 29? Do you want to
3 show him 28 so he can --

4 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Well, I -- oh, it's --

5 MS. ROTHGEB: It's only Adrian. He's not testifying.

6 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Why don't you show him your
7 document?

8 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: The witness or Adrian?

9 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: No, your -- the witness.

10 MS. ROTHGEB: Oh, it has writing on it.

11 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Alright.

12 MS. ROTHGEB: Tom, there's a better copy here.

13 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: It's a got a picture --

14 THE WITNESS: She has a copy over there.

15 MR. BRILL: We probably have a clean copy too somewhere.

16 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Sorry.

17 THE WITNESS: You want this back?

18 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Yeah --

19 THE WITNESS: Okay.

20 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Off the record.

21 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken)

22 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: On the record.

23 Okay, Mr. Meiklejohn.

24 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Do you have Employer exhibit 28 in front
25 of you?

1 THE WITNESS: Yes.

2 CONTINUED CROSS EXAMINATION

3 By MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

4 Q And I probably could have done this without the exhibit.
5 I apologize. But the -- as this document indicates, the GSAS
6 requires one year of instructional -- or teaching to be
7 completed during the first four years of the PhD -- the time in
8 the PhD program, correct?

9 A That's correct.

10 Q And we've seen a number of documents relating to
11 fellowship programs from -- at least from the Humanities and
12 Social Sciences where -- and I think this is the case, would
13 you agree, that the normal course for someone who is awarded a
14 dean's fellowship, is that they would be involved in three
15 years or they would be required to teach -- to participate in
16 teaching for three years, correct?

17 A The GSAS teaching requirement is one year. Departments
18 set any additional requirements they may have for teaching,
19 which can add up to three years, yes.

20 Q But in order to receive a dean's fellow one must perform -
21 - for -- under the typical dean's fellowship in most
22 departments one gets an award of five years of tuition
23 remission --

24 A Stipend.

25 Q -- stipend and some other benefit?

1 A Fees.

2 Q Yes. And typically the student is not required to perform
3 any services in the first year or in the fifth year, correct?

4 A That is correct.

5 Q And the student is required to perform services in the
6 second, third and fourth year, correct?

7 A If the department determines that the student should teach
8 in years three and four let's say. In other words, we have a
9 requirement of one year and then departments have a requirement
10 that can last no more than two years.

11 Q The most that you can require as a condition of graduation
12 is two years?

13 A No. The most that a department can require from its
14 students, as part of their teaching requirements, is two years,
15 which added to the first year of teaching, which typically
16 occurs in the second year, will add up to three years.

17 Q Okay. The purpose of -- you testified to this. It struck
18 me. The purpose of an undergraduate education you testified is
19 to transmit knowledge to an audience I think is the phrase you
20 used --

21 A No, I said to transmit received knowledge.

22 Q Okay. To the undergraduate students --

23 A Yes.

24 Q -- correct? And why are you so careful to include the
25 word received?

1 A Because it's accurate.

2 Q What does it mean in that context?

3 A I wanted to make a distinction between what happens at the
4 undergraduate level, which is essentially the transmission of
5 knowledge that is already established as correct and valuable,
6 as opposed to the creation of new knowledge, which is what
7 distinguishes graduate education in general.

8 Q Now, in the context of undergraduate education TAs
9 participate in the transmission of received knowledge to the
10 undergraduate students, correct?

11 A Correct.

12 Q And preceptors participate in the transmission of
13 knowledge to undergraduate students?

14 A Yes.

15 Q And teaching fellows participate in the transmission of
16 knowledge to -- of received knowledge to undergraduate
17 students?

18 A Yes.

19 Q Did I ask you if teaching fellows participate in that?

20 MR. BRILL: Yeah, you did.

21 THE WITNESS: Yes, you did.

22 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

23 Q Okay, good for me. You offered some testimony about an
24 organization called the AAU, which consists of 60 or 65 select
25 research institutions?

1 A Yes.

2 Q Is University of Oregon one of those institutions?

3 A I wouldn't be able to tell you without looking at the
4 roster of members of the AAU.

5 Q You testified University of Michigan is?

6 A Yes.

7 Q Do you know if university of -- Rutgers University --

8 A I would not be able to answer that question without
9 looking at the roster of the AAU.

10 Q How about NYU? Do you know that NYU was included?

11 A Yes.

12 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Could the -- do we have the exhibits
13 handy from the previous testimony?

14 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: What number?

15 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: 32.

16 MR. BRILL: Are you through with --

17 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Employer 32.

18 MR. BRILL: I'm sorry, are you through with 29? Can we
19 get that back?

20 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: 28.

21 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: 28.

22 THE WITNESS: 28.

23 MR. BRILL: 28.

24 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: 28, yes.

25 MR. BRILL: Can we get that back?

1 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: But do you have number 30 --

2 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Two.

3 MR. BRILL: Thank you.

4 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Thank you.

5 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Oh, right.

6 MR. BRILL: 32 is the AAU document.

7 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: That is the AAU document, yes. It
8 doesn't tell whether --

9 MS. ROTHGEB: It's not one from today.

10 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: I know. But he might have
11 given it to him earlier. 28 is there too? He has it in front
12 of him.

13 CONTINUED CROSS EXAMINATION

14 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

15 Q I would like -- why don't you -- are you looking at the
16 blown up version?

17 A I am looking at exhibit 32.

18 Q Okay. Well, there's --

19 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: It's the same thing, but --

20 MS. ROTHGEB: The last three pages.

21 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: -- it's bigger.

22 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: The last three pages are in larger type -

23 -

24 THE WITNESS: Yes.

25 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: -- and are essentially the same thing,

1 but easier to read. And near the bottom of the second to last
2 page, there's a description of research assistants.

3 THE WITNESS: Yes.

4 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

5 Q Or research assistantships, which is a fund -- in the
6 context of this document it refers to a funded position,
7 correct?

8 A Yes.

9 Q And it states that the advantage of this type of support
10 for students is that it insures the focused interest of the
11 faculty advisor in the student's research and provides supplies
12 and equipment. Why does funding the research in this fashion
13 or how does it insure the focused interest of the faculty
14 advisor?

15 A Because what the paragraph that you have cited is
16 describing is the typical situation for a graduate research
17 assistant in the sciences who works in the laboratory context
18 that we were discussing previously, in which the student's
19 research is occurring in that context that is defined by the
20 overarching research interests of the faculty member who runs
21 the lab in question. It's interesting that you should bring
22 this up, because the Graduate School instituted a requirement
23 from departments that they run thesis workshops in which
24 students who were advanced students or working their
25 dissertations would have to present their work to faculty and

1 peers. And our attempt in putting that in place was to
2 duplicate precisely the kind of attention and investment that
3 the laboratory situation makes possible for individual graduate
4 students so that they have a context and a need to keep that
5 context informed of the way in which they are advancing in
6 their work and so forth.

7 Q Okay. I'm not sure -- probably my question wasn't clear,
8 but how does the funding insure that faculty member's attention
9 or focused interest?

10 A Because the faculty member received a grant to do a
11 certain work and that focuses attention.

12 Q So because there's a grant that in part covers the work
13 being done by the student and that work is of interest to the
14 faculty member, then the fact that the student is being paid to
15 do that work insures the faculty member will be interested in
16 what the student is doing? Is that --

17 MR. BRILL: I'm going to object to --

18 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: -- accurate?

19 MR. BRILL: -- the -- I'm sorry, you didn't finish the
20 question.

21 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I said is that accurate? It has to be
22 the end of the question.

23 MR. BRILL: There was so many assumptions built into that
24 question, including the student was being paid for the work,
25 which I think is not what the testimony was.

1 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Can you just rephrase that?

2 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Probably. Certainly can't repeat it. So
3 thank --

4 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: And one question at a --

5 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: -- you for not asking me that.

6 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: One question at --

7 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Okay.

8 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: -- a time.

9 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: So the faculty member gets a grant from
10 usually the federal government, NSF or NIH, correct?

11 THE WITNESS: Uh-huh.

12 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Yes?

13 THE WITNESS: Yes.

14 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

15 Q And the grant -- the -- in order to get the grant, the
16 faculty member has to fill out an application form with lots of
17 information explaining to the federal government what the
18 research is going to be and why the world will be a better
19 place if this research is done, correct?

20 A Yes.

21 Q And included in that application is a description of the
22 work that different people working on the project will perform,
23 correct?

24 A Yes.

25 Q And that would include if he hires any post doctoral

1 fellows to work on the research? That would be set forth in
2 the grant proposal, correct?

3 A I don't know if it would get to that level of specificity.
4 In other words, it would depend on how the principal
5 investigator wants to use the funds that are available to him
6 or her to secure the help of other personnel.

7 Q But in any event the grant proposal would contain a budget
8 to -- for compensation to people who work on the project?

9 A Yes.

10 Q And that would include any PhD students who work on the
11 project as well?

12 A That is correct.

13 Q And the grant would have -- if the grant is awarded, one
14 of the conditions of the award is that the work that be -- that
15 is done on the grant be consistent with the proposal?

16 A Yes, it is.

17 Q And so if the -- if a graduate student who -- if a
18 graduate student is working on this project he would be
19 considered a research fellow, correct, or a research assistant?

20 A Graduate research assistant, yes.

21 Q Okay. And the stipend paid to the graduate research
22 assistant would come out of the grant money provided for that
23 project?

24 A Yes, that would be the source of the funding.

25 Q And the -- as a condition of getting the money, the

1 government would require that that -- the work done by that
2 graduate research assistant be of a nature to fulfill the
3 requirements of the grant, correct?

4 A Yes, but with a qualification that the student is also
5 supposed to be fulfilling the requirements of advancing to the
6 degree that are stipulated by the Graduate School of Arts and
7 Sciences and by the department.

8 Q But the -- so what you're saying is that the services or
9 the functions performed by the graduate research assistant must
10 both fulfill the conditions -- the research project described
11 by the faculty member and must also serve an educational
12 purpose?

13 A Must allow a student to define and carry out a research
14 project that will result in work that can be presented for
15 defense as a dissertation.

16 Q Is that true with all federal grants, that the grants
17 require that the work be related to the dissertation?

18 A This is not a requirement of the grant.

19 Q Okay. So the grant would require that the work be related
20 to the faculty member's grant proposal, correct?

21 A That's correct.

22 Q For which the faculty member has gotten funding?

23 A Yes.

24 Q And some of that funding goes to the University to cover
25 the overhead of the University?

1 A It's called ICR, indirect cost recovery, yes.

2 Q The -- getting back to exhibit 32 now, the faculty member
3 has an interest in receiving the grant money, correct?

4 A Very much so.

5 Q Yeah. And he has an interest in seeing that the
6 conditions of the grant are fulfilled? In fact he's obligated
7 to see that that happens, correct?

8 A Absolutely.

9 Q And so is that the way in which this financial -- is that
10 why this financial support insures the focused interest of the
11 faculty member in the research being done by the student?

12 A I think that you are reducing to economic terms, economic
13 self interest or economic motives a relationship that occurs
14 throughout the University, in the sense that mentors have an
15 enormous interest in the advancement and forming of their
16 students. And I would not say that that relationship obtains
17 here exclusively on the basis of a contractual relationship
18 with the funding source. I think that this is a relationship
19 that is more generalizable to the relationship between a
20 student who is being supervised and trained by a faculty member
21 irrespective of field.

22 Q I don't mean to suggest that the relationship between the
23 mentor and the student is exclusively an economic one, but --
24 well, let's just -- does this paragraph accurately describe the
25 -- an advantage of the -- of a research assistantship to

1 Columbia University?

2 A Yes, but not exclusively in a case of a research
3 assistantship.

4 Q It's not the only benefit to the University of a research
5 assistantship?

6 A I think your question was whether --

7 Q I'll withdraw that last question.

8 A Yes.

9 Q It's not going to be productive for you to go back and
10 figure out what my other questions were. You testified that
11 PhD students are encouraged to attend colloquia and
12 presentations by outside speakers?

13 A Yes.

14 Q Do full time, tenured track faculty members also attend
15 those colloquia and listen to those speakers?

16 A Yes, they do.

17 Q And why do they attend those functions?

18 A Because I think these are the sort you are describing are
19 part of the intellectual life of an academic department.
20 Having people come from the outside, having conferences on
21 given topics and adding outside interlocutors to the ongoing
22 conversation of the department ends up being a very fruitful
23 activity for everybody, because it means that the department's
24 conversation is enriched.

25 Q So to boil that down a little bit, the faculty members

1 increase their knowledge from participating in these functions
2 as well?

3 A It's perhaps a little bit inaccurate to say that it
4 increases their knowledge. I've gone to enough bad lectures to
5 know that that is not the case. But what it does do is expose
6 the department, which tends to be a fairly insular context, to
7 new ideas, new possibilities. Sometimes critiquing new ideas
8 and possibilities is itself a way of learning.

9 Q Yeah. I'm not saying that every colloquium is a good one.
10 Okay. You testified that 67% -- you had done some kind of
11 research or outreach a few years ago to find out what
12 percentage of PhD awardees, graduates, were involved in
13 teaching after graduation. Well, do you remember the 67%
14 figure?

15 A Yes, what I said was that that's 67% of PhD graduates in a
16 five year period -- in other words in the five years previous
17 to the request to departments that they tell us the whereabouts
18 to their students, were in an academic context in some function
19 or another.

20 Q And does that include graduates who were working as
21 adjuncts in that five year period?

22 A If the information we received from departments listed an
23 academic institution, that person was counted in that 67%,
24 irrespective of the title or rank of the person involved.

25 Q So you wouldn't know what percentage attained tenured

1 track positions?

2 A No.

3 Q It would presumably be lower than 67%?

4 A Presumably.

5 Q Could be substantially lower?

6 A Don't know.

7 Q You testified that stipends increased 3.75% this past
8 year?

9 A For next year.

10 Q For next year. Is that a larger increase than normal?

11 A It has varied from year to year since I have been dean.

12 Q What is the range of that variation?

13 A Well, there was a year -- there were two years in which
14 the stipend did not go up above 3%, because it was at that time
15 that the Graduate School assumed the responsibility for paying
16 the facility's fees that up until that moment graduate students
17 were paying out of pocket. And therefore we decided to give
18 them, in fees, what would have gone into stipend. But after
19 that increases have been in the three to four percent range.

20 Q Now, the current stipend rate for Humanities and natural -
21 - Humanities and Social Sciences, what was the rate?

22 A It's in the letter. 25,336.

23 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: A letter which --

24 MR. BRILL: Which document? Do you --

25 THE WITNESS: Which is, I'm sorry, exhibit number 36.

1 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Okay. I had asked --

2 MS. ROTHGEB: Adrian --

3 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Oh, okay.

4 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

5 Q Now, during a period in which a graduate student, a PhD
6 student is serving as a --

7 A Teaching fellow.

8 Q -- teaching -- okay, teaching fellow. That's right. In a
9 teaching position, one third of their stipend is paid in the
10 form of a salary and two-thirds is an untaxed or un -- as a
11 single payment without withholding, correct?

12 MR. BRILL: Well, I'm sorry, I have to object, because
13 there's been no testimony about withholding and there's no
14 withholding from any part of this I don't believe. I don't
15 know, but there's been no testimony about withholding.

16 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I thought there had, but do you know --

17 MR. BRILL: Maybe I'm wrong.

18 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: So -- well, maybe. Alright. So one
19 third is paid as subject to W-2 reporting, correct?

20 THE WITNESS: Yes.

21 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

22 Q Do you know whether there's tax withholding of federal
23 income tax from that one third?

24 A I believe all income is subject to withholding, but I am
25 not the authority --

1 Q Okay.

2 A -- on that.

3 Q So the -- of the 25,000 plus stipend -- total stipend for
4 the year, if someone is in the teaching function for -- well,
5 they would receive half of that each year or each semester,
6 correct?

7 A Yes.

8 Q Which would be something on an order of \$12,700, roughly?

9 A Roughly.

10 Q Okay. So a third of that would be about 4,000 and a
11 couple hundred?

12 A Yes.

13 Q So that's the amount they're paid as a salary subject
14 reported on a W-2 for teaching?

15 A Yes.

16 Q Now, you testified that it would cost \$8,000 less than
17 what you pay a graduate assistant to hire an adjunct to perform
18 those functions?

19 A Yes, that is correct.

20 Q So how much would it cost to hire an adjunct to perform
21 those functions?

22 A The going rate is \$5,000 to which you have to add the
23 fringe of 32-33%.

24 Q So that's \$6,500 plus or minus? Little more than that.

25 A The total you mean?

1 Q The total is \$6,500?

2 A Yes.

3 Q Which is 2,000 and change more than the portion you're
4 paying to a student as salary, correct? I'll withdraw --

5 A But I think --

6 Q -- the question.

7 A No, no, no. But the --

8 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Well, he withdrew the
9 question.

10 THE WITNESS: You withdrew --

11 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: That's per course? The
12 adjunct?

13 THE WITNESS: \$5,000 per course, yes.

14 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

15 Q This may not be -- this may have come out later in your
16 testimony, but you described a typical five year funding
17 package for most departments. And PhD students often take
18 longer than five years to complete their studies, correct?

19 A Yes.

20 Q How or if -- what is the -- is there a customary practice
21 for funding them after the fifth year?

22 A After the five years of guaranteed funding that a student
23 receives in their offer letter, we allow departments to offer
24 them teaching positions as long as the department can prove
25 that they have instructional needs that would be covered by

1 offering those teaching positions to students who are outside
2 their funding years. This is one of the ways in which we
3 provide financial aid to students beyond the guaranteed support
4 that they were offered in their admission letter.

5 Q And what compensation do they get for fulfilling those
6 teaching positions?

7 A It's exactly the same stipend, tuition, fees that a
8 student in years one through five would receive.

9 Q A student -- PhD students are expected to, at some point,
10 apply for a external funding to cover their dissertation
11 fellowship period?

12 A They are expected to do it. It's not a requirement. In
13 other words we do not keep track of whether students have or
14 have not applied for outside funding.

15 Q The University encourages them to do so, is that a fair --

16 A The Graduate School encourages them to do it.

17 Q Why does the graduate student -- the Graduate School
18 encourage them to do that?

19 A Departments and the Graduate School both encourage
20 students to get outside funding, because A, it's an opportunity
21 to learn the rhetoric and the format of writing an application
22 for a grant, from whichever source is relevant to the student.
23 But also because we allow students to bank their support --
24 their guaranteed support and extend it beyond the fifth year.

25 Q SO this would be another way of paying for that often --

1 that sixth year?

2 A Except that it would depend on the choice the student made
3 at the time of receiving the grant. I don't know if you have
4 seen that they have an option to be topped off or to bank their
5 year as a supplementary year to the five year funding package.
6 Depending on the decision that they make at that particular
7 point, it either results in more funds received in the year of
8 the grant or in an extra year of support after the fifth year.

9 Q So if they choose to bank the fellowship -- the dean's
10 fellowship money is what they would be banking then, right?

11 A No, it's not the dean's fellowship. The dean's fellowship
12 is what students receive upon admission to the Graduate School.
13 The fifth year fellowship that you're referring to is the
14 dissertation writing fellowship.

15 Q And every -- that's included in the standard --

16 A Yes.

17 Q -- package, but if they get outside funding they can use
18 that in the third or the fourth year and bank -- what is it
19 that they're banking at that point?

20 A They're banking support for a supplemental --

21 Q For the sixth year?

22 A -- year, yes.

23 Q And in that sixth year then -- so if you get the -- if
24 they get the outside funding in the third year, the outside
25 funding would provide that they don't have to perform any

1 teaching or research functions to get the money, correct?

2 A Yes. In some instances, yeah.

3 Q Okay. If they choose to bank the -- can they -- could
4 they then bank that third year money and use it in the sixth
5 year or would they go in the third year not performing any
6 teaching functions and then go back to teaching in the sixth
7 year? Do you understand my question?

8 A I believe I do. A student could decide to take a
9 fellowship, and not have any teaching obligations and that
10 would be the -- their holding of the fellowship. They could
11 decide instead to teach, receive a supplement to the outside
12 fellowship, which is \$6,000. And then they would bank the
13 opportunity of having a further year beyond year five, in which
14 they would not have to teach.

15 Q Okay. I think that was more clear than my question
16 anyway. Core -- I may have --

17 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Could the witness be shown Employer 40?
18 And I ask you to start by turning to the second page.

19 THE WITNESS: Yes.

20 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

21 Q And I'll start with the fourth bullet point teaching
22 fellows must demonstrate proficiency in English.

23 MR. BRILL: Well, actually that's not exactly what it
24 says, if we're going to read documents correctly.

25 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I -- yes, I was not intending that to be

1 quoting it directly, but I suppose. It is true, is it --
2 drawing your attention to paragraph four, bullet point four,
3 I'll ask you is it in fact the case that teaching fellows are
4 required to demonstrate proficiency in English?

5 THE WITNESS: That is correct.

6 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

7 Q And that's because they could not teach effectively and
8 serve the needs of the undergraduates if they were not able to
9 communicate effectively in English, correct?

10 A Yes.

11 Q Okay. Teaching -- bullet point five, teaching fellows
12 must have demonstrated competency in the subject to be taught?

13 A Yes.

14 Q And again, they would not be able to teach the subject
15 effectively if they were not competent in the subject
16 themselves, correct?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Bullet point seven states that insofar as possible,
19 teaching fellows should be offered a range of teaching
20 responsibilities, in a manner that benefits them. What factors
21 would constrain the possibility or limit the possibility of
22 doing so?

23 A I can't imagine how to answer that question. Could you --

24 Q Well, for example --

25 A -- be more specific?

1 Q -- if there were not -- if there wasn't sufficient demand
2 in a class that would be appropriate for the graduate student's
3 education then he couldn't be assigned to teach a class without
4 any students, right?

5 A I suppose that is a case.

6 Q I mean is the needs of the faculty of Arts and Sciences
7 and the students to be taught one of the factors that
8 constrains the possibility of fulfilling this requirement?

9 A But the -- this is not a requirement. This is a statement
10 of good practices, meaning that teaching fellows should be
11 offered or enter teaching responsibilities with increasing
12 independence and student contact to gradually prepare them for
13 independent teaching. I don't know what the limiting phrase
14 there is necessarily referring to. I would imagine that it
15 addresses the particular needs and assignments of every given
16 department.

17 Q Could you turn to page 18? You test -- I'm sorry. The
18 next page, page --

19 A Yes.

20 Q -- three and bullet point 18. You offered some testimony
21 regarding the support offered to PhD students to improve their
22 teaching.

23 A Could you repeat the question?

24 Q Well, actually I haven't gotten to the question.

25 A Oh.

1 Q Have you reviewed paragraph -- bullet point 18?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And you testified -- do you recall testifying about the
4 support given to graduate students who struggle with their
5 teaching?

6 A Yes.

7 Q And then the last sentence says that if a student fails to
8 meet these requirements he or she may be considered no longer
9 to be in good administrative standing. What are the
10 consequences -- well first, what are the consequences of not
11 being in good administrative standing?

12 A I would have to go back to the document that described
13 administrative standing.

14 MR. BRILL: I think that's exhibit 52.

15 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Yep. What was the question
16 again?

17 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: What are the -- it's a test to see if I
18 remember?

19 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: I'm just trying --

20 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: What are the consequences of failing to
21 be in good administrative standing? And the witness -- let the
22 -- may the record reflect that the witness has been shown
23 Employer exhibit 52.

24 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: The witness --

25 THE WITNESS: It states in exhibit 52 that the

1 consequences of failing to make academic progress or adhere to
2 applicable administrative policies and procedures may include
3 academic or administrative warning, probation, suspension or
4 dismissal.

5 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

6 Q Take for example you have a teaching assistant or teaching
7 fellow who was late in completing or grading homework
8 assignments, what would be the proper procedure for dealing
9 with that individual?

10 A This would be dealt with at the departmental level,
11 meaning that whoever is responsible for the supervision of that
12 student would -- as it says in the guidelines for graduate
13 student teaching, would enter into an advising situation with
14 the student, in order to address the deficiencies identified.

15 Q And what about a student who failed to show up for an
16 assigned teaching functions?

17 A It's exactly the same way.

18 Q And if, in the opinion of the supervising faculty member,
19 this individual failed to improve then he or she could be
20 dismissed, not only from the teaching function but from the
21 school, is that correct?

22 A No. I think you're collapsing a distinction that I tried
23 to make earlier in my testimony, in which I tried to establish
24 a difference between having difficulties teaching and the
25 dereliction of duty. In other words I believe that item 18 --

1 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: In what exhibit?

2 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry. I will find it.

3 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Let the record reflect the
4 witness is referring to Employee (*sic*) exhibit 40.

5 THE WITNESS: Item 18 in exhibit 40. When that item
6 describes the interaction between whoever has identified the
7 concern -- the faculty member or the supervisor that has
8 identified the concern and the student, what that item is
9 referring to is the failure of the student to engage in that
10 process of addressing the deficiencies and the difficulties.
11 That's the kind of behavior that may result in loss of good
12 administrative standing, in the sense that there is a
13 distinction to be made between the difficulties a student may
14 have in the classroom, the willingness to address them and to
15 engage in a process that will yield better performance in the
16 classroom and not wanting to engage in that process or
17 dereliction of duty, in the way in which you are describing, in
18 which somebody stops meeting class, or does not finish their
19 grading for a course or is late in handing in grades and so
20 forth.

21 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

22 Q And what are the consequences of the dereliction or
23 failure to fulfill the expectations or requirements --

24 A That --

25 Q -- deliberately? What?

1 A That would result in a request or a notification to the
2 Graduate School about this behavior, which would more likely
3 than not result in a loss of administrative good standing.

4 Q And would that type of conduct I've described, dereliction
5 of teaching responsibilities, would that be a basis for --
6 well, strike that. You said that if that situation arose the
7 dean's office would be notified? GS -- Dean of GSAS, is that -
8 -

9 A If such a situation went unchecked and uncorrected, it
10 would be notified to the office of the Dean and might result in
11 loss of good administrative standing.

12 Q And the consequences of lost good administrative standing
13 could mean not only termination from teaching the class, but
14 termination from the PhD program as well, is that correct?

15 A Presumably, yes.

16 Q And would that also be a basis -- would this type of
17 conduct be the basis for discipline under Employer exhibit 66,
18 which is the dean's discipline process?

19 A Employer --

20 Q It's the one with the picture of the --

21 A No.

22 Q Okay. Would that --

23 A For the dean's discipline to be activated there has to be
24 a complainant. There has to be somebody who accuses somebody
25 of behavior that is not consistent with the standards and

1 policies of the -- the expectations of the Graduate School.

2 Q In a case of -- well, one of the -- on the second page it
3 indicates that one of the grounds for discipline would be
4 failing to perform in a responsible manner pedagogical
5 requirements. The last bullet point under behavioral
6 violations.

7 A Yes, it does.

8 Q So if the supervising faculty member felt that the
9 individual -- the TA or -- was not -- or whatever, was not
10 fulfilling the requirements of the job, would he or she then be
11 the complainant, file a complaint with the dean's office, or
12 would that be a different process?

13 A I think that the process to be followed in that case would
14 be the one that we were speaking about previously, which was
15 the request from the Graduate School that the student lose good
16 academic standing.

17 Q Good academic or administrative?

18 A I'm sorry, administrative standing.

19 Q And that would be processed through the dean's office?

20 A It is administered by the dean's office.

21 Q Okay. I'm going to show you a document that I'd like
22 marked --

23 MS. ROTHGEB: 16.

24 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: We're only up to 16? Boy, we're falling
25 way behind.

1 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Do you have it?

2 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry?

3 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I'm sorry. I guess I should ask does
4 that same procedure apply to the --

5 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Hold on for a second. Off the
6 record.

7 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken)

8 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: On the record.

9 Mr. Meiklejohn has just handed the witness a document
10 which has been marked as Petitioner's 20 for identification.
11 Go ahead.

12 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: I guess I should clarify. Does the --
13 GSAS is the awarding institution for the Fu Foundation -- Fu
14 School as well, correct?

15 THE WITNESS: Not --

16 BY MR. MEIKLEJOHN:

17 Q For PhDs?

18 A The Graduate School of Arts and Sciences awards the PhD
19 degree statutorily. In other words we are the office that
20 awards the degrees, but students are subject to the rules and
21 policies of their individual schools.

22 Q So the procedure you applied wouldn't apply to the Fu
23 Foundation PhD student?

24 A It may if the procedures of the Graduate School of Arts
25 and Sciences and those of the Engineering School were

1 identical, but I don't know whether they are identical or
2 completely different.

3 Q Well, I'll ask you if you recognize this as the type of
4 letter that is delivered to students who fall out of good
5 administrative standing for dereliction?

6 A I would not be able to answer that question.

7 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Okay. Well, we'll reserve --

8 MR. BRILL: I would say the answer to the question was n.
9 Meaning either --

10 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Well, he --

11 MR. BRILL: -- you recognize it or you don't recognize it.

12 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Let's not testify for the
13 witness. He said he doesn't know.

14 MR. MEIKLEJOHN: Okay. We'll have to introduce it through
15 somebody else.

16 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: Exactly. So it's not
17 admitted. It's just Petitioner's 20 for identification. Off
18 the record.

19 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken)

20 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: On the record.

21 We will close the record for today and we will return on
22 Monday April --

23 MR. BRILL: 27th at 9:30.

24 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: -- 27th at 9:30. And Dean
25 Alonso, we'll figure out when you will come back. Or you're

1 coming back --

2 THE WITNESS: On Tuesday.

3 HEARING OFFICER EVEILLARD: -- on Tuesday. Right, yeah.

4 So we're adjourned for today.

5 (Whereupon, at 4:36 p.m. the hearing in the above-entitled
6 matter was adjourned, to reconvene on Monday, April 27, 2015 at
7 9:30 a.m.)

C E R T I F I C A T E

This is to certify that the attached proceedings done before
the NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONS BOARD REGION TWO

In the Matter of:

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY,

Employer,

And

GRADUATE WORKERS OF COLUMBIA GWC, UAW,

Petitioner.

Case No.: 02-RC-143012

Date: April 24, 2015

Place: New York, NY

Were held as therein appears, and that this is the original
transcript thereof for the files of the Board

Official Reporter

BURKE COURT REPORTING, LLC
1044 Route 23 North, Suite 206
Wayne, New Jersey 07470
(973) 692-0660